

CHAPTER IV

FINDING AND DISCUSSION

A. FINDING

This research was conducted at English Department of Tarbiyah and Teachers' Training Faculty of Antasari State Institute for Islamic Studies located on Jl. A. Yani Km. 4, 5 Banjarmasin where the subject of this research are teachers and students of Academic Writing Class at English Department of Antasari State Institute for Islamic Studies Banjarmasin. The object of this research is teachers' feedbacks and the students' responses on the teachers' feedbacks on Academic Writing Class in the sixth semester at English Department of Antasari State Institute for Islamic Studies Banjarmasin. This research aims to investigate types of teachers' feedbacks and students' responses on teachers' feedbacks. This chapter presents the finding of data that is collected from the documentary, questionnaire and interview. This chapter also provides the discussion of the finding.

1. Types of Teachers' Feedbacks on Students' Writing on Academic Writing Class of the Sixth Semester at English Department of Antasari State Institute for Islamic Studies Banjarmasin

Researcher applied documentary and interview to get types of teachers' feedbacks on students' writing for each teacher writing actually in teaching Academic Writing. There are five classes- A, B, C, D and E of academic writing classes which are taught by three teachers' writing. There are three teachers as the subject of this problem. They are teacher A, B and C.

As stated in Chapter II, feedback classification of this study was adapted from Hyland and Hyland's classification scheme. There are three types of feedback; praise, criticism, and suggestion. These are added up from the other theory that corrective feedback is also a type of feedback. The detail of types of teachers' feedbacks on students' writing for each teacher writing actually in teaching Academic Writing of the sixth semester at English Department of Antasari State Institute for Islamic Studies Banjarmasin can be seen from these following description.

a. Teacher A

The first data was collecting for types of teachers' feedbacks was done on projects of students' works who are taught by teacher "A". Students' writing was under topic of abstract, paraphrasing and summarizing. There are 19 students' drafts for group work. There is no individual work. In some students' drafts, researcher finds more than one types of feedbacks. Based on the project of students' work on the data collection result in the following types of feedbacks. There are five feedbacks of praise category, fourteen feedbacks of criticism category and four feedbacks of suggestion category. The types of feedbacks results from project of students' work shows below:

Table 4.1 Teacher A's Feedbacks in Praise Category

No	Praises
1	It is quite good.
2	Good abstract.
3	I think this abstract is good enough because of the language used and content.
4	This is a very good abstract because of the sentence, the content and the technique of writing.
5	Good

Those praises are (1) it is quite good, (2) good abstract, (3) I think this abstract is good enough because of the language used and content, (4) this is a very good abstract because of the sentence, the content and the technique of writing, and (5) good. The praises are used to motivate and to reward students for their performance in writing. The praises can be said as non-specific positive feedback because there is no specific information about the students' writing performance such as (1) it is quite good, (2) good abstract, and (3) good. The teacher "A" also used specific positive feedback such as (1) I think this abstract is good enough because of the language used and content, and (2) this is a very good abstract because of the sentence, the content and the technique of writing.

Table 4. 2 Teacher A's Feedbacks in Criticism Category

No	Criticisms
1	Your abstract is good but not keywords!
2	Your abstract is too long. Write the point not in details. There is no keywords too.
3	This is a good abstract but unclear of some words you write like they.
4	Second to the fifth paragraph are not clear because of the structure you applied.
5	Good abstract through few mistakes (grammar)
6	Too long abstract and no keywords.
7	You means woman should work outside. Exactly the writer doesn't agree woman work outside home.
8	What are your reasons?
9	What is the title?
10	Do you agree or not?
11	Second and third?
12	You disagree but not relevant to your reason.
13	Other reason?
14	Who write? Take in your synthesizing.

Those criticisms are (1) your abstract is good but not keywords!, (2) your abstract is too long. Write the point not in details. There is no keywords too, (3) this is a good abstract but unclear of some words you write like they, (4) second to the

fifth paragraph are not clear because of the structure you applied, (5) good abstract through few mistakes (grammar), (6) too long abstract and no keywords, (7) you means woman should work outside. Exactly the writer doesn't agree woman work outside home, (8) what are your reason?, (9) what is the title?, (10) do you agree or not?, (11) second and third?, (12) you disagree but not relevant to your reason, (13) other reason?, and (14) who write? Take in your synthesizing. The criticisms are negative comment used by teacher in expressing his dissatisfaction with students' text. Teacher "A" used question that should be answered by students such as (1) what are your reasons?, (2) what is the title?, (3) do you agree or not?, (4) second and third?, (5) other reason?, and (6) who write? Take in your synthesizing. However, he also used contractive criticism where it containing specific information about what the students do in the next writing such as (1) your abstract is good but not keywords!, (2) your abstract is too long. Write the point not in details. There is no keywords too, (3) this is a good abstract but unclear of some words you write like they, (4) second to the fifth paragraph are not clear because of the structure you applied, (5) good abstract through few mistakes (grammar), (6) too long abstract and no keywords, and (7) you means woman should work outside. Exactly the writer doesn't agree woman work outside home.

Table 4. 3 Teacher A's Feedbacks in Suggestion Category

No	Suggestions
1	You should write keywords in abstract.
2	Write into one paragraph only.
3	Make summarize first and then find reasons.
4	You should be agree with him because he refused woman work outside.

Those suggestions are (1) you should write keywords in abstract, (2) write into one paragraph only, (3) make summarize first and then find reasons, and (4) you should be agree with him because he refused woman work outside. Those suggestions include positive comments for improvement and clear and achievable actions for writers. All of the suggestions about content or ideas.

Table 4. 4 Teachers A’s Feedbacks in Corrective Category

No	Students’ Tasks	Correct Answer
1	In “The Correction”, the character <u>are</u> excellently drawn, brimming with humanity and realism, but...	are = is
2	Ideas about American culture and society, about the place that <u>we</u> take in...	we = they
3	...self-consciousness have become concentric to <u>our</u> lives and limited <u>us</u> in profound...	our = their us = them
4	<u>A</u> student(s) need to help special skills.	A students = a student/ students
5	...since promotes communication and understanding <u>between</u> strangers.	between = among
6	He should either let the South form <u>it’s</u> own notion.	it’s = its
7	...ultimately his goal was achieved though it <u>coast</u> him his life.	coast = coasted
8	There are two types of translations; overt and covert translation, <u>↓</u> are the result of different strategies of re-contextualization.	↓ = add subject “they”
9	To undergraduate students with limited time, <u>it</u> should consider the following: once basic mastery...	it = they
10	The student’s problem <u>↓</u> mainly because of...	↓ = add to be “is”

Another category of feedback is corrective feedback. This category only focuses on language errors by giving circle the errors with the correct answer and

without the correct answer. The most comment is about the using of to be for singular and plural, tenses, possessive pronoun and preposition.

Overall, it is known that criticism is most feedback that uses for comment and followed by corrective, praise and suggestion. Those types of feedbacks are found by researcher on final drafts of students.

Besides, researcher also did interview with the teacher “A” on 15th of June, 2016 to know the feedback practice and her opinion about it. The interview result shows that the teacher “A” used feedback in written form which focus on language such as grammar, word choice, and coherence. He believed that a good content or idea of the text is shown by a good sentence and grammar. He also added that feedback in written form is very important because it can be seen by students. For type of feedback, he used suggestion and corrective feedback by providing red ink, underline, circle, question mark, and so on, but he never used symbols for correcting the students’ error.

b. Teacher B

The data was collecting for types of teachers’ feedbacks was done on project of students’ work who are taught by teacher “B”. Students’ writing was under topic of journal review. There are 25 students’ drafts for individual work. In some students’ drafts, researcher finds more than one types of feedbacks. Based on the project of students’ work on the data collection result in the following types of feedbacks. There are sixteen feedbacks of criticism category and twenty three feedbacks of suggestion category. There is no feedback in praise category. The result of types of feedbacks from project of students’ work shows below:

Table 4. 5 Teacher B's Feedbacks in Criticism Category

No	Criticisms
1	Your summary is too wordy.
2	You use too many exact words as the source.
3	It's too confusing. Re-arrange your sentence.
4	Don't copy paste or use too similar words or sentence structure will the source.
5	Don't copy paste. Re-write your summary.
6	Why italic?
7	Only it?
8	Copy paste? No need to do this!
9	This is not a journal, unless you can prove it to me.
10	<i>Summary kamu bagus, tetapi untuk jurnal review ini masih kurang.</i>
11	No need explain.
12	Paraphrase!
13	Not your own sentence.
14	<i>Jika kamu mengambil sebagian jurnal dan hanya mengganti sedikit seperti ini, tulisanmu akan membingungkan.</i>
15	<i>Ini hanya summary bukan review jurnal.</i>
16	<i>Saya tidak meminta kamu menulis ulang jurnalnya dengan menggunakan sinonim, tetapi saya minta review jurnal.</i>

Those criticisms are (1) your summary is too wordy, (2) you use too many exact words as the source, (3) it's too confusing. Re-arrange your sentence, (4) don't copy paste or use too similar words or sentence structure will the source, (5) don't copy paste. Re-write your summary, (6) why italic?, (7) only it?, (8) copy paste? No need to do this!, (9) this is not a journal, unless you can prove it to me, (10) *summary kamu bagus, tetapi untuk jurnal review ini masih kurang*, (11) no need explain, (12) paraphrase!, (13) not your own sentence, (14) *Jika kamu mengambil sebagian isi jurnal dan hanya mengganti sedikit seperti ini, tulisanmu akan membingungkan*, (15) *ini hanya summary bukan review jurnal*, and (16) *saya tidak meminta kamu menulis ulang jurnalnya dengan menggunakan sinonim, tetapi saya minta review jurnal*. The teacher "B" used question that should be answered by

students to criticism students' texts such as (1) why italic?, and (2) only it?. She also used constructive criticism where it containing specific information about what students do for their writing such as (1) it's too confusing. Re-arrange your sentence, (2) don't copy paste or use too similar words or sentence structure will the source, and (3) don't copy paste. Re-write your summary.

Based on the table 4.5 above, it is known that the criticism focus on three areas; originality, organization and vocabulary. The example of the criticism that focus on originality are (1) don't copy paste or use too similar words or sentence structure will the source, (2) not your own sentence, (3) copy paste? No need to do this, and so on. The criticism which focus on the organization is how the students arrange their writing composition such as (1) your summary is good but you need to outline the strength and weakness of this journal in order for your review complete, (2) it is too confusing, re-arrange sentence, and so on. Then, for the vocabulary area that the teacher comments such as (1) your summary is too wordy, (2) you use too many exact word as the source, and so on.

Table 4. 6 Teacher B's Feedbacks in Suggestion Category

No	Suggestions
1	<i>Cek ulang cara menulis referensi jurnal.</i>
2	Use your own words or language.
3	Be consistent in tenses.
4	Elaborate more!
5	Make it simple!
6	Remove all unnecessary details.
7	<i>Komentari lebih lanjut isi jurnalnya. Bee deeper!</i>
8	<i>Cek caramu menulis. Cek mekanisme penulisan.</i>
9	<i>Langsung pakai referensi awal.</i>
10	Make it shorter.
11	Re-check how to make reference.
12	<i>Ganti dengan referensi APA style.</i>
13	Break down into 2-3 paragraphs.

(Continued table 4.6)

14	Check your grammar.
15	<i>Persingkat summary yang kamu buat.</i>
16	Revise your writing. Be deeper.
17	<i>Ulas jurnal ini secara mendalam dengan pendapatmu sendiri.</i>
18	Be deeper in making critique.
19	Explain more! Be details.
20	In this second page, your writing feels so Indonesian instead of English. Re-check your sentence.
21	<i>Samakan spasi dengan tulisan diatas. Cek ulang bahasa Inggris yang kamu gunakan.</i>
22	Make your summary better!
23	Your summary is good but you need to outline the strength and weakness of this journal in order for your review to complete.

Those suggestions are (1) *cek ulang cara nulis referensi jurnal*, (2) use your own words or language, (3) be consistent in tenses, (4) elaborate more!, (5) make it simple!, (6) remove all unnecessary details, (7) *komentari lebih lanjut isi jurnalnya*. Be deeper!, (8) *cek caramu menulis. Cek mekanisme penulisan*, (9) *langsung pakai referensi awal*, (10) make it shorter, (11) re-check how to make reference, (12) *ganti dengan referensi APA style*, (13) break down into 2-3 paragraphs, (14) check your grammar, (15) *persingkat summary yang kamu buat*, (16) revise your writing. Be deeper, (17) *ulas jurnal ini secara mendalam dengan pendapatmu sendiri*, (18) be deeper in making critique, (19) explain more! Be details, (20) in this second page, your writing feels so Indonesian instead of English. Re-check your sentence, (21) *samakan spasi dengan tulisan diatas. Cek ulang bahasa Inggris yang kamu gunakan*, (22) make your summary better!, and (23) Your summary is good but you need to outline the strength and weakness of this journal in order for your review to complete. Those suggestions include positive comments for improvement and clear and achievable actions for students.

Based on the table 4.6 above, it is known that the suggestion focus on organization, content/idea, mechanic, grammar and vocabulary. However, the most comment is about organization and mechanic. The example of suggestion which focus on organization are (1) make it simple!, (2) make it shorter, (3) remove all unnecessary details, and etc. Then, for the example of suggestion which focus on mechanic are (1) ganti dengan referensi APA style, (2) re-check how to make reference, (3) *samakan spasi dengan tulisan diatas. Cek ulang bahasa Inggris yang kamu gunakan*, and so on.

Table 4. 7 Teacher B's Feedback in Corrective Category

No	Students' Tasks	Correct Answer
1	Because of this ignorance, Dwayne has been done a <u>research</u> of literature survey to argue that misguided opinion.	Research is uncountable!
2	Borlongan, A.M, Lim, J., & Roxas, R.E.O. (2012). University Students' Attitudes towards English-Tagalog TESOL Journal Code-Switching in Classrooms Instruction. TESOL ASIA, 7, 70-77.	<i>Jika referensi hanya ada satu maka tidak perlu dijorokkan seperti ini.</i>
3	Problem solving <u>is</u> includes a group of strategies listeners use to make inferences (guess) and to monitor these inferences.	Delete coma (,)
4	This study used the qualitative method by <u>using</u> the questionnaire which were <u>divided to</u> people all over the world...	Delete the word "divided to"
5	The main objective of this study <u>is to</u> demonstrate and <u>prove that</u> ECTS is the ability to replace the two languages...	is to= are to prove that= to prove
6	The instrument that used in this research <u>is</u> observation sheet, interview,	is = are
7	...with the number of 36 items <u>is</u> and they will determine whether the <u>is</u> sentence actually received or...	Delete coma (,)
8	Analyze problems that arise when <u>we</u> <u>translation</u> of English into Persian and ...	we translation = we translate the English into Persian

Researcher also found some corrective feedbacks. The feedback focuses on language and mechanical errors with giving circle and underline the errors with the correct answer and without providing the correct answer. The dominant corrections is about grammar, punctuation, tenses and vocabulary.

Based on the description above, it is known that the most feedback that used for comment are criticism and suggestion. Teacher “B” also used corrective feedback on students’ writing, but there is no praise feedback. Because this is the first assignment of students on the review journal, some students did mistake in mechanical and technical for reviewing journal. It can be said that because the students did mistake, as a result their teacher gave criticism and suggestion to her students.

Besides, researcher also did interview with the teacher “B” on 10th of June, 2016 to know the feedback practice and her opinion about it. The interview result shows that the teacher “B” used both oral and written form of feedback which focus on originality, organization, vocabulary, grammar and mechanic. She believed that the five areas are the most essential elements of writing. Both oral and written feedback have important function as stated by the teacher “B”, “every student has different area to fix so that giving personal written comments will work better than simply outline the errors in the class. However, I also check my students’ understanding by asking them to retell the feedback I gave to them and opening any discussion”. The teacher “B” combined all types of feedbacks based on students’ need.

c. Teacher C

The data was collecting for types of teachers' feedbacks was done on project of students' work who are taught by teacher "C". The researcher found only one student's draft during writing class because the teachers' writing used less written feedback on students' writing and students collected their work in file form. From the project of students' work, researcher only found corrective feedback. There is no another type of feedback. The result of corrective feedbacks from project of students' work shows below:

Table 4. 8 Teacher C's Feedback in Corrective Category

No	Students' Tasks	Correct Answer
1	Vocabulary <u>was</u> one very important aspect of learning a foreign language.	was = is
2	Formulation of the research problem <u>is</u> ...	is = was
3	Data collection procedure techniques in this study <u>are</u> written test, ...	are = were
4	Data processing techniques <u>will be</u> undertaken ...	will be = were
5	Object of this research <u>is</u> related ...	is = was

Based on the table 4. 8 above, the corrective feedback focus on the language error. It is shown with the most comment about tenses. This result is also supported by interview with the teacher "C". She gave feedback that focus on grammar because the students still have many mistakes on that aspect. As she stated "the area which I focus on my feedback is grammar because I think the students still have many mistake on that aspect and it is really hard to repair".

Besides, researcher also did interview with the teacher "C" on 6th of June, 2016 to know the feedback practice and her opinion about it. The interview result shows that in her class, feedback was not only given by teacher, but also by peer

and students' itself. The teacher C's feedback focused only on grammar because the students still have many mistakes on that aspects and really hard to repair. So, she only used corrective feedback the most of time. For providing error feedback, she used self-correction, peer correction, group work and teacher's correction. Focus on teacher's feedback, she used feedback in written form and believed that it is really important for students to make their writing better and they will know their mistake in writing.

Based on the description above, it is known that all the teachers' academic writing used feedback for teaching writing. The common type of feedback that they used is criticism and suggestion. They also used some praises and corrective feedback.

2. Students' Responses on Teachers' Feedbacks on Academic Writing Class of the Sixth Semester at English Department of Antasari State Institute for Islamic Studies Banjarmasin

To describe the students' responses on teachers' feedbacks, the researcher used questionnaire which consist 11 questions and interview which consist 5 questions. The detail of students' responses on teachers' feedbacks on academic writing class of the sixth semester at English Department of Antasari State Institute for Islamic Studies Banjarmasin can be seen as following descriptions.

Table 4. 9 The Form of Teachers' Feedbacks which Students Got During the Academic Writing Class

No	Questions	Yes	No
1	Did you get feedback on your writing during academic writing class?	77%	23%
2	Is the feedback given in written form?	43%	57%
3	Is the feedback also in verbal form?	63%	37%

The questionnaire findings show that teachers' academic writing used feedback in teaching process. It is shown with 77 % of students stated that they got feedback during the academic writing class. The most teachers' feedbacks are given in verbal form than in written form as 63% of students stated that the feedback is given in verbal form to them.

Table 4. 10 The Most Areas of Teachers' Comments during the Academic Writing Class

No	Students' Feedback Preference	Students (%)
1	Organization	12%
2	Content/idea	14%
3	Language (e.g., grammar, vocabulary, sentence pattern)	44%
4	Mechanics (punctuation and spelling)	6%
5	All of them	18%
6	Others (please specify) _____	4%

The questionnaire finding shows that the most teacher comment about language (i.e, grammar, vocabulary, sentence pattern), as 44% of students stated about language. However, the teacher also comment about organization, content/idea and mechanic, as stated 18% of students chose "all of them" option.

Table 4. 11 The Students' Feedback Preference to Their Teachers

No	Students' Feedback Preference	Students (%)
1	Only grade/mark	0%
2	Only error feedback	0%
3	Only written comments	8%
4	Mark/grade + error feedback	8%
5	Mark/grade + written comment	12%
6	Error feedback + written comment	2%
7	Mark/grade + error feedback + written comments	70%
8	Others (please specify) _____	0%

Students responded to teachers' practices (i.e., giving a mark and error feedback plus comments), as 70% of them wanted the teachers to continue with the practice. Students wish for not only get a mark/grade and error feedback, but also comment from their teacher.

Table 4. 12 The Types of Feedbacks which Teachers Give More in the Future

No	Students' Feedbacks Preference	Students (%)
1	Written comments	18%
2	Error feedback	16%
3	Both of them	62%
4	None of the above	0%
5	Others (please specify) _____	4%

Students' preference for both of written comment and error feedback is shown on the table 4. 12 above, where 62% of students hope that the teacher will give more written comment and error feedback in future. It shows that students hope their teacher combine both written comment and error feedback when they give feedback for their writing.

Table 4. 13 The Teachers' Feedbacks which students Interest in Finding Out in the Future

No	Students' Feedback Preference	Students (%)
1	The mark/grade	0%
2	Teachers' comments in my writing	30%
3	The errors I have made	8%
4	Teachers' comment + error feedback	50%
5	Mark/grade+ teachers' comments + error feedback	12%
6	Others (please specify) _____	0%

Students' preference on the table 4.12 is supported by result in table 4. 13, which shows that more students said they would be most interested in teachers comment plus error feedback. It is shown with 50% of students stated that they more interest on teachers' comment and error feedback.

Table 4. 14 The Area which Teachers Emphasize More in the Future

No	Students' Feedbacks Preference	Students (%)
1	Content/idea	8%
2	Organization (e.g., paragraphing, links between ideas)	4%
3	Language (e.g., grammar, vocabulary, sentence pattern)	10%
4	Mechanics (punctuation and spelling)	0%
5	All of them	80%
6	None of the above	0%
7	Others (please specify) _____	0%

In term of students' attitudes to the overall balance among content, organization, language and mechanic as broad criteria for marking writing. Almost students (80%) wanted the teacher to give feedback that concern on all part of areas. They wanted their teachers emphasize on content, organization, language and mechanic.

Table 4. 15 The Types of Feedbacks which Teachers Give Less in the Future

No	Students' Feedbacks Preference	Students (%)
1	Written comments	12%
2	Error feedback	18%
3	None of the above	70%
4	Others (please specify) _____	0%

As shown on the table 4. 15 above, 70% of students chose "none of the above" option for the types of feedbacks which teachers less give in the future. They do not want their teacher not give anything or comment for their writing. It is known that they want their teacher give more written comment and error feedback.

Table 4. 16 The Area which Teachers Emphasize Less in the Future

No	Students' Feedback Preference	Students (%)
1	Content/idea	10%
2	Organization (e.g., paragraphing, links between ideas)	4%
3	Language (e.g., grammar, vocabulary, sentence pattern)	18%

(Continued table 4.16)

4	Mechanics (punctuation and spelling)	28%
5	None of the above	40%
6	Others (please specify) _____	0%

As shown on the table 4. 16 above, 40% of students chose “none of the above” option for the types of feedbacks which teachers give less in the future. However, some students want their teacher give less about mechanic (28%) and language (18%). It is known that they want their teachers more emphasize all areas of feedback; content/idea, organization, language and mechanic.

Table 4. 17 The Feedback Strategies to Respond Error which Teacher Use More in the Future

No	Students' Feedbacks Preference	Students (%)
1	a. Underline/circle my errors	6%
2	b. Underline/circle my errors and provide correction for me. e.g., has <u>went</u> (gone)	20%
3	c. Underline/circle my errors and categorize them. e.g., has <u>went</u> (verb form)	6%
4	d. Underline/circle my errors, categorized them and provide correction for me. e.g., has <u>went</u> (gone) (verb form)	48%
5	e. Give me a hint about my errors- e.g., by putting a mark in the margin to indicate an error on a specific line. <div style="border: 1px solid black; padding: 2px; margin: 5px 0;"> “Yesterday I witness a robbery on my way home from school. It is about 5 pm. I was walking along Chater Road when a car stopped right in front of me ...” </div>	* 6%
6	f. Give me a hint about my errors and categorize the errors for me- e.g., by writing “T” in the margin to indicated a “Tense” error on a specific line. <div style="border: 1px solid black; padding: 2px; margin: 5px 0;"> “Yesterday I witness a robbery on my way home from school. It is about 5 pm. I was walking along Chater Road when a car stopped right in front of me ...” </div>	T T 6%

When asked about the error feedback strategies they preferred specifically, the majority (48%) of students opted for “underline/circle error, categorize them and provide correction” which requires the teacher to work everything for them.

Overall, the questionnaire data show that students wanted more input from their teacher in terms of written comments and also error feedback, particularly, those on the content, organization, language and mechanic. They hope to their teachers for providing correct answer and codes (indicating error types) for their errors.

In this research, researcher also did interview to know students' feeling on the teachers' feedbacks. It is also used to clarify students' answers from questionnaire. The result can see on the description below.

a. Teacher A

Based on the interview result toward students, it is known that they preferred to get feedback not only on verbal form, but also written form. They stated that both written and verbal feedback are important. One of students said "written feedback is important because I can know what part of my error and how far my ability in writing. I think verbal feedback is also important because I can know the point of teacher comment clearly". Both verbal and written feedback, almost students like suggestion and corrective feedback.

Students also stated that the teacher written comment is rarely given during academic writing class. As stated by a student "*selama perkuliahan academic writing ini, kami diberikan beberapa latihan dengan topik yang berbeda. Setiap pertemuan kuliah, bapak memberi kami kesempatan untuk bertanya tentang tugas yang diberikannya. Bapak mendatangi dan membantu kami satu persatu. Tetapi setiap latihan yang kami kerjakan tidak pernah dikembalikan untuk direvisi. Jadi, kami tidak mengetahui dimana letak kesalahan kami dan sejauh mana kemampuan*

kami dalam menulis". This data is supported by teacher A's statement when researcher came to find project of students' works. He said "this students' drafts were not returned to students again. So, you can return this draft to me anytime". When students were asked they suggestion for next teacher writing, they wanted teachers who teach writing care about their feedback especially written form in the future.

b. Teacher B

Based on the interview result toward students, it is known that they preferred to get feedback not only on verbal form, but also written form. They stated that written feedback is more important than verbal feedback. One of the students said "*untuk writing ini, penting sekali feedback guru itu ditulis karena kami bisa mengecek kembali apabila kami lupa apa yang sudah disampaikan ibu di lokal tadi. Semakin banyak coretan atau koreksian maka semakin baik bagi kami karena kami akan mengetahui dimana salah kami*". Both verbal and written feedback, almost students like suggestion and corrective feedback. However, some of students like all of the types of feedbacks.

Students like their academic writing class because they get more feedback from their teacher. The feedback is given not only on verbal form but also in written form. They stated that the teacher's feedback is helpful. They said "*saya senang sekali ketika mendapat feedback dari ibu. Ibu selalu memberikan coretan atau koreksian di setiap latihan. Dia selalu memberikan tanda pada bagian yang salah dan terkadang dia juga memberikan jawaban yang benar. Kemudian dia menanyakan kembali apakah ada diantara coretan itu yang tidak dipahami. Jadi,*

dari feedback yang ditulis ibu itu, kami mengetahui apa kesalahan dalam writing kami dan apa yang harus dilakukan untuk memperbaikinya sebelum dikembalikan lagi kepada ibu untuk dicek ulang apakah masih terdapat kesalahan atau kekurangan”.

The result of this interview is also supported by the result with the teacher “B”. She stated that she used written feedback on students’ writing because every student has different areas to fix so that giving them personal written comments will work better than simply outline the errors in the class. When students were asked the suggestion for next teacher writing, they wanted the teacher to continue the practice in future.

c. Teacher C

Based on the interview result toward students, it is known that they preferred to get feedback not only on verbal form, but also written form. They stated that both of feedback forms are important. As a student said “written and verbal feedback form are important to explain my error and I can revise my error. So, my writing will be better”. Both verbal and written feedback, almost students like suggestion and corrective feedback.

Students also stated that teacher feedback is very helpful for their writing development. During the academic writing class, they got less feedback on their writing in written form but more in verbal form in classroom. They collect their writing task in file form so that they did not know what part of their writing have error. The result is supported by teacher C’s statement when researcher come to find students’ drafts, she said “there is no students’ draft because my students will

collect their writing task in file form and I will check their file in my computer. Then, I will convey the students' errors verbally in class. My comment is about language for example error in grammar, vocabulary or tenses". When students were asked they suggestion for next teacher writing, they wanted the teacher to use feedback in written and verbal form in future.

B. DISCUSSION

1. Types of Teachers' Feedbacks on Students' Writing on Academic Writing Class of the Sixth Semester at English Department of Antasari State Institute for Islamic Studies Banjarmasin

Based on the project of students' works that the researcher conducted on Academic writing class of the sixth semester at English Department of Antasari State Institute for Islamic Studies Banjarmasin, researcher aims to look the types of teachers' feedbacks on students' writing. The result will be discussed as follow:

a. Praise

Praise is the common feedback that found on students' writing. In the processing of writing, students need to revise their writing to get a better final writing. Therefore, praise can motivate student to revise their writing and make it better. The example of praise are (1) it is quite good, (2) good abstract, (3) I think this abstract is good enough because of the language used and content, (4) this is a very good abstract because of the sentence, the content and the technique of writing, and (5) good (see, page 44).

In English Department of Antasari State Institute for Islamic Studies Banjarmasin, praise is also used by one of teachers' academic writing. However,

this type is rarely used than the others. Only five students accepted those praises above from teacher A. The praises are used on final draft of students.

Praise is more appropriate to final draft of students' writing. Students need to know what and where their error specifically to make next better writing. Supported by Hyland (2003:187), praise can motivate second language learner, but is often reserved for final draft where it can be act to reward students for their efforts. Yet, this type is rarely used in first draft. As teacher "C" said in interview, feedback is given based on students' need so that teachers need to combine praise, criticism, suggestion and corrective feedback".

b. Criticism

Criticism is another type of feedback that found on students' writing. Criticism is a comment that has negative orientation. On the other hand, criticism is defined as to find a something wrong with students' writing without giving them indication about how they can fix their writing.

Students have different interpretation about criticism. It depends on some factors such as confidence, tone it was delivered in and the teacher giving the criticism. Criticism has negative effect if the students perceive it as a critical. Criticism is ineffective because it rarely makes the students to revise their writing in any positive or constructive way. It is supported by Dale (2010:5), criticism is futile because it puts a person on the defensive and usually makes (them) strive to justify (themselves). It can be concluded that when students receive criticism, they perceive it as an attack and their gut reaction is to defend themselves.

In English Department of Antasari State Institute for Islamic Studies Banjarmasin, this type of feedback is also used by two teachers' academic writing. To state their criticism, teachers used question and the criticisms which contained a specific information about what students do for their writing which is known as a constructive criticism. The example of question are (1) what are your reason?, (2) what is the title?, (3) do you agree or not? (4) why italic?, (5) only it?, and so on (see, pages 45 and 49). The example of constructive criticism are (1) your abstract is too long. Write the point not in details. There is no keywords too, (2) second to the fifth paragraph are not clear because of the structure you applied, (3) it's too confusing. Re-arrange your sentence, (4) copy paste? No need to do this!, (5) don't copy paste. Re-write your summary, etc. (see, pages 45 and 49).

Question and contractive criticism are valuable. Supported by Raimes (1983:144), questions are implicit recommendations for revision. It is valuable to direct a student's attention to unclear context or organization or to lack of details. Contractive criticism is also effective to respond students' writing as stated by Hyland and Hyland (2001:186) that contractive criticism sometimes referred to as a suggestion where it will be effective to respond students' writing. By using contractive criticism, students can know they should do or act about their writing.

c. Suggestion

Suggestion is one of types of feedbacks that has a positive orientation. According to Hyland (2003:208), in suggestion, teacher provides clear and achievable actions for student. This type of feedback focus on students' texts and propose revision it. In the other hand, suggestion can be defined as a constructive

criticism. It means that suggestion is appropriate to improve students' writing when the students prefer to be a better writer. The example of suggestion are (1) you should write keywords in abstract, (2) write into one paragraph only, (3) break down into 2-3 paragraphs, (4) use your own words or language, (5) elaborate more, etc. (see, pages 46 and 51).

Two teachers' writing in English Department of Antasari State Institute for Islamic Studies Banjarmasin used those suggestions above to respond students' writing. They believed that this type of feedback is valuable for students. By using suggestion, students can look their progress and what they should do for the next writing.

d. Corrective feedback

Corrective feedback is one of feedback that given to analyze error on students' writing. Correction on error give students clues which point forward to the students' future writing. To give the correction on students' writing, teacher sometimes make an explicit correction. Researcher found that teacher indicates the students' errors in language and mechanic by giving underline and circle. There is no found written symbols on students' writing.

Almost project of students' works on academic writing class in English Department of Antasari State Institute for Islamic Studies Banjarmasin be found underline and circle to indicate students' errors and some of them with providing the correct answer. As stated by teacher C "I used corrective feedback the most of the time because I think it is really important for the students in writing and their writings still have many errors and I should make them know and correct their errors

by themselves". It is supported by Harmer (2007:120) that over-correction is a way of responding students' writing which have a good effect in written work by using underline, circle or written symbols.

2. Students' Responses on Teachers' Feedbacks on Academic Writing Class of the Sixth Semester at English Department of Antasari State Institute for Islamic Studies Banjarmasin

A student can write a topic if they have a knowledge about the topic. She or he needs to read for improving her or his knowledge and vocabulary. To improve writing skill, a student needs to combine another skills especially reading, grammar and vocabulary. For this reason, teaching writing is not easy task. Teachers have to know their roles in teaching writing. Based on the Harmer (2007:350), one of the teacher's roles is to be a feedback provider.

Teacher as a feedback provider during the writing process will be useful to demonstrate what student might do on the next time. According to Murcia (2001:219), to improve writing skill, teacher should provide feedback in writing course. Therefore, all of teachers who teach academic writing in English Department of Antasari State Institute for Islamic Studies Banjarmasin used feedback in improving students' writing skills.

Feedback is significant for students' progresses. However, this notion is not always realized by the teachers. In reality, the feedback that is given to the students might not fulfill students' expectations. Students' preferences and expectations on teachers' feedbacks are feedback for teachers to develop their feedback practice. In English Department of Antasari State Institute for Islamic Studies Banjarmasin, teachers' academic writing used more feedback in verbal form than written form

and the most teacher comment about language (vocabulary, grammar or sentence pattern). As stated by students that their teacher used less written comment but used to confer with their students individually when handing back the exercise. Not all teachers of academic writing care about their feedback. It is can be seen that one of them give feedback on final draft. The feedbacks are given on final draft cannot give maximum benefit for students' writing development. It is supported by interview result, students said that they prefer to have feedback from teacher when they are asked about their feeling after receive feedback from teacher.

According to Harmer (2007:115), to help students write successfully and enthusiastically, the teacher needs to consider the writing process. He stated that writing process will be better if it involves planning, drafting, reviewing and editing before producing a final writing. In another book, Harmer (2007:276) added a basic model for teaching productive skill like writing. The model involves feedback to the students work and point them in new direction. For giving feedback in written work, teachers are suggested to use over-correction and written symbols on students' writing. By using over-correction and written symbols, students can find and remember their teachers' feedbacks easily.

For question 1 to 3, the results show that in English Department of Antasari State Institute for Islamic Studies Banjarmasin, students got feedback during the academic writing class. Teachers' academic writing used more feedback in verbal form than written form. When students are asked the suggestions for next teacher writing, they suggest to teacher to combine verbal and written feedback. They

believe that both of them are important for their writing, especially in type of suggestion and corrective.

Both verbal and written form have their own advantages. As stated by Murcia (2001:228), conferencing allows teachers to uncover potential misunderstanding the students might have about prior written feedback or issues in writing that have been discussed in class. In the contrary, some surveys on many ESL students indicate that the students more value teachers' written feedbacks than peer feedback and oral feedback in writing class (Hyland & Hyland, 2006:84). Supported by Ferris (2003:41) notes that "written feedback may represent the single biggest investment of time by instructors, and it is certainly clear that students highly value and appreciate it". Based on the facts, teacher feedback is more useful for students if the written form is also supported by verbal form. The verbal form can uncover students' misunderstanding to what the teacher wrote on students' writings.

For question 4, it is about the most areas of teachers' comments during the academic writing. There are some areas which involve to product a good writing. Raimes (1983:6) stated that the areas for producing a piece of writing are organization (paragraph, topic and support, cohesion and unity), content/idea (relevancy, clarity, originality, logic, and so on), language (grammar, syntax, word choice/vocabulary, and so on) and mechanic (handwriting, spelling, punctuations, and so on). In English Department of Antasari State Institute for Islamic Studies Banjarmasin, teachers give comments on all part of areas, but the most area which teachers respond or commentate is language (grammar, syntax, word

choice/vocabulary, and so on). It supported by interview results with the teachers' academic writing that they more commentate on language area because their students still have many mistakes on that aspect and it is really hard to repair.

For question 5 to 10, it is about students' feedbacks preferences to teachers. In writing, it is common found that teachers often give grade/mark, error feedback and written comment besides verbal comment. Students prefer their teachers to continue to practice in giving grade/mark and error feedback plus written comments.

Moreover, generally there seem a tendency for students to wish for "more" from their teacher. When they are asked what the teacher should focus on less in their feedback, the majority of students chose "none of the above". Consistently, questions that are asked about preference for "more" feedback received a much lower percentage of response in the "none of the above" option than questions that are asked about "less" feedback.

Almost students hope their teacher will give more written comment and error feedback in future. It is shown with a lot of students who interested in teachers' comments in writing and error feedback where more emphasized on all part of areas; organization, content/idea, language and mechanic.

For question 11, it is about the teachers' methods in providing error feedback. In providing error feedback, almost students opted for "underline/circle error, categorize them and provide correct answer" which requires the teacher to work everything for them. Harmer (2007:149) suggested to not only use underline/circle, but also use written symbols such as S = spelling, WO= word order, and so on in providing error feedback. In English Department of Antasari State

Institute for Islamic Studies Banjarmasin, researcher did not find written symbols when teachers provide error feedback.

Based on the explanations above, it can be concluded that generally students required their teacher to work everything for them. They wanted more input from their teachers in terms of written comment and also error feedback, particularly, those on content, organization, language and mechanic. They also wanted all their teachers to give codes (indicating error types), categorize and provide correct answer for their errors.