

## **CHAPTER IV**

### **READING THE WHOLE SYEKH MUHAMMAD MUTAWALLI AL-SYA'RÂWÎ AND AMINA WADUD MUHSIN'S UNDERSTANDING**

Balance and harmony is God wants in the relationship of his fellow creatures. Both the harmonious relationship between man with other beings and man with his neighbor. That's why God created the differences, the advantages and disadvantages of his creatures to complement each other.

But in reality in human relationships, the difference between men and women raises many of its own polemics, because one species thinks it has been treated unfairly by another. One type is considered superior to the other with all the differences, ranging from gender differences, differences in characteristics to differences in treatment in society.

This injustice not only happens to the general public but also felt up to the realm of the family. Whether it is the relationship of parents of children, fellow siblings and husband and wife. Injustice is what often leads to disharmony in the home. As this study attempts to look at the concept of *nusyûz* from two interpreters who represent the male interpreter and the female interpreter.

#### **A. Critical Reading of al-Sya'râwî and Amina Wadud Muhsin's Interpretation of the *Nusyûz* Verses**

Based on the explanation of the data in the previous chapter the researchers can see that in interpreting the verse about *nusyûz*, al-Sya'râwî saw the

verse as a whole first, interpreting the words deemed related to the *nusyûz*. As the word *qânitât* and *thâ'a* accompany the verse about the *nusyûz*.

Al-Sya'râwî interprets the word *qânitât* as a virtuous woman who always *istiqâmah* to obedient to Allah. Accompanied by his interpretation starting that a woman who is *qânitât*, will accept every provision that has been established by God, including men are leaders for women.<sup>1</sup> At first glance, seen from the interpretation of al-Sya'râwî, that there are indications of excellence of one type. However, al-Sya'râwî only tried to interpret according to the meaning of *qânitât* itself. *Qânitât* is not just a *shâlehah*, he is a man who always accepts every will of God and believes no one can change his provisions.<sup>2</sup> The side that is seen is not the woman must obey the man as he is the leader, but the sight is to obey the command he loves, that is the provision of God.

Then al-Sya'râwî gave the interpretation of *nusyûz* as disharmony of husband and wife relationship, inconvenience that happened in the relationship of husband and wife because he described *nusyûz* as when we listen to music then sounds tone that is not in accordance with the music so unpleasant when heard, that is called with *nusyûz*.<sup>3</sup> In contrast to the classical interpreters who interpret *nusyûz* as opposed to the husband and sin to him.<sup>4</sup> Al-Sya'râwî interprets it because he considered *nusyûz* to occur on both sides, both husband and wife. Unlike the case with earlier interpreters who consider this *nusyûz* as an act that is

---

<sup>1</sup>Al-Sya'râwî, *Tafsir al-Sya'râwî*, 2195.

<sup>2</sup>Ibnu Manzhûr, *Lisân al-'Arab*, 73.

<sup>3</sup>Al-Sya'râwî, *Tafsir al-Sya'râwî*, 2683.

<sup>4</sup>Like al-Zamkashyari as one of the classical interpreters interpreting the word *qânitât* as a devout woman to her husband, it is said in one study that al-Zamkashyari says *qânitât* as fully the obedience that a wife must have to husband.

only done by the wife so that they interpret *nusyûz* as opposition to husband and sin to her husband. Thus it appears that al-Sya'râwî's interpretation of the word *nusyûz* does not indicate a stereotype in its interpretation.

The *nusyûz* solution that has been taught by the Quran is explained by al-Sya'râwî with full of wisdom. When the wife *nusyûz*, then he explained the solution of giving advice with a gentle word to the wife and advice should be given at the right time, the husband must be smart in stringing soft advice so that the advice can be well received by the wife, giving advice should be at time The right one so that the wife will easily receive the advice.<sup>5</sup>

If the advice can't to make changes to the wife's attitude, then the second path is taken that separates the bed. In explaining the solution of this bed separation according to al-Sya'râwî does not mean sleeping in a different bed, but only with his back to his wife, even then done if not add to the problem.<sup>6</sup>

And the last path of hitting, al-Sya'râwî required a blow not to bleed and not to bone. According to al-Sya'râwî's explanation that Allah has taught this beating with the story of Prophet Ayyub, that is with a gentle blow so as to incur a wife's guilty feelings towards her husband which will soften the affection between the two.<sup>7</sup>

Al-Sya'râwî justified the beating of a wife but not by violence, because he requires a blow with meekness. And according to al-Sya'râwî the right to give lessons to this wife does not mean then the husband is superior to his wife but what God intends and wants is only the balance and harmony of his creation. As

---

<sup>5</sup> Al-Sya'râwî, *Tafsir al-Sya'râwî*, 2200.

<sup>6</sup> Al-Sya'râwî, *Tafsir al-Sya'râwî*, 2200.

<sup>7</sup> Al-Sya'râwî, *Tafsir al-Sya'râwî*, 2201-2202.

for husbands who *nusyûz* then peace is better to do, do not let the household problems heard by other parties, the importance of solving the problem solved by the husband and wife concerned only be suppressed by al-Sya'râwî because according to him more and more interfere The affairs it will be more difficult to achieve peace because who really knows the root of the problem is just both.

Indeed, if we see, the Quran itself in providing solutions *nusyûz* men and women there are differences that seem to burden on the part of women, but according to al-Sya'râwî all the provisions set it is not to favor one, but to obtain balance and harmony of life.

On the other side Amina Wadud as one of the objects of this research, also interpreted the word *qânitât* before interpreting *nusyûz* and *thâ'a* word after giving solution to *nusyûz* as al-Sya'râwî do. Amina interpreted the word *qânitât* as a *shâlelah* woman because according to her use of *qânitât* word not only for woman type but also used for type of man so according to word *qânitât* describe characteristic and personality of people who believe to Allah.<sup>8</sup> Seen once Amina wants to be balanced in interpreting the word *qânitât* in this verse, so there is no indication of inequality in the interpretation.

Then in interpreting the word *nusyûz* Amina refers to the opinion of Sayyid Qutb, disharmony that occurred in a marriage. Continues with *nusyûz* handling that is with verbal solutions which according to Amina done by exchanging opinions in solving the problem or involving the help of mediator.<sup>9</sup>

---

<sup>8</sup>Amina, *Quran and Woman*, 74.

<sup>9</sup>Amina, *Quran and Woman*, 74-75.

Seen indeed in interpreting this verse of *nusyûz*, Amina Wadud covets the defense of women in understanding it. Thus, he interpreted the first solution with a verbal solution that shifted from its original meaning, is the giving of advice by the husband to the wife. Then interpreted by Amina Wadud with communication between husband or wife or consensus, both the husband and wife only or involving other parties.

Separation of the bed as a second solution according to Amina will be effective if done by a couple who continue to sleep together, unlike the case with polygamy couples which according to Amina this way is not feasible anymore, but Amina also has not provided another solution. The separation of this bed provides time for couples to think for each other, for their introspection.<sup>10</sup>

Amina's final solution is troubling, but she does not deny that the word *dharaba* does mean hitting but she still thinks that this verse is not a violent act to the wife but a strict prohibition violence wives. This interpretation is the defense of Amina for women, which has so far been the Quran that allows violence, but according to Amina, this verse is a prohibition for men to violence abusively.<sup>11</sup>

The accompaniment of the word *thâ'a* afterwards means as a dutiful wife to her husband. This according to Amina is not a command but a requirement, and which should be more concern is a verse that emphasizes the treatment of men and women, not vice verse.<sup>12</sup>

---

<sup>10</sup>Amina, *Quran and Woman*, 76.

<sup>11</sup>Amina, *Quran and Woman*, 77.

<sup>12</sup>Amina, *Quran and Woman*, 77-78.

## B. Mapping The Interpretation of Verse *Nusyûz* from al-Sya'râwî and Amina's Interpretation

Here to be more clear, will be shown Comparative Table of al-Sya'râwî and Amina Wadud's interpretation of the verse *nusyûz*:

Table Comparison of al-Sya'râwî and Amina Wadud's Interpretations of the <i>Nusyûz</i> Verses		
Word	Al-Sya'râwî's Interpretation	Amina Wadud's Interpretation
<i>Qânitât</i>	According to al-Sya'râwî is meant by <i>qânitât</i> is <i>shâlehah</i> woman who always obedient to Allah swt. Then he attributed this obedience to the previous verse, men are leaders for women. The <i>qânitât</i> women will accept Allah's provision that men are leaders for women.	Amina Wadud defined <i>qânitât</i> as a <i>shâlehah</i> because according to her the word <i>qânitât</i> is used for male and female type.
<i>Nusyûz</i>	Al-Sya'râwî interpreted <i>nusyûz</i> as when listening to music, then found a tone that did not match the song that caused the music is not pleasant to hear. In the domestic realm, he defined <i>nusyûz</i> as an	Regarding this <i>nusyûz</i> sense, Amina Wadud agrees Sayyid Qutb's opinion that what is meant by <i>nusyûz</i> is disharmony that occurs

	disharmony between husband and wife.	in the household. The word <i>nusyûz</i> is also used for the deeds of men and women.
<i>Faidzhûhunna</i>	Advice by husband to wife. Al-Sya'râwî explained in giving advice should use the words of gentle and advised in a timely manner.	Amina interpreted this word with a verbal solution. The existence of communication between husband and wife in solving problems as the alquran taught liberation to solve the problem.
<i>Wahjurûhunna fî al-madhâji 'i</i>	Separating bed according to al-Sya'râwî is not a separate sleeping, nor sleep in a separate room, but according to him only with his back to his wife. It do if it will not add to the problem.	According to Amina, separating bed will be effective when applied to couples who always sleep in a bed, and will be ineffective when applied to polygamous couples. In fact according to Amina separated bed intended

		to give time for husband and wife to introspection.
<i>Wa'dhribûhunna</i>	Al-Sya'râwî interpreted this word by hitting but with the condition not to bleed and not to bone. According to him, Allah has taught about this blow through the story of Prophet Ayyub as his wife did <i>nusyûz</i> , he struck with a bundle of grass or stubble as many as 100 sticks with one gentle punch, so the wife was awakened by the softness of her husband and regretted his actions.	Amina interpreted it with distress, but she also cannot deny that this word indeed means hitting. However, this verse according to Amina is a prohibition to commit acts of violence women, not vice versa.
<i>Thâ'a</i>	Al-Sya'râwî interpreted the word <i>thâ'a</i> means obedient, but according to him does not mean men stronger position than women. Obedient interpreted by the end of <i>nusyûz</i> wife, for having obeyed her husband.	Amina feels it is necessary to interpret the word <i>thâ'a</i> contextually "if they obey you", this is the sentence of the sentence is not a continuation of the command is a continuation for men,



		"Do not look for a way to trouble them", this is according to Amina command that Must be considered in this verse, not the opposite.
Solution for <i>Nusyûz</i> Husband	Al-Sya'râwî stipulated peace as the husband's <i>nusyûz</i> solution, because he thought peace is more important. Al-Sya'râwî regards releasing the rights to others with a greater willingness than justice itself.	Amina refused a peace solution with her wife to give up her right to her husband, because she thought such an attitude is a remnant of a single marriage that requires her wife to always accept her husband's attitude. According to Amina actually wanted by Allah swt is only harmony in non marriage household which only benefit one side.

From the table above we can see there are some differences and similarities of interpretation of al-Sya'râwî and Amina Wadud in understanding the verse of *nusyûz*.

Starting from interpreting the word *qânitât*, both mean *qânitât* with *shâlelah* women who are always obedient to Allah, but al-Sya'râwî give emphasis by saying that a *shâlelah* woman will accept the provisions of men is the leader for women according to the provisions of Allah swt.

In interpreting *nusyûz*, both equally interpret it as a disharmony that occurs in the household both come from the women and men. As for the settlement of *nusyûz* women in interpreting the word *faidzhûhunna* there are differences of opinion because al-Sya'râwî interpret it as giving advice from the husband to his wife while Amina interpreted as a verbal solution which means the communication between the two with *musyâwarah* not just the wife heard the advice of the husband. The second solution is *wahjurûhunna fî al-madhâji'i* interpreted al-Sya'râwî not with the actual separation of the bed but only backed his partner and that too done if it will not cause problems, while Amina interpret it is by doing separated bed but according to him bed separation will not be effective If done by the couple polygamy. Furthermore, interpreting the word *wadhribûhunna* al-Sya'râwî interpreted by hitting on condition not to bleed and not to bone and take the story of Ayyub prophets as an example to face *nusyûz* wife with a gentle punch that eventually gave awareness to his wife instead of hurting his wife. While Amina defined it as troublesome, on the other hand Amina cannot deny that *wadhribûhunna* its original meaning is indeed hit. However, this

verse cannot be used as a reason for men to commit acts of violence because according to him the content of this verse is a ban on violence not vice versa.

Furthermore, al-Sya'râwî and Amina Wadud both interpret the word *thâ'a* with obedience. However, al-Sya'râwî explained *thâ'a* in this verse is not obedient to the husband but the sign of the end of *nusyûz*. In the other side Amina stated that *thâ'a* sentence is not something to be highlighted, because according to her this verse is a requirement not a command. Continuing this verse is what should be highlighted is the command that men do not look for ways to trouble women.

Finally, the solution of male *nusyûz* is with peace. Al-Sya'râwî indeed considers the splendor of the wife to give up her right to her husband is more important than justice itself. Amina is rejecting this solution because she thinks that peace by way of women must give up their rights because the necessity of the wife to always accept the attitude of the husband is a remnant of a single marriage.

To see the interpretation of the two interpreters above whether their interpretation is gender biased or not with some indicators, as follows: *First*, does the interpretation assign one party in a subordinate position to the other; *Second*, does the interpretation place one party in a marginal position while the other is in a central position; *Third*, does the interpretation specify a certain stereotype or labeling that is negative to either party; *Fourth*, does the interpretation impose a

double burden on one side or a heavier burden than the other, and *Fifth*, does the interpretation justify violence, both physical and non-physical to either party.<sup>13</sup>

To see whether al-Sya'râwî and Amina Wadud bias gender or not in their interpretation of verse *nusyûz*, the researchers present the table as follows:

Table Analysis of Genderism in al-Sya'râwî and Amina Wadud's Interpretation of Verse of <i>Nusyûz</i>			
Verses About <i>Nusyûz</i> (The word interpreted)	Al-Sya'râwî's Interpretation	Amina Wadud's Interpretation	
<i>Qânitât</i>	There is no bias even though al-Sya'râwî associates a <i>qânitât</i> (who is always obedient to Allah) by her acceptance with the provisions of Allah, men as leaders for women.	There is no bias because Amina interprets this word with <i>shâlehah</i> , before interpreting it to see the meaning of this word based on its use for both men and women.	
<i>Nusyûz</i>	There is no bias because he interpreted <i>nusyûz</i> with disharmony of households that can come from both women	There is no bias because Amina also defined <i>nusyûz</i> with disharmony that can come from both women and	

<sup>13</sup>Sugiarti, Konsep dan Teknik Penelitian Gender (Malang: UMM Press, 2006), 14-19.

	and men.	men.
<i>Faidzûhunna</i>	Al-Sya'râwî interpreted this verse by giving advice from husband to wife, because it means language in this way and it is a solution to solve the wife's <i>nusyûz</i> so that the interpretation of al-Sya'râwî is so natural, not a biased matter.	Amina interpreted this word with a verbal solution made by husband and wife. However, it is seen here that Amina provided the development of meaning, from the initial meaning of this word to meaningful advice to a verbal solution. Amina looks to equate women and men in this solution. There is no bias though it looks imposing in its meaning.
<i>Wahjurûhunna fî al-Madhâji'i</i>	There is no visible bias because he explains this word with his back to his wife even though it does not match his original meaning.	There is no bias. Amina only explains this word with its original meaning.
<i>Wadhribûhunna</i>	There is no bias even though Al-Sya'râwî interpreted this word by hitting it, it does not	Amina interpreted this word with distress, but she cannot deny the meaning of the

	<p>mean he justified the domestic violence, he even explained that it struck the wife who <i>nusyûz</i>. Allah has taught through the story of the prophet Ayyub as beating his wife with 100 stems of grass, Once a gentle punch so as to awaken his <i>nusyûz</i> wife.</p>	<p>origin of this word is a hit. Nor does Amina justify violence because she thinks this verse is not for the justification of violence perpetrated by men but this verse is a prohibition for men to commit violence. And here it is also seen that Amina in her commentary championed the defense of women. With its interpretation that provides a defense against women still cannot be interpreted this is called bias.</p>
<i>Thâ'a</i>	<p>There is no bias, because al-Sya'râwî interpreted this word with obedience as the sign of the end of wife <i>nusyûz</i> not interpreted the wife must be obedient to the husband.</p>	<p>Amina interpreted this word contextually "If they obey you, then do not look for a way to trouble them", the initial sentence is a requirement while the sentence addressed to men is the command. In this</p>

		interpretation, it is again seen that Amina provides a defense against women, but nevertheless cannot be said to be biased.
<i>Nusyûz</i> 's Husband Solution	Al-Sya'râwî indeed states that peace is indeed the best way. Releasing the right with a willingness is indeed more important, but whether by interpreting this verse in accordance with the content of this verse can be said to be biased, according to researchers, this is not a habits.	Amina rejected this solution because she thought women who have to give up their rights and constantly accept whatever the attitude of the husband is a remnant of a single marriage. With rejection of this solution does not make Amina bias gender. But that can be seen as a whole Amina is trying to defend women.

### 1. Interpretations that indicated are gender biased

Based on the data above can the researcher group interpretation that indicated gender bias from al-Sya'râwî and Amina's interpretation. Nothing to bias gender interpretation, but researcher can say that indicated gender bias from interpretation al-Sya'rawî about solution for *nusyûz* husband, because in this

solution as women get the burden of felling more than men, waive his right as wife to achieve peace in this household.

## **2. Interpretations that indicate gender equality**

Group interpretation that indicate gender equality from al-Sya'râwî and Amina's interpretation can be seen from the interpretation about solution for *nusyûz* wife, and *thâ'a*. Visible when al-Sya'râwî explained about the solution *nusyûz* wife, al-Sya'râwî explained that men remain gentle towards the *nusyûz* wife, ranging from advise her until the last solution is to beat her with the softness. And interpret the word *thâ'a*, just as a sign of the end of *nusyûz* because according to him male and female, there is no type that is superior to other types. Whereas Amina, of course, in her interpretation seen once her defenses against women when explaining about the solution *nusyûz* wife, said *thâ'a* and her rejection of *nusyûz* husband's solution that indicated she is supports the gender equality.