

CHAPTER III

INTERPRETATION OF INDONESIA QURANIC COMMENTARIES ON WOMAN'S CLOTHES VERSE

Talking about clothes indirectly will also relate to genitals because basically the function of clothes is as genitals cover. According to Quraish Shihab there are 5 parts of the Quran which explained about genitals of woman and two of them became *dâ'il* of dressing principle. They are Surah al-Ahzâb [35]: 59 and an-Nûr [24]: 31.

In this research, the researcher will give explanation of the verses according to Indonesian Commentators by seeing their interpretation works, and below are the interpretation of the verses.

A. QS: Al-Ahzâb [35]: 59.

First part that became a main discussion on woman's clothes is as Allah mentioned in QS: Al-Ahzâb: 59.

يَا أَيُّهَا النَّبِيُّ قُلْ لِّأَزْوَاجِكَ وَبَنَاتِكَ وَنِسَاءِ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ يُدْنِينَ عَلَيْهِنَّ مِنْ جَلِيبِهِنَّ
ذَٰلِكَ أَدْنَىٰ أَنْ يُعْرَفْنَ فَلَا يُؤْذَيْنَ ۚ وَكَانَ اللَّهُ غَفُورًا رَّحِيمًا ٥٩

Meaning: *O Prophet! say to your wives and your daughters and the women of the believers that they let down upon them their over-garments; this will be more proper, that they may be known, and thus they will not be given trouble; and Allah is Forgiving, Merciful.*

Abd Raûf al-Singkilî in *Tarjumân al-Mustafîd* explained that Muhammad was ordered to explain to his wives, daughters and all Muslims' wives to extend *Penutup Wajah* (face cover) because that will make them easier to be known that

they are independent women and not to be hurt by other men because their genitals did not visible.¹

Refers to *Khâzin*, al-Singkili added his explanation that people (men) who loved to commit adultery in Madina walked in the city to commit molest when there were any women who came out at night. At one time there was a woman went out home at night because there was an affair (*hâjat*), then the woman was followed by fornicator men because presumed that the woman was a slave² and the woman was disturbed by the men. Therefore Allah sent down this verse. In this verse Allah also explained that He is the most forgiven that forgave them whose left to cover their genitals at the last time.³

An-Nawawi al-Bantani in *Tafsîr Marâh Labîd* explained that women have to lengthen their clothes (*tsiyâb*) until the clothes cover their face, neck and chest, it means the clothes wrap their body because it will be more suitable for them as independent women and make them impossible to inflict adultery because who had been covering the face they must did not want to open their genitals and will make them be secure.⁴

The interpretation is similar with interpretation in *Tanwîr al-Biqbâs* by al-Fairûzâbâdy which explained that women means Prophet Muhammad's wives,

¹Abd al-Raûf al-Jawî, *Tarjumân al-Mustafîd*, (Beirut: LB Dâr al-Fikr, 1990), 427.

²There were different clothes between a slave woman and an independent woman at the time.

³Abd al-Raûf al-Jawî, *Tarjumân al-Mustafîd*, ..., 427.

⁴Nawawi al-Jawî, *Marah Labid*, (Beirut: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Ilmiyah, 2013), 261.

daughters and Muslims' wives that have to lengthen their clothes (*tsiyâb*) until the clothes covered their face, nect and chest.⁵

Mahmūd Yūnus explained that this verse talked about women habit in *Jahilīyah* era (before Islam comes) who liked wearing clothes that were not honored which more like a slave outfit (open the genitals). At the time, there were some naughty men who liked to harm women on the streets, it means was when there were those women who walked into the garden or farm at night then the naughty men want to harm them even sometimes they interfered with independent women, this occurred because they think they were slaves, because the clothes were the same between a slave and an independent woman so that Allah sent down this verse to ask all Muslim women as Independent women to close their chest, head with *mantel* (coat), so it could help to show that they were Independent women.⁶

By this bright way, the women were honored women, not the same with slaves. Yūnus concluded that this verse intended so that the honored women to wear honorable clothes anyway, not like a slave or naughty woman outfit, so they were known by people and not plagued by the mischievous men.⁷

Hasbī al-Shiddwqy in *Tafsīr an-Nūr* explained that women were obeyed to cover their body with *selendang besar* (a large scarf) when go out from their house. He also explained that women come out from house at night for urinating in gardens, and there were not differences between independent woman's dressing

⁵Abī Thāhir al-Fairūzâbâdy, *Tafsīr al-Miqbâs*, (Bairut: Dâr al-Fiqr, 2001), 429.

⁶Mahmūd Yūnus, *Tafsīr Quran Karim*, (Jakarta: Hidakarya Agung, 2004), 625.

⁷Mahmūd Yūnus, *Tafsīr Quran Karim*, ..., 625.

and slave's dressing. In Madina at the time still stroll people who love to harm a slave woman but sometimes they also did it to an independent woman because the men did not know where was an independent woman and where was a slave, so that why this verse asked independent women to make a difference in dressing with slaves by covering whole body.⁸

Hasbī added that there are some commentators who have interpreted this verse as a basis on obligation to wear *niqab* (face cover), but he explained that this verse only commanded the women to wear polite clothes, because there is not information proven that women at the beginning of Islam covering their face as a religion obligation. In fact, the histories proven that the women at the time mixed with men did every job exposed face and hand.⁹

Hamka in his interpretation work explained that Islamic society was asked to be difference from others (*Jahiliyah*), especially in dressing tradition for women, it is because before this verse was revealed, the dressing tradition of Muslim women and others such as *musyrik*, servant was not different, so when the women wanted to take a bowel, they have to go to underbrush at night, but at that time was an opportunity for bad boys to disturb them, because the boys did not know where were independent women, *Muslimah*, servant and *musyrik*, that means there was not differentiation between them.¹⁰

⁸Muhammad Hasbi Ash-Shiddieqy, *Tafsir An-Nur*, (Semarang, Pustaka Rizki Putra, 2000), 3307.

⁹Muhammad Hasbi Ash-Shiddieqy, *Tafsir An-Nur*, ..., 3307-33308.

¹⁰Hamka, *Tafsir Al-Azhar*, (Jakarta: Pustaka Panjimas, 1992), 93.

That is the reason why the verse was revealed, Allah asked to the Prophet Muhammad to command his wives, daughters, and all Muslims' wives to wear *Jilbâb* when they want to come out from house because *Jilbâb* are more known by people that they (who wear *Jilbab*) are Muslim.¹¹

Hamka explained the meaning of *Jilbâb* by describing from other Quranic Commentators such as in al-Qurthubi's interpretation that *Jilbâb* is wider than a scarf, he gave more explanation that *Jilbâb* is a piece of cloth that covered the entire body. Then Hamka also took definition from Ibnu Abbas and Ibnu Mas'ud that *Jilbâb* is *rida'*, sort of wide blanket.¹²

Based on the explanation above, Hamka has been giving the meaning of *Jilbâb* is a sarong or cloth that will cover whole body and only half of face is visible.

In interpretation of Department of Religion explained that Allah commanded all Muslim women, especially Prophet Muhammad's wives and his daughters extend *Jilbab* to entire body, it was so that they were easily recognizable by their clothes because they were different with slave women, so they would not harassed by those who abuse the opportunity. A politely dressed of women would be easier to escape from a naughty person, while a woman who opened her private part in public is easily accused or judged as a woman who is not good in personality. For those whose in the past was not careful to cover the

¹¹Hamka, *Tafsir Al-Azhar*, ..., 94-96.

¹²Hamka, *Tafsir Al-Azhar*, ..., 96.

nakedness then make repairs, so Allah is the most forgiving and the most merciful.¹³

Muhammad Quraish Shihab in *Tafsir Al-Misbah* explained that the story behind this verse was tantamount with stories that have been described on *mufasssir* before. Quraish described back that in this verse the Prophet Muhammad was ordered to instruct his wives, daughters and all Muslim women stretched out *Jilbab* over them (whole body). The word '*alaihinna* (over them) impressed that entire body of them should be covered by clothes. Prophet Muhammad count out face and palms or and some other parts of women body.¹⁴

In interpreting Quranic Verses, Quraish always gives correlation on each verses, as well as this discussion, he explained that after previous verse prohibited anyone from harassing and harming the Prophet, Muslim and Muslim women, it is now specifically to the Muslim women begin with wives of the Prophet who were commanded to avoid caused which contribute to humiliation and harassment.¹⁵

Besides that, Quraish explained in his work based on two sides, first was derived from Thabâthabâ'I that the word "jilbab" in the sense of clothing that is covering the whole body or veil which is covering the head and face of woman,¹⁶

¹³*Jalâbib* is a plural of a word "*Jilbâb*" which means clothing that covers the whole body, although the veil (*Jilbab*) model can be various but the desired goal of headscarf is apart from covering the genitals as well, so that Muslim women are better known their identity then they are not disturbed, because *Jilbab* became characteristic of people who take care of themselves and avoid distractions. See: Departemen Agama RI, *Al-Quran dan Tafsirnya*, (Jakarta: Lentera Abadi, 2010), 41-42.

¹⁴Muhammad Quraish Shihab, *Tafsir Al-Misbah*, (Jakarta: Lentera Hati, 2012), 533.

¹⁵Muhammad Quraish Shihab, *Tafsir Al-Misbah*, ..., 532-533.

¹⁶Muhammad Quraish Shihab, *Tafsir Al-Misbah*, ..., 534.

The second was taken from Ibn ‘Asyūr that the word “jilbab” is a clothing smaller than a cloak but larger than a veil or a face cover. This laid the woman on the head and stretched the sides of the veil through the cheek until the whole shoulder and the back. Ibn Asyūr added that the veil mode may vary according to the different circumstances or tastes of women directed by custom. However, the purpose for which this verse is intended to make them better known so that they are not disturbed.¹⁷

Quraish explained that the verse above did not instruct Muslim women wear *Jilbâb* because presumably when that time most of them have been wearing it, but it was just how to wear it yet support what is desired by this verse. This effect was obtained from editor starting verse above which clarify *their jilbab* and was ordered was *that they should coast their outer garments*, it means they have been wearing *jilbab* but not to pay it out yet.¹⁸

Quraish explained again in *Tafsîr al-Lubâb* that the meaning of *Jilbâb* was disputed by scholars, there are some meanings such as *Jilbâb* as a loose shirt or a veil of woman’s head cover or also clothes that cover the shirt and veil or also all clothes that cover the woman.¹⁹

B. QS: An-Nûr [24]: 31

Second part which also became a staple discussion about woman’s clothing, Allah has once said in QS: An-Nûr [24]: 31

¹⁷Muhammad Quraish Shihab, *Tafsir Al-Misbah*, ..., 534.

¹⁸Muhammad Quraish Shihab, *Tafsir Al-Misbah*, ..., 534.

¹⁹Muhammad Quraish Shihab, *Tafsir Al-Lubâb*, ..., 241

وَقُلْ لِلْمُؤْمِنَاتِ يَعْضُضْنَ مِنْ أَبْصَرِهِنَّ وَيَحْفَظْنَ فُرُوجَهُنَّ وَلَا يُبْدِينَ زِينَتَهُنَّ إِلَّا مَا ظَهَرَ مِنْهَا وَلْيَضْرِبْنَ بِخُمُرِهِنَّ عَلَى جُيُوبِهِنَّ وَلَا يُبْدِينَ زِينَتَهُنَّ إِلَّا لِبُعُولَتِهِنَّ أَوْ آبَائِهِنَّ أَوْ آبَاءِ بُعُولَتِهِنَّ أَوْ أَبْنَائِهِنَّ أَوْ أَبْنَاءِ بُعُولَتِهِنَّ أَوْ إِخْوَانِهِنَّ أَوْ بَنِي إِخْوَانِهِنَّ أَوْ بَنِي أَخَوَاتِهِنَّ أَوْ نِسَائِهِنَّ أَوْ مَا مَلَكَتْ أَيْمَانُهُنَّ أَوِ التَّابِعِينَ غَيْرِ أُولِي الْإِرْبَةِ مِنَ الرِّجَالِ أَوِ الطِّفْلِ الَّذِينَ لَمْ يَظْهَرُوا عَلَى عَوْرَتِ النِّسَاءِ وَلَا يَضْرِبْنَ بِأَرْجُلِهِنَّ لِيُعْلَمَ مَا يُخْفِينَ مِنْ زِينَتِهِنَّ وَتُوبُوا إِلَى اللَّهِ جَمِيعًا أَيُّهَ الْمُؤْمِنُونَ لَعَلَّكُمْ تُفْلِحُونَ ٣١

The meaning: *And say to the believing women that they cast down their looks and guard their private parts and do not display their ornaments except what appears thereof, and let them wear their head-coverings over their bosoms, and not display their ornaments except to their husbands or their fathers, or the fathers of their husbands, or their sons, or the sons of their husbands, or their brothers, or their brothers' sons, or their sisters' sons, or their women, or those whom their right hands possess, or the male servants not having need (of women), or the children who have not attained knowledge of what is hidden of women; and let them not strike their feet so that what they hide of their ornaments may be known; and turn to Allah all of you, O believers! so that you may be successful.*

Based on Rauf Al-Singkili interpretation in *Turjumân al-Mustafîd* explained that in this verse Prophet Muhammad was told to explain to all Muslim to close the vision from a thing that should not be seen by them, also they told to keep genitals and not to do adultery. They were forbidden to reveal their ornaments but commonly look like face and palm were due in an emergency situation, and women required to cover head and neck up to the chest by wearing *telekung* and do not exhibit ornaments except to the husband, father, parents in law, children, stepchildren, brothers, child from sister, Islam women or slaves they owned or servants who have not desire (to woman) or children who do not understand about woman's genitals. Then do not you (woman) to stamp your feet

so that know about your ornaments such as *Gerincing*, then Allah with it order to repent from all sin.²⁰

On the sentence “*that they should not display their beauty and ornaments except what (ordinary) appear thereof.*” On this verse al-Singkili did not mention what did it mean by ornaments, but by researcher’s perspective based on his interpretation from the first verse was the meaning with ornaments here is the beauty ornaments of woman’s body, then he interpreted that women prohibited open part of their body except usual look like face and palm because perforce. Probably al-Singkili understood the word “*ila*” in term “*but*” or in term of Arabic is *istisna’ munqathi’* in term of excluded was not part or any kind previously mentioned. It means: that they should not display their beauty and ornaments; but what appear (perforce or unintentionally as blow of wind and other things), it’s excusable.

An-Nawâwi explained in *Tafsîr Marâh Labîd* that in this verse Allah had commanded believing women to keep their eyes from things that were unlawful to look at, and enjoined them to keep their genitals from committing adultery, then was told not to show they jewelry unless a common seen, in the sense that something was commonly seen because of a costum such as a wig, henna, ring on their palms, clothing, face while witnessing in a case and when about to get married.²¹

²⁰Abd Raûf al-Jawî, *Tarjumân al-Mustafîd*, ..., 354.

²¹An-Nawai provided an explanation that there were three kinds of jewelry for women, the first is clothing, the second is jewelry in the form of objects such as rings, bracelets, necklaces, etc, the third is jewelry such as kohl, henna, make up, etc. See: An-Nawawi, *Marâh Labîd*, ..., 109.

The women required to lengthen their headscarves to cover their breasts, because in fact the habits of ignorant women of the day are wearing the *khimâr* but backed up so that their neck and chest are visible, and Muslim women are told not to see their jewels except husband, father, father in law, sons, husband's son, brothers, sisters, sons of brothers and sisters, fellow Muslim women or servants or male servants who did not have desire for women and also may be seen by children who do not understand with genitals. Then it is forbidden for women to stomp their feet when they are walking, if it is done by wanting to reveal the existence of the jewelry then it is *makruh*, but if it is done because want to attract the attention of men then it is *haram*. In the end of the verse explained that they should repent and obey in doing the command of God.²²

An-Nawâwi explained this verse has divided the meaning of *beauty* into three parts. The first part of *beauty* was clothes (*tsiyâb*), the second part was jewelry such as ring, bracelet, pendant, etc. the last part was garnish such as cosmetic used to blacken eyelid, face powder, necklace, henna, etc.

An-Nawâwi explained again that the meaning of “*except what (ordinary) appear thereof*” is *beauty* which commonly seen because of a custom such as, ring, cosmetic used to blacken eyelid, face powder, henna and clothes. It means that women will be able to show their face and palm, but he gave reasons why it could be? Women permitted to show it for utility that make them to do it such as to be a witness on a case or when they want to get married, they have to show it to their candidates.

²²An-Nawawi, *Marâh Labîd*, ..., 109-110.

Based on the explanation above, we could be known that generally all of the woman's bodies are genitals and they cannot show it to others because a utility that makes them to do it.

Mahmûd Yûnus in *Tafsîr Quran Karîm* explained that this verse told women to keep their view from *haram* things, because it is the beginning of incidence of crime, especially in the Eastern country that heat weather. The women probidden open their ornaments or their body to men who are not family except from the usual open for working, as described in Hanafi Mazhab that can be seen when work was face, palm up to the wrist and soles to ankles. Even there were said to be seen half of palms and soles of feet because those all are commonly seen while working.²³

Mahmûd Yûnus also explained that women should close the head, occipital, and her chest wiyh *kudung*, but Yûnus took reference explanation from Indonesia scholar that instruction to close the head it was telling about the women clothing civilization which commonplace in Arab land.²⁴

Yûnus interpreted that women forbidden to visible their jewelry that is body part except usual appears to work or in activity as face and palm till wrist and soles of the feet until the ankles by this reason this is usual case when do activities, in other words Yûnus understood this textually i.e *except what (ordinary) appear thereof* then realized to the community life, especially Indonesia, that parts of body must be opened that will be difficult when do not

²³Mahmûd Yûnus, *Tafsîr Qur'an Karim*, ..., 515.

²⁴Mahmûd Yûnus, *Tafsîr Qur'an Karim*, ..., 516-517.

opened as previously mentioned, it means Yûnus applied this verse by adjusting Indonesia community situation because think that message to cover head is a message about women clothing civilization which are in commonplace in Arab land.

Hasbi Ash-Shiddieqy explained that women prohibited from seeing part sections from men who are not their husband. Then women also told to not visible their ornaments who worn on the forbidden body parts to open. Clearly they did not show the parts of the body where the ornaments, such as necklace use place except the usual jewelry look that is ornament which found on the face and palm, in order words Ash-Shiddieqy opinion that the genitals of women is the whole body except the face and palm.²⁵

Ash-Shiddieqy understood the sentence *except what (ordinary) appear thereof* was accordance with the text i.e., the women should not be revealing jewels mounted in the body become as genitals like necklace mounted in the neck so it could show neck and chest part, it is meant by *except what (ordinary) appear* is jewelry worn in the part which did not become genitals such as a ring worn on the fingers. It means that Ash-Shiddieqy really understood this verse textually.

In this verse Hakma explained that women are told to keep their views and genitals from bad things and also demanded for women not to show their jewelry except the real ones like ring on fingers, face and hands because that are what is meant by real jewelry. It means simplest and inconspicuous and encouraging.

²⁵Hasbi Ash-Shiddieqy, *Tafsir An-Nur*, ..., 2815.

Then it is also explained that let the scarf that had been worn in the head was closed to the chest.²⁶

In this verse was told to close the scarf to *Juyûb* means a hole opening the chest so that base of the breast appears. Sometimes closed but the clippers make it open. In this verse also hinted that how great the role taken by the breasts of women in causing lust. The believers will bring the tip of the catfish to her chest so as not to open, as this will give rise to male interest and cause loss of control.²⁷

In the philosophy of modern worldview it was said that a highly restricted relationship between men and women would create some kind of inner pressure on a person. Thereof in a free association, just looking at each other, talking freely, hanging out and joking were not outrageous among men and women should be allowed, so that the pressure lust could be slightly released. This philosophy was putting forward by the jews like Sigmund Sreud, but Hamka denied because if so then free association would be more rampant, if the chest was opened, the back was opened, thighs opened or association between men and women were not bounded then men would be naughty, therefore made a variety of ethnics for men to be polite.²⁸

Hamka explained that women have to cover all of their body *except what (ordinary) appear*, he mentioned it that the meaning of that was they might be able to show ring on their fingers, face and hands because that was meant by real jewelry, but ut seems like there was not harmony with the interpretation in the

²⁶Hamka, *Tafsir Al-Azhar...*, 179.

²⁷Hamka, *Tafsir Al-Azhar...*, 180.

²⁸Hamka, *Tafsir Al-Azhar...*, 181.

verse before that women have to wear *Jilbâb*, but on the second verse he interpreted by adapting the verse with condition in Indonesia that face and hand were commonly seen, but on the first verse seems influenced by his references in writing his interpretation work, it means there is no mistake for every women want to wear *jilbab* like in Arab but for Indonesian women to cover whole body are not an obligatory because face and hand are commonly seen in Indonesia, means it is not the same with the context of Arab.

Then explained also to whom women can show jewelry as well to husband, father in law, children, husband's children, brother's sons, sister's sons, fellow women, slaves, male servants who have no desired of women and children who have not understand genitals.

The end of this verse Allah asked to repent, because as long as men are still men and women are still women, as long as birds on branches and animals in forest are still male and female, so as long as human will not be separated from seduction, very rarely do men's hearts do not tremble to see beautiful women, and rarely women are not fascinated to see a man of dashing. Islam does not shut d\down the feeling, because it cannot be separated from life, but Islam enjoins it to keep it in good faith and guided it to be guided by faith, commanded to limit oneself, to subjugate, to hold the heart and to jeep the honor.²⁹

According to the interpretation of Ministry of Religion that this verse explained that Prophet Muhammad was commanded by God to warn believing

²⁹Hamka, *Tafsir al-Azhar...*, 181-183.

women so that they do not see things that are not lawful for them, such as the male and all body for women and were commanded to maintain their sex not falling into the valley of adultery or seen by others.³⁰

So they are required to cover their head and chest with a veil, so as not to see the hair, neck and chest because the custom of woman closed her head but her veil is pushed back so that it appears the neck and chest as do the ignorant woman.³¹

Beside, women are forbidden to show their jewelry to others, except those who cannot be hidden like rings, henna, pants and others. In contrast to bracelets, anklets, necklaces, crowns, sashes, earrings, all of which include woman's genitals because they are in term, legs, necks, heads and ears that no one else can see, but may be seen by husband, father, father in law, children, husband's children, brothers, brother's sons, sister's sons, fellow women, slavesm male servants who have no desired of women and children who have not understand genitals.³²

Women are also forbidden to stomp their feet when walking with intention of showing and playing the jewelry it wears that should be hidden. The women often deliberately put something into their anklets to sound when they walk through slowly, to attract attention because some people are sometimes more interested in the distinctive sounds of the things itself, whereas the objects are on their calves. Therefore, at the end of this verse Allah advised that people repent

³⁰Departemen Agama RI, *Al-Quran dan Tafsirnya*...,596.

³¹Departemen Agama RI, *Al-Quran dan Tafsirnya*...,599.

³²Departemen Agama RI, *Al-Quran dan Tafsirnya*...,596-597.

and be conscious and obedient to do His commands and stay away from His prohibition.³³

Based on editorial verse by M. Quraish Shihab explained that the verse forbid a woman to show her ornaments beauty of body to men who are not her husband except the usual appears as face and palm.³⁴

Quraish argued that this case based on the argument cited Quraish from big theologian Tunis M. Thâhir Ibn ‘Asyûr that between one tradition of a nation cannot be forced to apply to other nations. Thâhir gave an example from QS: al-Ahzâb [35]: 59 which told to Muslim women to pay out their veil. The theologians commented that this is a doctrine which tradition of Arabians so other nations who not use veil, do not prevail for them in this stipulation. Then theologian interpreted the QS: al-Ahzâb [35]: 59 it is that “how to use veil has different, depend on the different woman situation and their custom, but the purpose of his command is such as sounds verse that is *that is most convenient, that they should be known (as such) and not molested*.”³⁵

Based on the argument above Quraish concluded that we can say that cover whole body except face and palm running sound the verse, even perhaps excess. However, in the same time, we are not natural stated to them who did not

³³Departemen Agama RI, *Al-Quran dan Tafsirnya*...,597.

³⁴M. Quraish Shihab, *Tafsir al-Misbah*, ..., 256.

³⁵M. Quraish Shihab, *Tafsir al-Misbah*, ..., 533.

wear the veil or reveals some from her hand that they are certainly has violated religious instruction.³⁶

Quraish explained in *Tafsîr al-Lubâb* that this verse emphasized that let women cover their veil to their bosoms and do not reveal the beauty of their body except those already mentioned in other interpreters' interpretations.³⁷

³⁶M. Quraish Shihab, *Tafsîr al-Misbah*, ..., 534.

³⁷M. Quraish Shihab, *Tafsîr al-Lubâb*, ..., 598.