## CHAPTER IV

## REPORT ON RESEARCH RESULT

## A. General Description of Research Location

## 1. Brief Description of SMAN 1 Kotabaru

According to Dokumen KTSP SMAN 1 Kotabaru 2011/2012, SMAN 1
Kotabaru is located at Jl. Berangas Km. 4 No. 39 A Desa Sigam Kecamatan Pulau Laut Utara Kabupaten Kotabaru 72151. This school was built at 1963. The current headmaster is Drs. H. Umar Dani, MM. Previously there were eight headmasters in this school (the list can be seen in the appendices). In the beginning of 1961, the name of this school was SMA Budi Darma and then through SK Number. 39/III/23 Juli 1963 who was signed by MENDIKBUD the school changed as state school at August, 11963.

Now, there are 47 teachers who teach several subjects in this school. The currents numbers of students from the X class to XII class including regular and acceleration classes are 674 students. Acceleration (a class that has designed for 2 years education time) class has been began at 2003 and the school has several qualification for those who wants join the class.

The main purpose of SMAN 1 Kotabaru is producing qualified SMAN 1 Kotabaru graduation academically and non-academically, this vision can be seen in its motto BERPRESTASI. To reach its purpose, so that SMAN 1

Kotabaru always tries to enhance the quality of its students in morality field, academic, and non-academic field.

The subjects that are taught at SMAN 1 consist of 17 subject. The subjects are divided into main subject, self development, and extra-subject. The subjects are: Islamic Education, Civic Education, Bahasa, English Language, Math, Physic, Biology, Chemist, History, Geography, Economy, Sociology, Art, Physically, Sport and Health, Technology and Information, Al-Qur'an Education, and Arabic Language. It will be needed 3 years to graduate from the SMAN 1 Kotabaru. The teachers are come from various educational backgrounds.

As one of the biggest and most favorite school in Kotabaru, SMAN 1 Kotabaru had invited the native speakers to give the course there. They did not really teach, but giving the course for several times. There are two native speakers that has come to this school (the name of the native speakers can be seen in the appendices). The first came at 2009, Ana Clark. She gave a course at SMAN 1 for three months and she come from Australia under the program of PT. Arutmin Kotabaru. Next was Steve Rose, he was there just for one day. He also come from Australia under the program of Ausaid. In almost 50 years the development of the school, SMAN 1 Kotabaru still in the big effort to enhance the quality of its graduation and prepare them to have a good result to come to the higher education.

## 2. Description about Teachers, Staff Administration, and Students Condition.

There are 47 teachers from various educational backgrounds who teach at SMAN 1 Kotabaru, and there are 674 students in academic year 2011/2012. The description of teachers and the students can be seen in appendices.

## 3. The Description of English Teacher of Eleventh Grade at SMAN 1

## Kotabaru

According to the interview, the teacher of English lesson for XI grade at SMAN 1 Kotabaru is Mr. A. He was born on February, 191976 in Hulu Sungai Selatan Regency. He grew up there but then moved to Kotabaru following his parents. He finished his elementary school in SDN Gotong Royong Sungai Raya Hulu Sungai Selatan, and his Junior High School in SMPN Sungai Raya Hulu Sungai Selatan, and Senior High School at SMAN 1 Kandangan Hulu Sungai Selatan. Then, he continued his study to FKIP Bahasa Inggris UNLAM Banjarmasin from 1986 to 1992.

Graduated from FKIP Bahasa Inggris UNLAM, he moved to Kotabaru and taught in several schools. From 1992 to 1994 he taught at M.A Darul Ulum, M.A Guppi, and SMA Muhammadiah Kotabaru. From 1994 to 2002
he came as certified teacher and taught at SMAN 1 Kusan Hilir, then at 2002 he moved to SMAN 1 Kotabaru until now.

During his career as an English teacher, he had some achievements. He had ever gone to the some countries such as Korea, and Australia as an ambassador of English program. Therefore, he always advises his students to keep their health when they are studying.

In his instruction, Mr. A always encourages his students to be brave in using English, no matter mistake they make. Though, according to him, that he did not really know what Communicative Language Teaching is. He just tries to make his instruction alive with communication and lets the students communicate in English while his teaching. The knowledge of Communicative Language Teaching he had got from his education in university and from some teaching seminar.

His effort in the classroom to make his students using English can be seen from his action itself and from the techniques he used. He often did several techniques in his class. From what he did in the classroom, he got various responses from his class about his teaching. Most of the classes totally have a great learning during his instruction through CLT, but it can be denied in some classes even not all students in the class, showed his interest in that lesson. For these students, they have less response in English. Facing this problem, Mr. A is trying to solve the problem by asking his students to prepare and has an English club with their students. Those who are able and
good in English become the tutor for their friends who are not. He also helps their student directly in the classroom. He treats them by doing some activities such as reading or answering the question in order to obtain their understanding.

As an English teacher, he did not have specific methods in his instruction. He just follows the material and did the appropriate way to teach that material. But still the focus is to let the students able in communicating English language. In harmony with his goals in teaching that he wants his students be able in English written and orally. Considering that the purpose of teaching learning English in senior high school mostly focused in reading text (genre of the text), that is way Mr. A desires his students master in written English and did not ignore the oral part too.

In his class, he tries to be as communicative as possible in his teaching methods-this always improves as he got to know his students and their life experiences better. He can better plan classes that relate to their backgrounds and interests and can ask for their feedback. He believes being a teacher is very strong and it is shown in her answer when the writer interviewed him.

According to Mr. A, teaching is learning by doing. By teaching, he is learning, learn to know deeply his students, learn the material he does not know, and learn the English itself. Teaching is fun and brings new things. He is happy meet new students in every semester in his school or face the new
experience with English, such as when he was in another country. He likes teaching in his whole life and will teach as he can.
B. Data Presentation

## 1. The Effectiveness of Communicative Language Teaching Approach that is Applied in the Instruction at Eleventh Grade of SMAN 1 Kotabaru

On this data presentation, before the writer concerns to the effectiveness of communicative language teaching approach that is applied, firstly the writer describes some data from Communicative Language Teaching class that is applied by Mr. A as an English teacher to the eleventh grade of SMAN 1 Kotabaru academic year 2011/2012. It is needed to find out the result of the effectiveness. It also describes the students' response regarding the CLT that is applied in the classroom. The writer did the observation from September, 192011 to October, 8 2011.

## a. The Techniques and Methods through Communicative Language Teaching Class That Is Used by the Teacher.

To know the activities through Communicative Language Teaching class that is applied by Mr. A in his instruction of eleventh grade students of SMAN 1 Kotabaru academic year 2011/2012, the writer observes the teaching and learning process in eighteen class meetings for class XI IPA 1, 2, 3, XI IPS 1, 2, and Acceleration 2 (third time in every class).

The table of observation schedule can be seen in the appendices
1). General Greeting

According to the writer' observation in his class, Mr. A did this activity in every class he taught. He opened his teaching learning process by general greeting such as, say "Assalamualaikum", asking the students life and sharing his life or his experiences or something wise to give the motivation to the students in their learning.
2). Telling the Objective of the Lesson to the Students

During the observation, it showed that this technique is always used by Mr. A in his class. By doing this technique he helped his students to be aware to what they were going to be learnt in that time and helped them to obtain what he expect to them. This
technique also to ease him to keep in the line of the lesson plan he made, and to arrange the time well.
3). Starter

This technique did not be missed by Mr. A in his instruction. Before he came to the main material of the lesson his starter usually asks the students the question that still linked with the material. This question promoted the higher thinking of the students and aware them about the material.

## 4). Listening Activity

This application was quite often used. Several times in his class he did this activity. He used this if the material of the lesson he thinks necessary to be added reinforcement in listening for students understanding. Listening was also used by him to raise the class' circumstance when the students looked tired or bored. He played the song in the middle of the class while students were doing their task, and they felt enjoy with that.
5). Reading Activity

This technique was also quite often used. He gave the students a text from another source or students' book, and then asked them to read a sentence one by one. He involved all the
students in the class, and that gave a chance for all students improved their reading.
6). Writing Activity

Since the goal of Mr. A teaching is able student in written and oral English, so that he involved the writing activity in his teaching. Started from the easy one to the harder one. Most of his task was also done by the writing activities. He asked his students to write a sentence, dialog or paragraph in the class or for homework. The students will show their result in front of the class.
7). Information Gap

As one of the parts in Communicative Language Teaching is communicating in the target language in order to share the information and it is what presented as information gap activity in the classroom. Based on the writer' observation, that Mr. A applied this activity in twelve times. It means in many of observation class meeting times.
8). Role Play

The purpose of this activity was where the students pretended as someone else they perform, and did what they had to do according to the role play activity. The action such as, pretended as the person in the story or dialog which the teacher gave to them and
played the story in front of the class. Considering the time, that is way this activity only did in three-observed-class in his teaching.
9). Pair Work

This activity is one of a very communicative activity. Mr. A liked to apply this activity since according to him, it gave every students opportunity to talk and be active. When he taught, he often asked the students to find out the difficult word or discussing the part of reading text, and he asked his students to do it in pair. Mr. A thought that it will minimize the time and to ease the students. He used this technique in eleventh-observed-class meetings.
10). Group Work

Group-work as a communicative activity also leads the students to communicate and share their ideas in to his group. This activity was applied by Mr. A 4 times in his eighteen-observedclass meetings. He controlled the students while they were working and make sure that all the members involved in the task.

## 11). Survey

To enhance the students' knowledge and broaden their English, Mr. A also asked them to do a little survey from internet, and browsed the information they needed. The benefit for Mr. A was to ease him in his teaching; he did not take a long time to
explain the material because the students have already known it from their survey work. However, this activity was only done one time, but made progress for the students.

## 12). Learning by Teaching

When some of his students in his class understood well the lesson while other students did not look really understand, he requested the student who understood the lesson re-explain the lesson. This technique was not only let the students practiced their language, but also helped him to help student understand better. He applied this technique 8 times.

## 13). Presentation

Mr. A tries to facilitate his students to use the media in the classroom, and let him gave the material using presentation. This activity was effective way to engage the students while learning and introduced them how to make the presentation, because later they will do the same for their friends. Mr. A did it one time in eighteen-observed-meetings.

## 14). Ignoring Errors of Grammar

This is the significant part of Communicative Language Teaching where the mistake of grammar while communicating in the target language is denied. In communicative method the
students are requested to practice the target language to communicate. Since English is not their native language, they make mistakes many times. Although grammar is very important, based on my observation, he seldom checking students' grammar because it would make students shy to communicate. Instead of that, he just ignored the grammatical errors of the students but gave the students the lesson of grammar in the rest of the time in the classroom, and he did it fourteen times.
15). Authentic Material.

Bringing the authentic material in the classroom as the material of the lesson was the part of CLT too. Mr. A did this activity in order to gain the outcome maximally from the students, because the material that was related to their real life will gain the focus of the students. The authentic materials such as song, reading text, information from internet, or movie. He did it ten times.
16). Media

The maximal use of media will influence the instruction and attract students to have more focused. That is Mr. A usually did. He brought the media to the classroom and taught them using the media. It could be note book, song, LCD for presentation, and handouts. He did it in ten-observed-meetings.

## 17). Another Source

Besides using the English book, Mr. A also used the material from another source book or from internet. This application was to enrich the material of his teaching. He used it three times.
18). Question and Answer

This activity is aimed to take the students understanding of the materials. He asked them which part of the material they did not understand and then respond the question appropriately. He did it in every observed-class.
19). Using the Target Language

The teacher used the English language as the target language in the instruction to usual the students hear the language. Yet, he did not use it for whole time instruction, he used switch-language both English and Indonesia. He did it in eighteen-observed meetings.

This following table will show the frequency the data about the applied techniques and method in Communicative Language Teaching observed-class at eleventh grade students of SMAN 1 Kotabaru academic year 2011/201

Table 4. 1. The Techniques and Methods that Is Applied in CLT Class of SMAN 1 Kotabaru

| $\mathbf{N}$ | ACTIVITY | MEETINGS / CLASS |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $\mathbf{O}$ |  | $\mathbf{1}$ | $\mathbf{2}$ | $\mathbf{3}$ | $\mathbf{4}$ | $\mathbf{5}$ | $\mathbf{6}$ |  |


|  |  | A |  |  | B |  |  | C |  |  | D |  |  | E |  |  | F |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | General greeting | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\sqrt{ }$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\sqrt{ }$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ |
| 2 | Telling objectives | $\sqrt{ }$ | $\sqrt{ }$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ |
| 3 | Starter | $\sqrt{ }$ | $\sqrt{ }$ | $\sqrt{ }$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\sqrt{ }$ | $\sqrt{ }$ | $\checkmark$ | $\sqrt{ }$ | $\sqrt{ }$ | $\checkmark$ | $\sqrt{ }$ | $\sqrt{ }$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\sqrt{ }$ | $\checkmark$ | $\sqrt{ }$ |
| 4 | Listening activity | $\sqrt{ }$ |  |  | $\checkmark$ |  |  | $\checkmark$ |  |  | $\checkmark$ |  |  | $\checkmark$ |  |  | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ |  |
| 5 | Reading activity | $\checkmark$ |  | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\sqrt{ }$ |  |  |  | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ |  | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ |  |  | $\sqrt{ }$ |
| 6 | Writing activity |  |  | $\checkmark$ |  | $\checkmark$ |  |  |  | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ |  |  |  |  |  |  | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ |
| 7 | Information gap | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\sqrt{ }$ |  | $\checkmark$ | $\sqrt{ }$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ |  | $\checkmark$ |  |  | $\checkmark$ |  |  | $\sqrt{ }$ | $\checkmark$ | , |
| 8 | Role play |  |  | $\checkmark$ |  |  | $\checkmark$ |  |  |  | $\checkmark$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 9 | Pair work |  | $\sqrt{ }$ | $\sqrt{ }$ |  | $\sqrt{ }$ | $\sqrt{ }$ |  | $\checkmark$ |  |  | $\checkmark$ | $\sqrt{ }$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ |  | $\sqrt{ }$ | $\checkmark$ |  |
| 10 | Group work |  |  | $\checkmark$ |  |  |  |  |  | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ |  |  |  |  |  |  | $\checkmark$ |  |
| 11 | Survey |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | $\checkmark$ |  |
| 12 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Learning } \quad \text { by } \\ & \text { teaching } \end{aligned}$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ |  |  | $\checkmark$ |  | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ |  |  | $\checkmark$ |  |  |  |  | $\checkmark$ |  | $\checkmark$ |
| 13 | Presentation |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | $\checkmark$ |  |
| 14 | Ignoring error of grammar | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ |  | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ |  | $\checkmark$ |  | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ |  | $\checkmark$ | $\sqrt{ }$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ |
| 15 | Authentic material | $\sqrt{ }$ | $\sqrt{ }$ |  | $\sqrt{ }$ | $\sqrt{ }$ |  | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ |  | $\checkmark$ |  |  | $\checkmark$ |  |  | $\sqrt{ }$ | $\checkmark$ |  |
| 16 | Media | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ |  | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ |  | $\checkmark$ | $\sqrt{ }$ |  | $\checkmark$ |  |  | $\checkmark$ |  |  | $\sqrt{ }$ | $\checkmark$ |  |
| 17 | Another source | $\checkmark$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ |  |
| 18 | Question and answer | $\checkmark$ | $\sqrt{ }$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\sqrt{ }$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\sqrt{ }$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ |
| 19 | Using the target language | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ |  | $\sqrt{ }$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ |  | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ | $\sqrt{ }$ | $\checkmark$ | $\checkmark$ |

## b. The Data of Observation Class toward The CLT that Is Applied

During the observation times, beside the field note the writers used the criteria of observation sheet too. In this sheet, there are some categories which have to be filled by the writer based on the teacher act while observation class. Each category has point from 1 to 5,
where 1 is very poor, 2 is poor, 3 is average, 4 is good, and 5 is very good.

The data of observation class and the point based on teacher' act will be shown as follow:
1). The teacher clearly informed objective of the lesson at the beginning to the students

As the writers mention above, the teacher used this technique in eighteen-observed-meeting. Twelve times got 5 point, and six times got 4 point.
2). The teachers review the lesson at the end

Mr. A used this technique in eighteen-observed-meetings. Five times got 5 point, and thirteen times got 4 point.
3). The teachers were ready with the preparation of the materials

In every instruction, Mr. A prepared his material before he taught. Nine times got 5 point, and nine times got 4 point.
4). The teachers have good structure to lesson use from starter to follow up

Every instruction has to structuralize in order to prevent the material out of line. In all the observed-meetings four times got 5 point, and fourteen got 4 point.
5). Instruction/explanations are clear and specific

In order to give an understanding to his students, Mr. A explained the material in every his instruction. Eleventh times got 5 point, and seven times got 4 point.
6). The teachers involve all pupils in the instruction

This technique is one of the CLT ways to practice the students speaking and to get the students attention. Eighteen times got 5 point.
7). The teachers listen pupils and respond appropriately

It is also necessary to know the students problem about the material, Mr. A listened them and responded the problems. Fourteen times got 5 point, and four times got 4 point.
8). The teachers engaged the pupils

To have good result of the students understanding, Mr. A tried to engage the pupils in line. Fourteen times got 5 point, and four times got 4 point.
9). The effort of the teachers in their instruction, accuracy, and presentation encourage

These techniques were used to stabilize the instruction while he taught and to stabilize the students' attention. Seven times got 5 point, and eleventh times got 4 point.
10). The teachers use authentic materials for instruction

In eighteen-observed-meetings, Mr. A used authentic materials in ten times. Six times got 5 point, and four times got 4 point.
11). The teachers use some resources

There are three-observed-meetings where Mr. A used some resources, and got 5 point.
12). Regular and appropriate praise given for good effort and achievement

This is an important technique for the teacher, when his students showed the good effort and achievement in the class, the teacher gave an appropriate praise for them. Mr. A did it in every his instruction. Eleventh times got 5 point, and seven times got 4 point.
13). Prompt action to address poor behavior

To prevent the class from the students who did not act in good manner, Mr. A gave them the direct punishment. Seven times got 5 point, and eleventh times got 4 point.
14). Good use of presence/voice to promote/maintain good working atmosphere

The stabilization and good use of voice is significant to maintain the instruction's circumstance. Three times got 5 point and fifteen times got 4 point.
15). Understanding assessed throughout lesson by use of strategies that involve all pupils; teacher's question or self and peer assessment

Mr. A mostly used these techniques in his instruction to gain the students' understanding and to assess them. He used peer and self assessment in eleventh times; seven times got 5 point, and four times got 4 point. He used teacher's questioning in eighteen-observed-meetings, four times got 5 point, and fourteen times got 4 point.
16). Pupils fully engaged throughout lesson and make progress

It can be seen in the last of the instruction and after the material task which was the teacher gave. Six times got 5 point, eleventh times got 4 point, and one time got 3 point.
17). Pupils understand what is expected to them

After the instruction, the teacher used the assessment to make sure they knew and understood what was expected to them. Seven times got 5 point, and eleventh times got 4 point.
18). The teachers and pupils work at good pace

It is important for teacher and the students work in good pace while the instruction, in order to reach the objectives. Thirteen times got 5 point, four times got 4 point, and one times got 3 point.
19). Time well utilized

Managing the time well while teaching is necessary to make sure the lesson plan the teacher made work well. Four times got 5 point, and thirteen times got 4 point.
20). Learning maintain for full time

It means that while the instruction the teacher and the students were in the learning circumstance or not out of the line of the instruction field. Ten times got 5 point, and eight times got 4 point.
21). Appropriate learning resources used

Learning resources is needed to support the material at teaching time, and the teacher had to use appropriate resources for that. Fourteen times got 5 point, and four times got 4 times.

The data of observation class report toward CLT that is applied in the classroom will show in this following table:

Table 4. 2. The Data of Observation Class Report

| $\begin{aligned} & \mathbf{N} \\ & \mathbf{O} \end{aligned}$ | DATA | MEETINGS / CLASS |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | 1 |  |  | 2 |  |  | 3 |  |  | 4 |  |  | 5 |  |  | 6 |  |  |
|  |  | A |  |  | B |  |  | C |  |  | D |  |  | E |  |  | F |  |  |
| 1 | The clearly informed objective of the lesson at the beginning to the students | 5 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 5 |
| 2 | The teachers review the lesson at the end | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 |
| 3 | The teachers are ready with the preparation of the materials | 5 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 5 |
| 4 | The teachers <br> have good <br> structure to <br> lesson use <br> starter  <br> up  <br> up  | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 5 |
| 5 | Instruction/expla nations are clear and specific | 4 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 5 |
| 6 | The teachers involve all pupils in the instruction | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 |
| 7 | The teachers listen pupils and respond | 5 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 4 |


|  | appropriately |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 8 | $\begin{array}{\|l} \hline \text { The teachers } \\ \text { engaged the } \\ \text { pupils } \end{array}$ | 4 | 5 |  | 5 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 5 |  |  | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 |
| 9 | The effort of the teachers in their instruction, accuracy, and presentation encourage | 4 | 4 |  | 5 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 5 |  |  | 4 | 4 | 5 | 5 |
| 10 | The teachers use authentic materials for instruction | 5 | 5 |  |  | 4 | 5 |  | 4 | 4 |  | 4 |  |  | 5 |  |  |  | 5 | 5 |  |
| 11 | The teachers use some resources | 5 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 5 | 5 |  |
| 12 | Regular and appropriate praise given for good effort and achievement | 5 | 5 |  | 5 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 4 |  |  | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 |
| 13 | Prompt action to address poor behavior | 4 | 5 |  | 4 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 5 |  |  | 4 | 5 | 5 | 4 |
| 14 | Good use of presence/voice to promote/maintai n good working atmosphere | 4 | 4 |  | 5 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 |  |  | 4 | 5 | 4 | 5 |
| 15 | Understanding assessed throughout lesson by use of strategies that involve all pupils; teacher's question or self and peer assessment | 4 | $4$ |  |  | $4$ | $\begin{aligned} & 4 \\ & 4 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $5$ |  | $\begin{aligned} & 5 \\ & 4 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | $\begin{aligned} & 5 \\ & , \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | 5 | $\begin{array}{\|l} 5 \\ 5 \\ 5 \end{array}$ | 5 <br> 5 |
| 16 | Pupils fully  <br> engaged  <br> throughout  <br> lesson and  <br> progress  | 5 | 4 |  | 3 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 |  |  | 4 | 5 | 4 | 5 |
| 17 | Pupils understand what | 5 | 4 |  | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 |  | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 5 |


|  | is expected to <br> them |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 18 | The teachers and <br> pupils work at <br> good pace | 4 | 4 | 3 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 4 |
| 19 | Time well <br> utilized | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 5 |
| 20 | Learning <br> maintain for full <br> time | 4 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 5 |
| 21 | Appropriate <br> learning <br> resources used | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 5 |

## c. The Result Score of Students' Oral Test

To complete the data about the effectiveness of Communicative Language Teaching, the writer also took the oral test for students. The test was asking the students several general questions and scores them with particular criteria. The score will be shown in this following table:

The table can be seen in the appendices

After having all result, the writer got the mean of the oral test result score as follows:

$$
\begin{aligned}
& M=\frac{F}{N} \times 100 \\
& M=1997 \times 100
\end{aligned}
$$

$$
=6656.6667
$$

$$
=6.656
$$

So, the mean of the oral test result is 6.656

## 2. The Eleventh Grade Students' Response Regarding Communicative Language Teaching Approach that Is Applied

To know students' response regarding Communicative Language Teaching that is applied, the writer gave the students a questionnaire which consists of several questions that identifies students' feeling and response regarding Communicative Language Teaching that is applied by Mr. A in his instruction. The responses of the questions are from 1 to 5 that
represent; $1=$ very disagree, $2=$ disagree, $3=$ average, $4=$ agree, $5=$ very agree. The result of the questionnaire can be seen through these tables.

For making it is easy to present and understand, the writer changes the category words: $1=$ very disagree to dislike very much, $2=$ disagree to dislike, $3=$ average to average, $4=$ agree to like, and $5=$ very agree to like very much. It is also done to make data suitable in this data presentation.

Table 4. 3. The Students' Response about Repeating an English Conversation after Their Teacher

| No | Category | Frequency | Percentage |
| :---: | :--- | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Like very much | 32 | $18.7 \%$ |
| 2 | Like | 52 | $30.4 \%$ |
| 3 | Average | 76 | $44.5 \%$ |
| 4 | Dislike | 11 | $6.4 \%$ |
| 5 | Dislike very much | 0 | 0 |
| Total |  | $\mathbf{1 7 1}$ | $\mathbf{1 0 0} \%$ |

The table above indicates that the students who stated like very much repeating an English conversation after their teacher are 32 students (18.7\%), there are 52 ( $30.4 \%$ ) students who stated that they are like, 76 (44.5\%) students stated in average, 11 (6.4\%) students dislike, and there is no students( $0 \%$ ) who stated dislike the method.

Table 4. 4. The Students' Response about Their Interest in English Lesson Because They Can Practice Communication.

| No | Category | Frequency | Percentage |
| :---: | :--- | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Like very much | 38 | $22.2 \%$ |
| 2 | Like | 83 | $48.5 \%$ |


| 3 | Average | 33 | $19.3 \%$ |
| :---: | :--- | :---: | :---: |
| 4 | Dislike | 15 | $8.8 \%$ |
| 5 | Dislike very much | 2 | $1.2 \%$ |
| Total |  | $\mathbf{1 7 1}$ | $\mathbf{1 0 0} \%$ |

The table above indicates things that the students like very much in English lesson because they can practice communication are 38 (22.2\%) students, there are 83 (48.5\%) students who like, 33 (19.3) students in average, 15 ( $8.8 \%$ ) student dislike, and 2 (1.2\%) students stated do not like very much.

Table 4. 5. The Students' Response about Communicating in English During The Instruction

| No | Category | Frequency | Percentage |
| :---: | :--- | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Like very much | 26 | $15.2 \%$ |
| 2 | Like | 74 | $43.3 \%$ |
| 3 | Average | 44 | $25.7 \%$ |
| 4 | Dislike | 23 | $13.5 \%$ |
| 5 | Dislike very much | 4 | $2.3 \%$ |
| Total |  | $\mathbf{1 7 1}$ | $\mathbf{1 0 0 \%}$ |

The table above indicates the student response about communicating in English language during the instruction. 26 (15.2\%) students like very much, 74 (43.3\%) students stated they like, there are 44 (25.7\%) students in average, 23 (13.5\%) students dislike the activity, and 4 (2.3\%) student dislike it very much.

Table 4. 6. The Students' Response about Communicating in English During English Lesson, Therefore They Can Practice with Their Friends

| No | Category | Frequency | Percentage |
| :---: | :--- | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Like very much | 31 | $18.1 \%$ |
| 2 | Like | 59 | $34.5 \%$ |
| 3 | Average | 58 | $33.9 \%$ |
| 4 | Dislike | 18 | $10.5 \%$ |
| 5 | Dislike very much | 5 | $2.9 \%$ |
| Total |  | $\mathbf{1 7 1}$ | $\mathbf{1 0 0 \%}$ |

The table above stated the response of the students about communicating in English language at classroom during the lesson that is built by their teacher, so they can practice English with their friends. There are 31 ( $18.1 \%$ ) students like it very much, 59 (34.5\%) students state like it, 58 (33.9\%) students in average, 18 (10.5\%) students dislike it, and 5 ( $2.9 \%$ ) students dislike it very much.

Table 4. 7. The Students' Response about Their Interest in English, Because The Focus of English Lesson in Their School Is Communication and Grammar If Needed

| No | Category | Frequency | Percentage |
| :---: | :--- | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Like very much | 21 | $12.3 \%$ |
| 2 | Like | 58 | $33.9 \%$ |
| 3 | Average | 53 | $30.9 \%$ |
| 4 | Dislike | 37 | $21.6 \%$ |
| 5 | Dislike very much | 2 | $1.7 \%$ |
| Total |  | $\mathbf{1 7 1}$ | $\mathbf{1 0 0 \%}$ |

The table above indicates the response of the students about their interest in English because of the focus of English lesson at their school is communication and the lesson of grammar if needed or in part
of communication lesson. There are $21(12.3 \%)$ students state like it very much, 58 ( $33.9 \%$ ) students like it, 53 ( $30.9 \%$ ) students are in average, 37 ( $31.6 \%$ ) students dislike it, and 2 (1.7\%) students dislike it very much.

Table 4. 8. The Student's Response Whether They Like or Don't When Their Teacher Creates The Circumstance Where They Can Practice Their English in The Classroom during The Instruction

| No | Category | Frequency | Percentage |
| :---: | :--- | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Like very much | 62 | $36.2 \%$ |
| 2 | Like | 55 | $32.2 \%$ |
| 3 | Average | 40 | $23.4 \%$ |
| 4 | Dislike | 11 | $6.4 \%$ |
| 5 | Dislike very much | 3 | $1.8 \%$ |
| Total |  | $\mathbf{1 7 1}$ | $\mathbf{1 0 0} \%$ |

The table above indicates the students' response whether they like or don't when their teacher creates the circumstance where they can practice their English in the classroom during the instruction. 62 (36.2\%) students like it very much, 55 (32.2\%) students like, 40 (23.4\%) students are in average, 11 (6.4\%) students dislike, and 3 (1.8\%) students dislike it very much.

## C. Data Analysis

After all the obtained data are presented, they are also needed to be analyzed. The analysis is based on the order of the issues that have been introduced earlier in this study.

## 1. The Effectiveness of Communicative Language Teaching Approach that is Applied in the Instruction at Eleventh Grade of SMAN 1

## Kotabaru

## a. The Techniques and Methods through Communicative Language Teaching Class That Is Used by the Teacher.

1). General Greeting.

This can be said as Mr. A habit. He always opened his class with saying greeting. He said "Assalamualaikum", and if there was a non-Muslim student in his class, he added the greeting with "Salam Sejahtera". The students answered his greeting, and if he considered that the students did not have spirit yet, he will rewind his greeting until the student answered it in loud voice. He thought that the loudly voice in the first condition before teaching will raise the students' spirit for the instruction that will be going on, and to make the instruction enjoyable for them. Then, he asked the students life, if he saw any wrong with his students, he
directly asked them what was happening. To keep their spirit, he liked to tell them something wise or just sharing the experience of life. The purpose was to give motivation for the students in their learning or life.

## 2). Telling the Objective of the Lesson to the Students

After doing the general greeting. Mr. A will tell the objective of the lesson in that meeting. Previously, he will ask the students whether they have studied the material or haven't. If none in the class study the material before, he will tell the theme and the objective. If there was a student has studied it before, he permitted his/her to tell what they are going to study for whole class. He always used this technique in his class. Since the function of this technique is as guidance of teaching and learning process, then the class meeting became structured and proper time used, because the objective always guided the activities. He did this techniques in every his class.
3). Starter

Starter is the beginning activity in teaching that activates the learner's minds and gets them thinking. They can then approach the text in an active frame of mind. It also arouses the learners' interest in the topic. Before Mr. A taught the main material of the lesson in that day, he usually began the instruction with general thought and
asked them the question that linked to the material or asked them to share the opinion, and the students will answer his question using their own knowledge and used the target language. Mr. A will permit 3 to 4 students to tell their idea. He encouraged every student to do so, and let non-active students to share their idea too. Some students looked shy to speak up, but then Mr. A convinced them that they didn't have to worry in sharing idea. After the students shared their idea, Mr. A will discuss it in a moment with whole class. By doing this activity the students will aware about the material they are going to learn and also promote their higher other thinking.

## 4). Listening Activity

This activity was used seven-observed-meetings. It is used for the material which was considered need to use listening material. Once for XI science classes and social classes, twice for Acceleration class. Mr. A used his notebook as the source of listening material, and brought the little sounds stuff to loud the voice and be heard in whole class. In four classes, the theme of the lesson is "Giving Opinion". In the first, Mr. A listened his students a song, after that, he asked them to give their opinion about that song. From that activity, Mr. A then explained the material to his students. In two classes, the theme of the lesson is "Text Genre". The topic of text genre was Report text entitled "Leopard". The
listening material helped the students to hear the reading text, instead they also saw the text in their own, and listening material was also used to listen the students several question that they have to answer. In acceleration class, listening material was used for presentation. Mr. A showed power point material to the students and there was also voice to support the reading text. In several times, not only for teaching material, but also Mr. A could play the song in the middle of his instruction when he looked his students were getting tired or sleepy or bored. It was usually western song entitled "Broken Hearted Girl by Beyonce" or "Just The Way You Are by Bruno Mars". Songs to accompany them did their task will enjoy the students and hopefully make their feeling happy. The teacher taught the listening several times in a month for every class and depends on the material.

## 5). Reading Activity

This activity was done eleventh-observed-meetings. Mr. A included reading activity especially for reading theme such as "Genre Text", where the students acquired to read the material. All the students involved in, Mr. A gave all students opportunity to read the text. The text can be both from students' book or hand out from another source. He usually asked every student to read a sentence of the paragraph. After that, he and the students discussed some difficult words. After he sure that the students solved the hard
vocabulary, he let the students translated the text by their selves and corrected it if there was a mistake. Mr. A will ask the students read it twice if the student's voice not loud and whole class did not hear it. This was used to practice the students' reading and also speaking in the classroom. Reading activity usually taught more than one time in a week, it can be twice or more depend on the material that was taught.
6). Writing Activity

As the writer states above that one of the Mr. A goal of his teaching is able students in written. By doing so, he practices and checks several field of English such as grammar and comprehend from his students. Writing activity was most as a task. After explaining the material of "Giving Opinion", Mr. A asked his students to make a paragraph or dialog, and then they will perform in front of class. Every student has an opportunity, no one leaves. The students had various actions through this activity. Some were easily and confidently performing their product without brought the book or looked the note while some others didn't. However, this activity was just done merely six-observed-meetings. Some of them were done in the classroom, and some as homework. For homework, the teacher asked the students to compose a topic "The Country I want To Visit" or dialog with free topic. This activity
could be done twice in a week depends on the material in the classrooms.

## 7). Information Gap

Information gap is used to share information from those who know to those who don't. Mr. A did this technique in his classroom as for practice the speaking and for sharing the information. It can be done in the pre activity or while activity. As James Robb explains that provide an opportunity for extended speaking practice, they represent real communication, motivation can be high, and they require sub-skills such as clarifying meaning and rephrasing. When the instruction was going on and Mr. A explained the material, he could also explained another information that related to the material, and then he can asked to the students about the material or about another information as well. Mostly 1 to 2 students knew the answer of the question. Mr. A will permit him/her to speak and tell the info for his/her friends in the classroom. It also can be done in collaborative learning where one student act giving information to his/her friends in the group, and share the knowledge to another group. So, they exchange the knowledge in language classroom. This activity worked well, because the students could practice communication in English language and they could get information they did not posses. Each classes has different frequency for the students who most as
information giver. For example, in acceleration class or science class a half of class can be as information giver, in the other hand in social class only 1 or 2 students dare to speak and share the knowledge. Mr. A needed hard work for these social classes. Eventually, the information gap activity looked work well in some class and quite fall in some.

## 8). Role Play

Based on the writer's observation role play was done in three-observed-meetings. This technique could not offer too often in the classroom because of the limitation of the time and the understanding of the material. Role play is where the students pretend as someone else and do what they obligate to do. It was needed much time to prepare and readiness of the students. Previously, Mr. A gave the material to the students such a dialog within a story, and chose who will play it. The chosen students will study it and perform in the next meeting. It also can be done directly in the classroom, Mr. A spread the material and chose the students, and then they will play it in front of class bringing the paper of the dialog. The students could make their own as well. Mr. A divided the students in several group and they made their own story, and then performed it. To stay in good class-condition while they were playing the role, Mr. A tried to make his students to pay attention to the activity. The role players always got praise and
applause from the whole class after their performance, and it helped them keeping their anxiety and the class in good circumstance. The students were playing the role as it was written in the story or dialog. For instance, the story about visiting country or the free dialog they have made based on topic "Relative Pronoun".

## 9). Pair Work

According to theory that this activity is aimed to increase the opportunities for learners to use English in the class with their friends and or even to the teacher. It is also to increase the opportunities for learners to use English in the class. Usually, Mr. A asked his students to work in pairs before having the main material, for example in the lesson "Genre Text". Before reading the text, he gave the students difficult vocabulary in the text and he asked them to translate it with their partner. According to him, it was purposed to save the time; two of them will do faster than alone. While one student was working one vocabulary, his/her partner was also working for another vocabulary. This activity was applied in eleventh-observed-meetings. In acceleration class, pair work happened to translate not only vocabulary, but also the reading text.
10). Group Work

Besides pair work, group work was applied in the classroom but rarely used only four-observed-meetings. Based on the theory as many teachers have discovered, group work can be a very rewarding and revealing technique in the classroom. Some advantages such as, the enjoyment that offered by group work and encourage. In Mr. A classes, it could be happened for role play work, where Mr. A divided the class in several groups to perform the task, and or happened for doing discussion and dialog. As same as pair work, it was aimed to give the opportunity to the students to communicate in English with their friend and or the teacher. Mr. A will genuinely ask his students to use English while doing the task. In discussion task, they usually discussed about the part inside the text they have learned such as type of the genre, the main idea, the grammar which was used, and the theme. After that, the representative will tell their group discussion result in the classroom and discussed together in whole class. For dialog group, they will perform their product in front of class, they may bring the note or no. the group usually consisted of four students.
11). Survey

Survey looked the rarest technique that was used in this instruction, only one time. It was because that survey was not an easy technique to apply. Even in this case, not really doing a survey like in real life. The students were asked by Mr. A to find some
information from internet related to the material, the information was about "The advantages and disadvantages of using electronic gadget in the classroom". Once, they were asked to find the information of Genre Text before they learnt it. They conduct a little research about a case and look for the info from internet. They will present their result at the end. This technique was only done at acceleration class. Mr. A considered the ability of the students, but it is not impossible to apply this technique in another class as well. This application is actually new for senior high students especially in this school. They felt that this was quite hard and didn't really understand what they have to do. Even so, Mr. A convinced them that this task is reasonable for them; to prepare them in higher task at higher education, and broaden their knowledge. They did it in pairs. Mr. A said that internet media will ease their work. The result was in average. Some pairs groups did well, while some others needed hard work.

## 12). Learning by Teaching

From the result of observation, the teacher used this procedure; he used 8 times in fourteen-class meetings of his class. Learning by teaching allows pupils and students to prepare and to teach lessons, or parts of lessons so that they understand better the lesson and help their friends to understand too. In this part, he asked one or two students to re-explain the lesson to their friends if
there were students who didn't understand the lesson yet. In another change, he also asked his students to have five friends group and study hard about one topic then explain it to the class. In line with the theory that learning by teaching allows pupils and students to prepare and to teach lessons, or parts of lessons.

## 13). Presentation

As same as survey, presentation was only done one-observedmeeting. The media that supported doing the presentation such as LCD, sounds, and the boars are only available in acceleration class, so that this application done in that class. First, Mr. A presented the material in that time using power point video and sound, the class looked interest and fully engaged. After the teacher ended the presentation, and the students did the task. Next, the students presented their survey result. They had various ways to present; using power point, telling in front of class, or just read the result from a note. So far, they had good work in it, but some needed improvement in doing this particular task. The good point was the students are brave to do so even they were often making mistake or ungrammatically when they were speaking. The class was still in good pace.
14). Ignoring the Grammatical Error

From the result of observation, the teacher often used this procedure; it was 14 times in eighteen-class meetings. Although
grammar is very important, but the teacher didn't need to check the students' grammar since it will make students shy to practice their language because they are afraid of making mistakes. In another times he will teach a little bit about grammar in the rest of the time, and correct the students' grammar and he gave the example of the right one. The lesson of grammar was mostly about tenses; simple present tense, simple past tense, simple continues tense, simple perfect tense and simple future tense. As Diane states that the teacher might make note of their errors to be worked on at a later time during more accuracy-based activities. He often gave the example of pronunciation from the words and how they should places in the sentence. For instance, to pronounce "gh" sound that is read as " f ". Example, "tough, rough, laugh, enough", and it has done by drilling. He advised his students to often open the dictionary in order to find the right pronunciation and learn the grammatical books.
15). Authentic Material

In ten-observed-meeting, Mr. A brought authentic materials to the classroom. The use of authentic material also provides the students good and proper sample of the use of language. The teacher used cartoon movie entitled "Ice Age", western song entitled "Broken Hearted Girl or Just The Way You Are" and some report texts from native writers. In many times Mr. A took the text
from internet, so then text in kind of real communication used by native speakers. Through this material the students felt enjoy in the class, such as the song or movie. It gave new experiences for them when learning a language. As the writer describe above, the use of songs are usually in the "expression lesson" or the lesson that acquire listening material. Movie was showing by LCD through the teacher's file in notebook. It used in acceleration class, to promote the students' speaking and listening skill by asked them pay attention with the plot or the characters. Even so, they were not watching whole movie, just a part of the movie, and mostly cartoons. This technique always can engage the students' attention. 16). Media

As state by Yunus that teaching media is devices that teachers should use in their teaching learning process to help teachers make their instruction enjoyable, fun, and easy. As well as for reinforcing teaching learning process. From the result of observation, the teacher used this procedure 10 times in fourteenclass meetings. The teacher used hand-out, LCD, notebook, song, movie and sound. Those Medias helped him very much, because the materials then could be fun and interesting if they were presented trough appropriate media. As it was explained above, these media used in the instruction to ease the instruction and got more focused from the students.
17). Another Source

This is used in three-observed-meeting. Besides from students' book, the teacher also used material from another source, like internet. He brought the reading text from internet and copy for the students. This was can be used to reduce the boredom of the students from their text on their books. They were having new story to read and retell instead of from the books. The text that the teacher brought was fairy tale and report.
18). Question and Answer

From the observation result, the teacher always did this activity. He did it to obtain his students understanding from the material. After explaining the material or in the middle of its activity, he will ask his students whether they understand or didn't about the material. He will ask which part that they didn't understand yet, and some students asked him about the material and then he responded the question appropriately. The teacher also used this technique to make the student aware of their job in the class that they must pay attention to the subject and understand. It also let the students practice more their target language. This also happened in discussion among students-students. When they didn't understand what they have to do, they asked the teacher to clear it.

Based on the observation result that in all-observed meetings the teacher used English language during his teaching time. He thought that if the students often hear an English language at least in their class, they will understand it little by little. Therefore, the teacher always used English language while teaching. Yet, he didn't use it at all. Sometimes, the condition was not suitable to use English language, for example when he explained hard material or translated the meaning of the text, he used Indonesia language but the used minimally. He switched the language when it was needed. So far, it was worked the students, they knew some vocabulary that often used the teacher in the classroom.

Table 4. 9. The Frequency Of The Techniques and Methods through Communicative Language Teaching Class That Is Used by the Teacher.

| No | Procedures | Frequency |
| :---: | :--- | :---: |
| 1 | General greeting | 18 |
| 2 | Telling objectives | 18 |
| 3 | Starter | 18 |
| 4 | Listening activity | 7 |
| 5 | Reading activity | 11 |
| 6 | Writing activity | 6 |
| 7 | Information gap | 12 |
| 8 | Role play | 3 |
| 9 | Pair work | 11 |
| 10 | Group work | 4 |
| 11 | Survey | 1 |
| 12 | Learning by teaching | 8 |
| 13 | Presentation | 1 |
| 14 | Ignoring error of grammar | 14 |
| 15 | Authentic material | 10 |


| 16 | Media | 10 |
| :---: | :--- | :---: |
| 17 | Another source | 3 |
| 18 | Question and answer | 18 |
| 19 | Using the target language | 18 |

## b. The Data of Observation Class toward The CLT that Is Applied

1). The teacher clearly informed objective of the lesson at the beginning to the students

Based on the writer's observation in the classroom, before teaching the material, the teacher informed the objective of the lesson. He did it in eighteen-observed-meetings with twelve times got 5 point and six times got 4 point. He got 5 point in twelve-observed-meetings because the objective he informed was can be understood by the students and he told the objective clearly; what the objective, why they were learning it, and what was the purpose for them, so the students aware what they were learning. In six meeting, he got 4 point because he told the objective not in detail, so the students looked they didn't know what they will learn. This happened when the condition of the students was not good; many students came late, they were naughty, or didn't pay attention. That was why he used his beginning time to treat them and finally could not inform the objective clearly for them.
2). The teachers reviewed the lesson at the end

During the observation class, the teacher got 5 point in five meetings and 4 point in thirteen meetings. He got 5 when he could review the material of the lesson in the end of the teaching time clearly, and obtained the students understanding of the material. He got 4 mostly because of the time. After having all the activities in the classroom, and when he wanted to review the lesson the time is over, so that the reviewing could not in detail. Even though, the teacher tried to conclude his lesson at the time in the rest of his teaching time.
3). The teachers were ready with the preparation of the materials

From the observation result, the teacher got 5 point in nine times and 4 point in nine times as well. Material of the lesson such as reading, listening, speaking, and writing are very significant part in the lesson, so that the teacher tried to prepare his material before he taught. He got 5 because he totally ready with all the preparation of his material before come to the classroom, what he needed for teaching his material prepared well and ready for the students as well, for example, the media, the handouts, and the lesson plan. He got 4 because sometimes in the classroom the media he brought didn't work well, such as the sound system. It could not hear for whole class, or the handouts were not enough for whole students.
4). The teachers have good structure to lesson use from starter to follow up

Based on the writer's observation, the teacher got 5 in four times and got 4 in fourteen times. He got 5 because the activity from pre-activity to post-activity was in line as it was planned. It means, the activity has done when it has to done and continued to the next activity. The teacher got 4 mostly because of the students. Sometimes, when the teacher wanted to continue the next activity, there were students who didn't understand yet and the teacher has to re-explain it. The time was the factor as well, the activity could be more or less from the planning time. Over all, the teacher conducted and organized the activity well.
5). Instruction/explanations were clear and specific

During the observation time, the teacher always explained his material when he taught in the classroom. Eleventh-observed meetings, he got 5 point, and seven-observed meetings he got 4 point. He got 5 point because when he explained the material, his explanation was complete and clear. He specifically linked the explanation with real example, and if the students asked him another example or more information, he will explain it in detail until the students understand the material. He got 4 point because sometimes the explanation was not in detail. For example, the
teacher could explore more information or the detail about the material, but when the students say they are understand the material, the teacher moved to next agenda, like doing task. However, the information and the explanation he gave was facilitating the students understanding the materials at all.
6). The teachers involved all pupils in the instruction

For this activity, the teacher got 5 for whole meetings. It was very good that he always involved all his students in the instruction. In every activity or agenda, all students will have their turn in the classroom. For instance, every student read a sentence in the reading text, doing a task in the books, and or talking in the classroom. He didn't leave any of his students without having the participation in the class. In harmony with the theory that Learners in CLT classrooms are supposed to participate in classroom activities that are based on a collaborative rather than individualistic approach to learning. So far, this activity worked well in encouraging the students to participate in the classroom. The teacher also let his students to choose who is next to do the task and it made the students feel they are working together. They were managing their task time and they were enjoyable with that.
7). The teachers listened pupils and responded appropriately

Based on the observation result, the teacher got 5 in fourteen times and got 4 in four times. He got 5 point because when his students asked him a question he directly responded and answered it or discussed the question in whole class. The students were able to raise their hands any time in the classroom, he will genuinely respond it. Not only a question, but also when the students come up their idea, the teacher listened it and responded the idea. He got 4 point in four meetings time because it didn't mean that the teacher didn't listen the pupil but it was about the limited time. Many students asked him or share the idea, but because the time he could not answered or responded all students. Even so, he tried to infer the students' questions or idea in the rest time.
8). The teachers engaged the pupils

From the observation result, the teacher got 5 in fourteenobserved meetings and 4 in four-observed meetings. Where he got 5 the students were fully in the lesson, they were focusing with the material, following the activities, and doing their task. They talked each other but still about the lesson or something linked. Yet, it was not imagined as boring class where the students just silent and pay attention to the teacher, it was not. They can laugh and joke, and had enjoyable circumstance while following the agenda because the teacher didn't act and manage the activity such in bored way. Mostly, the teacher engaged their students with those joke and the
activities. The teacher got 4 usually because the students who were sitting in the back of the class not pay attention to him; they did something else outside of lesson or talking with their friends. Sometimes, this action disturbed other students and made them lost focus to the lesson. So far, the students engaged to the lesson and the teacher. There are just few students who did not pay attention to the teacher.
9).The effort of the teachers in their instruction, accuracy, and presentation encourage

Based on the writer's observation, the teacher got 5 in seven times, and got 4 in eleventh times for this category. This technique was used to stabilize the instruction. The teacher had an effort to keep their instruction in line. The teacher got 5 because during the instruction he encouraged his students in the lesson, gave them a motivation, and he has done his technique through CLT's way in teaching maximally. When he looked his students less of motivation, he will build an enjoyable situation by playing music or doing relaxation. He got 4 because it was measured his voice didn't really hear for whole class. According to the some students that they often cannot hear the teacher's voice so that they didn't understand the material well or what they have to do. Even though, the teacher realized that problem, so that during the lesson he didn't
sit in his chair but he walked around the classroom. He will come to the student's chair when they asked him.
10). The teachers used authentic materials for instruction

The teacher used authentic material only ten times of eighteen-observed meeting. Sixteen times got 5 point, and four times got 4 point. He got 5 point because it was measured that the use authentic such as songs, movies, and reading text material were going well. The students like the material, they understood the lesson, and the material was linked to the lesson. It was measured got 4 point because sometimes there was a problem with the material itself. For instance, the teacher used the same song in several classes while he could get various songs for them. It can be from the handouts. In the 2 classes the reading text look quite bored for the students, they didn't really enjoy the text. The text was quite hard for their level. Te teacher should found another reading text that was not hard enough and fix for their level. However, the use of authentic material by the teacher was in good effort.
11). The teachers used some resources

From the observation result, the teacher used another source instead of students' books in 3 times. He got 5 point for all. It was because the use of its material was in maximal way and appropriate to enhance the students knowledge. Beside the students' book, he
used another book as well and some were taken from the internet. It was good because the other book and resource from internet can complete the information from the students' book. If the teacher used source from another book, he usually made copy for the students as well as from the internet. Therefore, the students have many resources for their materials.
12). Regular and appropriate praise given for good effort and achievement

According to the observation's result, the teacher got 5 point in eleventh times, and 4 point in seven times. He got 5 because it was measured that he definitely gave appropriate praise for those who have a good effort and achievement in the classroom. For instance, if the student could answer the question or they did good action when doing a task, the teacher immediately gave him/her applause followed by the class and says "excellent", "good", "well done". The students will feel that his teacher respected their job. He got 4 it was merely about the frequency of the praise. Sometimes, he just says "good" without applause and thumbs up.

## 13). Prompt action to address poor behavior

Based on the writer's observation, in seven times the teacher got 5 point and eleventh times got 4 point. In those seven times where the teacher got 5 point, he directly treated the students who
had poor behavior or noisy. For instance, in social class there were students who always made noise and had bad behavior while instruction. They talked each other without paying attention to the teacher. The teacher has talked to them twice and when they still do that the teacher come to their chair and minus their points. It was needed to do to prevent other students lost their attention or fell disturbed. The teacher acted directly for those students. Those students still have to do their task in the classroom. It happened once, he treated the students who were absent without any reasons in the previous class, he called them to his office and advised them to never do that anymore. That was done to make them realize their wrongness and fixed it. It also used to show other students to didn't do such that behavior. In the eleventh times, he admonished the students who didn't pay attention to him or suddenly asked them for doing the task when they were doing something else and didn't pay attention to the teacher. According to the teacher, that can be punishment for them, because they directly had to do the task without knowing what happened. When those students said they didn't know, the teacher then said that they had to pay attention to the lesson. He always directly treated the students if they made mistake but friendly, so that the students felt enjoy but respected him.
14). Good use of presence/voice to promote/maintain good working atmosphere

From the observation' result, the teacher got 5 in threeobserved meetings and got 4 in fifteen-observed meetings. In those three times the teacher looked very attractive and so were the students, therefore, the class' circumstance was alive. The teacher and the students did their activity in good pace and enjoyable condition. The teacher walked around the class with loud voice while instruction. It was necessary to maintain the atmosphere of the instruction, to prevent students from boredom or tired. The teacher got 4 in fifteen meeting didn't mean that he was bad, but the action was less than those three times. It was measured that sometimes, the voice of the teacher cannot be heard for students who sat in the back of the class unless he walked there. That was way the students in the back have to ask him twice to understand what they have to do. Even so, the teacher recognized that problem and during the lesson he walked around the class to solve that problem. Overall, the teacher has good effort in presence/voice to maintain his teaching atmosphere.
15).Understanding assessed throughout lesson by use of strategies that involve all pupils; teacher's question or self and peer assessment

Based on the writer's observation the teacher used question eleventh times where seven times got 5 point and 4 times got 4 . The teacher got 5 because the questions worked for students. It mean that the every student can answer the question that was directly given by the teacher. The question was also about the material of the lesson. Usually, he decided the student with the question until all students have their part. He got 4 just because there were few students that have not part in the activity and he didn't realize it or the student too quite. Meanwhile, the teacher used peer and self assessment in eighteen times, where four times got 5 point and fourteen times got 4 point. The teacher got 5 point for this activity because after teaching the material he always applied the self or peer assessment to take the students understanding. He managed the time to give his students enough time for doing the task. He got 4 because sometimes if he had to explain more the material, or many of the students shared their idea of the material, they have to work in hurry to finish the task. Even so, because most of the students have already understood the material, they could work hurry. For the student who didn't understand yet, he/she could ask the students who understand the lesson. The teacher will watch them, as long as they didn't share the answer.
16). Pupils fully engaged throughout lesson and make progress

From the observation' result, in six-observed meetings the teacher got 5 point, eleventh-observed meetings got 4 point and one time got 3 point. In those six times, the students fully engaged, none of them was doing something else except paying attention to the lesson. They were focusing to the explanation, doing the activity, discussing, doing the task, and having good circumstance. In those eleventh meetings didn't mean that the students didn't pay attention to him, but it was because a few students make little problem and noisy in the classroom, for a while it disturbed the focus of other students. However, it can be solved by the teacher after he punished the trouble maker. In every meeting, the trouble makers were the same person. He talked with his friend while teacher explained the material, he walked out of the class while the class in going, and some others things. The teacher said that the student who often made that problem and he has often already solve his problem. In one meeting, the classroom condition was not really good. The students didn't really pay the attention even though they were not noise. They were just silent and looked tired. It was because before an English lesson, they had Physic examination and that made them tired. A half of the lesson, the teacher tried to courage the students' spirit in learning. After doing some relaxation and listening relaxing song, they could learn in good condition again. Considering that his students not in good
mood, in the rest of the time he gave them games instead of material. The game was "linked letter", the teacher will tell one word and he will point the student, after that the student in turn had to find new word using the last letter of teacher's words. It happened until all students had their part. In order to not losing the material of that day, the teacher gave them homework about the material. So far, the students made progress in every instruction. It can be seen from their achievement in the end of the lesson. They understand the lesson and doing the task with good result. The most important was the frequency of the student in communicating target language increase by time to time.
17). Pupils understand what was expected to them

From the observation' result, in six-observed meetings the teacher got 5 point and twelve-observed meetings got 4 point. In those six meetings the students have good output in which they fully understand what the teacher supposed to them and to do so. It mean the output was in line with the objective that the teacher set in the beginning. It can be seen from the result of their tasks, most of the students got high score for their task. They also understood when the teacher explained their task and what they have to do. In twelve-observed meetings, the students still understood what it was expected to them but not at all. Some students still needed an improvement to got good result. Few students look didn't really
understand what they have to do, and to solve it the teacher asked the students who understood well explain to them.
18). The teachers and pupils worked at good pace

From the observation result, in thirteen-observed meetings the teacher got 5 point, in four-observed meetings got 4 point, and in one-observed meeting got 3 . The teacher got 5 , it was measured that the relation among the teacher and the students were really good. In communicative language teaching class, in which the teacher acted as guidance, he as facilitator and his students manage their own class and the activities well. They focus to the lesson happily and finally have good result in the end. The teacher got 4 because in those four times there were few students disturb the class, so the teacher had to punish them and it affected to the circumstance in a moment. However, the use of CLT in the classroom was not always worked well. Mr. A' class sometimes was in hard circumstance. The teacher got 3 when a half of the teaching time looked bored and the students looked tired. So that, they could not learn in good condition. But then, the teacher could increase the circumstance in the rest of teaching time. Overall, the teacher and the students have good relation and work in good face during the instruction.
19). Time well utilized

From the observation result, in four-observed meetings got 5 point, and four-observed meetings got 4 point. In lesson plan, the teacher has managed the time well. Yet, mostly what happened in the class cannot be predicted, and it made the time didn't like what the teacher has planned. He got 5 because the time from preactivity to post-activity could manage well. Usually, the teacher decided the time before they were doing the activity, how long did one activity take. He got 4 because sometimes the post activity has to do in hurry due to the time. Even so, the time could manage well.
20). Learning maintain for full time

From the observation result, in this category the teacher got 5 in ten meetings and got 4 in eight meetings. When the teacher got 5, it was measured that the whole condition in the classroom was learning condition. The teacher and the students were in the instruction circumstance, for instance, the activity was done without any disturbed from both teacher and students. The activity that was conducted support the teaching time for full time. He got 4 , it was measured that sometimes happened in the end of the class the students lost their attention of the learning because any disturbed or something else. The students joked among them and made the learning out of plan. However, the teacher could solve
that problem by admonished them, and the learning could continue well.

## 21). Appropriate learning resources used

From the observation result, in this category the teacher got 5 in fourteen meetings, and got 4 four meetings. In those fourteen times meetings, the teacher appropriately used the resources for the instruction. He used media when it was needed to increase the instruction condition and fixed to the lesson at material at the time; he used song when the theme of the lesson was "Giving Opinion", and brought the reading text and its sound when the lesson about "Genre", and played movie when the lesson about "Describing Something". In those four times meetings the teacher brought an appropriate resource but the same thing for several classes. The same songs used for teaching several classes, whereas the teacher can use another song. So the students have various songs. In one class the text that the teacher spread looked hard for the students because the text included biology words in English. Even though the students could enjoy the text after they were discussing the meanings.

Table 4. 10. The Frequency of The Data of Observation Class toward The CLT that Is Applied

| No | The Data | Frequency |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | $\mathbf{1}$ | $\mathbf{2}$ | $\mathbf{3}$ | $\mathbf{4}$ | $\mathbf{5}$ |
| 1 | The clearly informed objective of | - | - | - | 6 | 12 |


|  | the lesson at the beginning to the students |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2 | The teachers review the lesson at the end | - | - | - | 13 | 5 |
| 3 | The teachers are ready with the preparation of the materials | - | - | - | 9 | 9 |
| 4 | The teachers have good structure to lesson use from starter to follow up | - | - | - | 14 | 4 |
| 5 | Instruction/explanations are clear and specific | - | - | - | 7 | 11 |
| 6 | The teachers involve all pupils in the instruction | - | - | - | - | 18 |
| 7 | The teachers listen pupils and respond appropriately | - | - | - | 4 | 14 |
| 8 | The teachers engaged the pupils | - | - | - | 4 | 14 |
| 9 | The effort of the teachers in their instruction, accuracy, and presentation encourage | - | - | - | 11 | 7 |
| 10 | The teachers use authentic materials for instruction | - | - | - | 4 | 6 |
| 11 | The teachers use some resources | - | - | - | - | 3 |
| 12 | Regular and appropriate praise given for good effort and achievement | - | - | - | 7 | 11 |
| 13 | Prompt action to address poor behavior | - | - | - | 11 | 7 |
| 14 | Good use of presence/voice to promote/maintain good working atmosphere | - | - | - | 15 | 3 |
| 15 | Understanding assessed throughout lesson by use of strategies that involve all pupils; <br> a. teacher's question <br> b. self and peer assessment | - | - | - | $\begin{aligned} & 4 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | 7 <br> 5 |
| 16 | Pupils fully engaged throughout lesson and make progress | - | - | 1 | 11 | 6 |
| 17 | Pupils understand what was expected to them | - | - | - | 12 | 6 |
| 18 | The teachers and pupils work at good pace | - | - | 1 | 4 | 13 |
| 19 | Time well utilized | - | - | - | 14 | 4 |
| 20 | Learning maintain for full time | - | - | - | 8 | 10 |
| 21 | Appropriate learning resources | - | - | - | 4 | 14 |

## c. The Result of The Effectiveness of Communicative Language Teaching that Is Applied at Eleventh Grade of SMAN 1

 KotabaruAfter describing the techniques and the methods that was applied and also the data of observation class regarding communicative language teaching, the writer is able to conclude the result of the effectiveness of communicative language teaching that is applied at eleventh grade of SMAN 1 Kotabaru since it is an object of this particular research. The techniques and the methods as well as the data of observation class are used to know both the teacher and the students' role in the instruction and then eventually describe the result of effectiveness of communicative language teaching instruction descriptively qualitatively. According to the theory that
the term effectivenes refers to how a class can be suitable for the both teacher and students, teach the right material with an appropriate lavel, method and techniques and also acceptable media.

The effectiveness of communicative language teaching instruction is different for each class. Every class has various results. In the four classes (acceleration 2, science 1, 2, 3) the communicative language teaching approach that is applied in foreign language teaching learning classroom is effective. In the two classes (social 1, 2) the teacher has to work harder than other classes and the communicative language teaching that is applied is less effective or in average.

In those four classes (acceleration 2, science 1, 2, 3), the application of communicative language teaching is effective, it can be seen both from the teacher and the students' role. As Littlewood states that the roles of teacher in CLT consist of, but are not limited to, coordinator and manager of activities, language instructor, source of new language, consultant when needed, as well as participant. The teacher as a guide for the students in learning so did Mr. A as this particular English teacher. He applied the techniques and the method maximally as well as he placed his self in the right way he has to. Not only the teacher has filled his role in communicative language teaching class but also the students have to. According to Hu that quotes in CLT's article proposes that the roles of students in CLT
classroom are supposed to be "those of negotiators for meaning, communicators, discoverers, and contributors of knowledge and information". The students in those classes always try and try to fill their rules and so far they do. Therefore, with that both teacher and students interaction in the classroom, the communicative language teaching is effective. It is effectively to raise the interaction, improve the knowledge of the students, raise the class' circumstance and enhance the communication of the target language, as the goal of communicative language teaching class.

Otherwise, in the 2 classes (social 1,2) the effectiveness of communicative language teaching is in the average. It means that the teacher is fulfilled his role in communicative language teaching classroom in maximal way; what he did in other classes, he also did it in these classes. Yet, the teacher has to work twice harder than in other classes. It is because the students in these classes didn't appreciate maximally to the teacher and didn't fill their role. The teacher has to motivate them and has to ask them harder to make them join in the communicative language teaching classroom. Many of them are passive students than active students like in those four classrooms. Even so, some of them are including in the communicative language teaching classes and looks really appreciate to the teacher techniques and the methods through communicative language teaching approach. They can be directed to reach the goal of
the communicative language teaching that is able to communicate in the target language.

Considering the result of the test that is done by the representative students where the mean of the test score is 6.656 . According to the percentage of data interpretation that 6.656 is in the middle category or average category. Yet, from the individual test result score, the highest score (above sixty) mostly got by the acceleration 2, science 1,2 , and 3 classes. The lowest score (under sixty) mostly got by social 1 and 2 classes.

## 2. The Eleventh Grade Students' Response Regarding Communicative Language Teaching Approach that Is Applied

Based on the result of questionnaire, which has been presented in data presentation, the writer then describes and analyzes it in this term.

The students' response is indicated by their likeness to toward the repeating method. From the table 4.3 it can be known that there are 76 ( $44.5 \%$ ) students out of 171 students who are in the average, there are 52 (30.4\%) students who stated that they are like, 76 (44.5\%) students stated in average, 11 (6.4\%) students dislike, and there is no student ( $0 \%$ ) who stated dislike the method. It means that the students' response toward repeating method is in the average. Even though, there are just 52 ( $30.4 \%$ ) states like the method, this method is still good to practice the students' speaking and communication in the target language. The
students will be usual to the target language if they always practice the conversation.

The students' interest of communicative language teaching is indicated by their likeness to the class because of they can practice the communication. From the table 4.4 it can be known that 83 (48.5\%) out of 171 students who like the class because of they can practice the communication. 38 ( $22.2 \%$ ) students like it very much, 33 (19.3) students in average, 15 (8.8\%) student dislike, and $2(1.2 \%)$ students stated do not like very much. It means that the student' interest of communicative language teaching class because of they can practice the communication is in the high category or good category. It is really good for both teacher and the student, the teacher can give them the material to always communicate in target language and can easily attract the students because the students already have the motivation to learn the target language. It is good for students because they can learn happily and enjoyable through communication class.

The students' response is indicated toward their likeness in communicating English during the instruction. From the table 4.5 it can be known that 26 ( $15.2 \%$ ) students like very much, 74 (43.3\%) out of 171 students who states like communicating in English language during the instruction, there are 44 (25.7\%) students in average, 23 (13.5\%) students dislike the activity. It means that the students' response toward communicating English language during the instruction is in the high
category or good category. It is good that the students have already like the communication in the target language so that the communicative language teaching approach that is applied by the teacher will conducted in good way. There are just 4 ( 2.3 \%) students who don't really like communicating in English language during the instruction at all.

In communicative language teaching classroom the teacher also build the activity for his students to communicate each other, it helps the students to practice their English language among them and without feeling shy or worry about mistake. For that activity, the students have different responses. From the table 4.6 it can be seen that 31 ( $18.1 \%$ ) students who states like it very much, $59(34.5 \%)$ students state like it, 58 ( $33.9 \%$ ) students in average, 18 ( $10.5 \%$ ) students dislike it. It can be inferred that the students' response toward this activity is in the high category or good category. Therefore, it is easy for the teacher directs the students use the activity because the student like that activity. There just 5 (2.9\%) who states do not like very much the activity at all.

Since the goal of communicative language teaching class is to be able to the students in the target language and less focused of grammar, and the teacher applied it. The teacher put the goal English lesson in that school is communication and the lesson about grammar if needed. The students have various responses about their interest of English lesson through that method. From the table 4.7 it can be known that there are 21 ( $12.3 \%$ ) students state like it very much, 58 ( $33.9 \%$ )
students like it, 53 (30.9\%) students are in average, 37 (31.6\%) students dislike it. It can be concluded that the student interest of their goal of English lesson is communication and grammar lesson if needed is in the high category or good category. It is little bit higher than the students who states in the average. It is looks appropriate to put communication approach as the goal of English lesson. However, there are 2 (1.7\%) students do not like it very much.

To facilitate the communication classroom, the teacher creates the circumstance that able the students to practice their communication during the instruction. For instance, the teacher divided the students to the pair work group work so that they can practice with their friends during the instruction. In line with the theory that teachers need to motivate their students, as well as provide them with a comfortable classroom atmosphere for language learning. The response of the students can be seen from the table 4.8 where 62 (36.2\%) students like it very much, $55(32.2 \%)$ students like, $40(23.4 \%)$ students are in average, 11 (6.4\%) students do not feel so. It can be inferred that the students' response about the circumstance the teacher creates is in the highest category or very good category. They like very much when the teacher conduct the circumstance or the condition where they can practice communication in English language during the instruction. Even so, there are 3 (1.8\%) students dislike it very much.

In conclusion, the students mostly have average, high and the highest responses for the communicative language teaching approach that is applied by the teacher. There are just few students have low and lowest responses.

