

## **CHAPTER IV**

### **FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION**

In this chapter, the researcher will explain the research findings of teachers' models, strategies and challenging in teaching English using bilingual. The data was taken from the three English teachers who teach English during online learning in SMAN Banua Kalimantan Selatan. In findings, the researcher will discuss the models, strategies, and challenges based on the theory and the results of Zoom Cloud Meeting recording observation, interview with teacher and teachers' documents.

#### **A. Findings**

In this research, the researcher included three English teachers who were Ms. A, Ms. B, and Mrs R. The researcher first asked the school's permission to conduct the research and then the researcher contacted the teachers to inform them about my research. For the observation, I asked the teachers Zoom Cloud Meeting recordings because the researcher wanted to investigate the teaching learning in online era. But because one teacher did not have the recording, she allowed me to observe directly the teaching learning activity in Zoom meeting. The researcher collected four Zoom meeting recording with the following details:

Meanwhile, the interviews were conducted online and offline following the teachers' demand. Offline interview was conducted directly in SMAN Banua Kalimantan Selatan while the online interview was conducted via WhatsApp. For

the documentation, the researcher asked teachers' lesson plan during online learning. The results of observation, interviews, and documents were presented in appendices.

After gathering all of the data, the researcher then transcribed and coded the data. The researcher re-watched and re-listened to the recording while transcribing the data and the researcher re-read and re-checked the results of interview and teacher's documents while coding the data. Therefore, the data found in the field are shown below.

### **1. The Bilingual Model Used by English Teachers in Online Learning**

Based on the data obtained from observation, interview, and documentation, there was one model of bilingual educations that was dominantly used by the English teacher in SMAN Banua Kalimantan Selatan. The findings were described below.

#### **a. Transitional Bilingual Education (TBE)**

According to the English teachers, the school provided a special program named matriculation program for new students aiming to introduce English as language instruction in school, especially for sciences, mathematics, and English subjects. The proof could be seen from Ms. A's statement below:

*“There is matriculation program for new students of SMAN Banua. This program is aimed at introducing the English language as the instructional language at this school. Furthermore, this program helps map the students' English proficiency for further follow up. (TM/ITV2/3)*

The statement above was added by Mrs R that stated, “We have English matriculation before students entered the class. We have it around two weeks” (TM/ITV3/3). These data showed that the matriculation program was for introducing English as language instruction and for improving students’ English proficiency. This program was not only held in offline learning era, but also was held in online learning era and this was held around two weeks. While delivering the topic in the matriculation program, the teachers used English around 50%-100% because of many reasons. The reasons could be seen below:

1. The school obligated the teachers to use English as the language instruction during the teaching learning process as Mrs. R mentioned, “But for me, myself, and also for our school, it’s necessary and obligatory to use English even to introduce it to the students” (TM/ITV3/3).
2. The new students were required to master the Basic English before entering the school, as Ms A mentioned, “This school requires the new students to have minimum A2 level of English (according to CEFR), therefore it is an uncommon thing to find anyone who does not know English at all” (TM/ITV2/3).
3. The new students came from different educational background which leads to the diversity of students’ English level. Because of that, the teacher tried to balance the topic and also the language to

maintain students' attention in the classroom where the standard and advanced students could participate actively in the classroom as Ms. B mentioned, "Because we try to make the class balance since not all students have been good in English and vice versa" (TM/ITV1/3).

4. The students might be low motivated in using English if the teacher used more Indonesian than English in the classroom as Mrs. R mentioned, "If we use *bahasa*, I'm afraid that they will become too lazy to start speaking in English. I do understand that they don't have that kind of confidence" (TM/ITV3/3).

These four reasons above showed that the matriculation program in both offline and online learning was delivered using English 50%-100% because the teachers believed that the students were capable to understand at least the basic English even though there students' English level itself was diverse as the teacher stated, "Some may have higher level of English while some others have low level of English" (TM/ITV2/4). The standard students might find difficulties if the teachers used high level of English, while the advanced students would not be motivated to learn English if the teachers used Basic English. In addition, the obligatory of using English as language instruction made the teachers needed to use English as language instruction in the program.

Furthermore, the aim of the bilingual program in this school was to make the students master the target language in the end of the school. Since the students had been introduced English as the language instruction, the students were expected to improve their English since they were in first grade of school. As the results, the teachers stated that the students were able to follow the class where the English teachers deliver the topic in full English. Ms. B stated that, “When they were still in X grades, they have been taught using dominant English and when they were in XI grades, they were taught using full English. So students in XII grades have been adjusted with full-English” (TM/ITV1/5). Ms. A added that, “XII graders in SMAN Banua study B2 & C1 level (Upper-intermediate & Advanced levels), so it is supposed to be easy enough for them to understand English” (TM/ITV2/5).

The observation data also showed that the students in grade eleven and twelve were taught using full English even in some conditions the teachers needed to use Indonesian. Ms. B stated the reason of using Indonesian in daily conversation was “We still use Indonesian in our daily conversation to make them comfortable in studying English” (TM/ITV1/3). Added by the students learn through online media which was totally different with offline learning, the teachers used Indonesian to adjust with the condition.

All in all, the bilingual model used in online learning was Transitional Bilingual Education (TBE) as this model referred to the use of students' native language in the beginning of lesson and will be shifted to target language in the end of the school and the aim of this model is to make students be monolingual in the target language. This model was also used in offline learning and it could be done in online learning since using English in the classroom was the school's obligatory and the teachers also believed that students were able to adjust themselves with the condition.

## **2. The Bilingual Strategy Used by English Teachers in Online Learning**

English classes in SMAN Banua Kalimantan Selatan were divided into two classes, namely Grammar class and Main Course class. Ms. A mentioned that "This school divides the English classes as Main Course and Grammar. The Main Course class consist of reading, listening, speaking and writing, while grammar class is solely for drilling grammar material " (TS/ITV2/8). In these classes, the teachers implemented some activities that were adjusted with online condition. However, the teacher mentioned if some activities that had been conducted during online learning could not run maximally because of many problems. Ms. A stated that, "Overall, the activities can be conducted, but cannot be maximal" (TS/ITV2/7).

According to the data collected in the field, there were two strategies of bilingual educations that were mostly used and possibly to

conducted by the English teacher in Grammar and Main course classes at SMAN Banua Kalimantan Selatan during online learning as follow:

**a. Metalinguistic Strategies**

Based on the interview, the teacher stated that she did some activities that were able to be conducted in both of classes. Ms. A stated that, “On the other hand, problem solving, predicting, paraphrasing, comparing sentences can be both applied in MC class and Grammar Class. The techniques normally used are pair work, gallery showroom, and group work” (TS/ITV2/8).

From the teacher’s statement, the teacher had conducted many activities in both Main Course class and Grammar class, especially for problem solving, predicting, paraphrasing, and comparing sentences in which those activities were involved in metalinguistic strategy that could support students in improving students’ metalinguistic awareness. This meant the teacher was indicated using metalinguistic strategy in both classes.

Other than that, according to the observation data of XII grades which were in main course class, the teacher asked the students to read the passage in the textbook first. Then, the teacher divided the students into several groups where each group had different task. The tasks were in form of matching, summarizing, and identifying sentences based on the passages they had read before. Moreover, this activity also could be done individually as Ms. B mentioned:

*“In every meeting, I ask students to summarize and paraphrase the story in the textbook because there are lots of texts given in the textbook. But, I only choose some samples of students because it is hard to check all students’ work in online learning.” (TS/ITV1/8)*

The interview statements above showed that the teacher involved students in activities namely summarize and paraphrase which the topic was in accordance with the students’ textbook. When the students had finished the work, the teacher would check the works by choosing some students as the sample. And then, they would review it together. However, sometimes the teacher took random topic to be discussed with the students in brainstorming activity or similar with predicting activity where the students needed to use their background knowledge to give the opinion of the topic. There, the teacher would show students a picture which might relate to the previous topic or something that relates to them, as Mrs. R mentioned below.

*“I will open the class by brainstorming. Here, I will show them a picture. Then I will ask them to explain the picture. Or, I will ask them about their experience, their current situation, or it is just to engage students with their previous lesson” (TS/ITV3/7).*

Meanwhile, the students sometimes are involved in comparing sentence activity, especially when they had just learned a new structure in grammar class. Mrs. R stated that, “The students also get involved in comparing sentences activity, in which we compare one sentence to another that have different grammar” (TS/ITV3/8).



This activity was used to make students be able identify the structure of sentences and analyse the difference between one structure with another.

All in all, the teachers used Metalinguistic strategies in both of main course and grammar class in online learning as the teachers applied some activities namely predicting, paraphrasing, and summarizing. The teachers modified those activities in the classroom based on the students' condition and adjusted it with the material in the textbook.

#### **b. Translanguaging**

Based on the observation data of X until XII grades, the researcher found that the teachers switched the languages in the middle of activities in the classroom. The code switching itself was included in translanguaging strategy which involved translating, interpreting, and code switching or the shifting between two languages.

Below is the table of the translanguaging used in the classroom.

Table 4.1 Translanguaging Used in The Classroom			
Component	Class	Function	Frequently
Code Switching	XC	Give instruction and check students' understanding.	7 times
	XD		5 times
	XID		-
	XIIC		-
Translating and Interpreting	XC	Check students understanding and give students' clarification	-
	XD		10 times
	XID		-
	XIIC		-

From the table above, the most used translanguaging practice found in the classroom was code switching and it was mostly used in X grades. In accordance with that, there were two functions of translanguaging found by the researcher which would be described below:

### 1) Translanguaging Practice for Giving Clarification

Students had different English proficiency and it could affect students' performance in the classroom. Thus, the teachers needed to adjust their teaching with the students' condition and the school obligatory that was teaching with full English. Based on the observation data, the teachers gave clarification to students by re-explaining the material using the local language, or in this condition was Indonesian. This could be seen from the observation on X grades below:

*T: ... Redundant means berulang-ulang atau mubazir. Because there are some words that are repeated twice, such as remember and meeting. These make the sentence is too much or too wordy, terlalu banyak kata-kata. So I can say sentence number one is not highly recommended to be used, jadi tidak begitu disarankan untuk alternatif nomer 1. Next, sentence number 2, "I still remember meeting Jeje for the first time but she forgot meeting me." Ok, another alternative you can also use the word "forgot" but the point is still, we still use gerund in this case. Why so? Once again, because the action meeting already took place in a certain time in the past, sudah terjadi di suatu waktu di masa lampau. Next alternative number three is the most recommended one, because this sentence I can say is the most concise one, paling singkat, padat, dan jelas, "*

(TS/OBV1/030)

The data showed that translating and interpreting was used to give clarification of the explanation and uncommon English words. In her utterance, she used English for her explanation in the beginning and then switched it to Indonesia to give students clarification of the meaning of the word spoken. The teacher also translated uncommon English words to avoid misinterpretation on students.

Otherwise, The teacher did not always re-explained the materials using the local language, yet when the students needed clarification and needed the repetition, the teacher would re-explained and switched the language like the observation data in XC below:

*T: "Your photo", isn't it? We're talking about the object. Then number 2, "A fire damaged the roof" so which one is the subject? "A fire". And "the roof" is an object. So if we want to make a question using subject, how do we make it? Starts with what? What is it?*

*S: Repeat again miss.*

*T: Kalau misalnya kita mau nanya subjeknya, kita pakai "What" after that followed by verb, begitukan rulesnya. "What damage the roof?" The fire. "What did the fire damage?" The roof. Yang membedakan subjek dan objek adalah, kalau untuk menanyakan objek kita pakai auxiliary verb, misalnya did, can, to be. Nah kalau misalnya di subjek, setelah wh- question, followed by the verb langsung. Di sini verbnya "damage", kan?*

(TS/OBV2/076)

From the data above, the teacher first asked the students to answer a question for checking their understanding within specifying the question. Apparently, the

students were confused with the teacher's questions. Thus, the teacher asked the students again but she specified the questions using Indonesian in order to make sure the students could understand the question.

Other than that, the teacher mentioned in the interview that she would re-explain the materials unless the students did not understand the words. Mrs. R stated that, "If they don't understand the materials, I will explain it again in English. But if some of them still don't understand the meaning of words, I will translate it into bahasa" (TC/ITV3/6).

## **2) Translanguaging Practice for Checking Students' Understanding**

According to observation data in four classes, the researcher found that teachers used translanguaging to check students' understanding. Below was the observation data in XD where the teacher asked her students to translate a sentence from Indonesian to English aiming to check their understanding of grammar.

*T: "So We have talked about rainforest and we have talked about the first group of rainforest that is remember, forget, and recall. To check whether you still in line with the first group of rainforest, I'd like you to ask for your help, please translate this sentence into English. Ok, I'm gonna say the Indonesian sentence, please help me translate and you can participate via chat box, "Aku masih ingat pertama kali bertemu Jeje, tapi dia tidak." Ok in this case I don't really*

*concern about the word choice or your diction or the vocabulary that you are going to use, but the focus is whether you still comprehend the topic about gerund or infinitive, after certain verbs remember, forget and recall...”*

(TS/OBV1/030)

Other than that, the teacher sometimes switched the language unconsciously when asking the students whether the students had questions or not. This could be seen from the observation data of X grades below.

*T: So, any question about the exercise we did? Masih bingung ya?*

*S: Miss yang jawaban nomer 5 itu?*

(TS/OBV2/062)

*T: Masih bingung? Kalau masih bingung kita ke nomer 3. “Joanna is afraid of spiders” kalau misalnya kita mau tanya tentang Joanna, gimana pertanyaannya?*

*S: What Joanna afraid of?*

*S: Who is afraid of spiders?*

*T: Exactly! “Who is afraid of spiders?” The answer is Joanna. What about the object, kalau kita mau tanya tentang apa yang ditakutkan Joanna, gimana pertanyaannya?*

*S: What is Joanna afraid of?*

(TS/OBV2/078)

From the data number one (TS/OBV2/062), the teacher checked students understanding after having discussion by switching the language. Meanwhile, from the data number two (TS/OBV2/078), the teacher asked students questions to check students understanding and switched the language from English to Indonesian. Thus from all the data above, the teachers used translanguaging strategy especially translating and switching the language in order to give

clarification of their explanation and to check students' understanding.

### **3. The Challenges Faced by English Teachers in Applying Bilingual Models and Strategies during Online Learning**

Basically, the bilingual models and strategies that were applied in the classroom during online learning had been adjusted with the students' conditions. However, there were still many challenges faced by the teachers when they implemented the models and also the strategies during online learning. Based on the data found in the field, there were three main challenges faced by the English teachers in applying the bilingual model and strategy during online learning and they were described below.

#### **a. Technical Problems**

Online learning required both teachers and students enable to utilize any devices that could connect them to internet. In SMAN Banua Kalimantan Selatan, all of the English teachers utilized Zoom, WhatsApp, and Google Classroom to interact with the students during online learning. The teachers sent the materials through Google Classroom and WhatsApp while the meeting was conducted using Zoom. But unfortunately, some students of SMAN Banua Kalimantan Selatan at first never used Zoom as the learning medium. Ms. A mentioned that, "There are also technical problems

that can interfere the process, either from the teacher's side or the students themselves. The term 'technological backward' or '*gagap teknologi*' is also one of the problems that affect students' participation in my classes" (TC/ITV2/11). Therefore, in the beginning, some of them found difficulties in utilizing Zoom. They could not connect the audio and turned on the camera which hindered them to be active in the classroom.

In addition, unstable internet connection that might happen anytime and anywhere, both of students and teachers sometimes could not perform maximally during the learning process. Both students and teachers could not open their camera and connect the audio. Moreover, the students in certain conditions could not hear the teachers' voice because the teachers' voice was not clearly audible. It could be seen from the observation data below:

*T: Ok Shaina, you are still muted.*

*S: I am sorry miss. What are you asking miss?*

*T: Ok guess. Who might have written the word "Travelling"? Guess among the people in this class, who might have written "Traveling".*

(TC/OBV1/006)

*T: Yes Aliya read sentence I please. You are still muted.*

*S: Sorry miss, yang mana miss?*

*T: Ok read a sentence labelled "I"*

(TC/OBV1/035)

*T: Well class there are at least 3 ways of translating the sentence, the first time is "I still remember meeting Jeje for the first time, but she doesn't remember meeting me." (The connection is suddenly unstable). Ok, as you can see in the chat box, I've given the alternative answers of translating the sentence.*

(TC/OBV1/030)

*T: Ok Kiki is still connecting the audio. Now Kiki, can you unmute yourself?*

*S: Yes miss*

*T: Ok please read the sentences on the right column "regret+infinitive and regret+gerund. Read out loud please.*

*(TC/OBV1/040)*

*T: Girls can you hear my voice?*

*S: Yes miss, can you repeat again? I don't really hear you.*

*(TC/OBV2/058)*

*SG2: (The students continue their presentation) (In the middle of presentation, one of the members is lost her connection; she cannot join the Zoom meeting. So that, she records her voice before the presentation)*

*SG2: I think has problem with her connection Miss. Miss, may I play Shofa's recording? She already recorded hers.*

*(TC/OBV4/078)*

From the data above, they could be inferred that both students and teacher could not hinder the unstable internet connection. Another technical problem happened when the teacher's screen could not show the Power Point properly (TC/OBV3/028). The teacher needed to confirm this thing every time she moved the slides.

Overcoming those problems, the teacher needed to design the material and the media that able to be used during online learning. Ms. A stated that, "Teachers also need to adjust the type of the material taught and the media used, as not all material is suitable for online class" (TC/ITV2/11). The media that were used by the teachers were WhatsApp, Google Classroom, and Zoom. The teacher would replace one media to another when it was not suitable to use in certain condition. The



teacher would record the Zoom meeting and then sent it to WhatsApp Group or Google Classroom together with other materials, namely audio and Power Point slides in case the students could not join the meeting due unstable internet connection. Ms. A stated that, “There are audio provided by the book, but because sometimes the internet connection is unstable, so I sometimes send it to WhatsApp Group” (TC/ITV2/7). Ms B also mentioned it directly in the classroom as it can be seen below:

*T: “Ok thank you Niska. So that’s all for today, thank you so much girls. Please check out our Google Classroom and I give you an exercise there. The new exercise is at the top of main course and you can see here writing and vocabulary exercise. And for today’s material I already post it in unit 5D writing. And I also put the audio and also the power point. So thank you for today girls, don’t forget to work on your task and see you on final test.”*  
*S: “Thank you Miss.”*

(TC/OBV4/110)

As the conclusion from all the data above, the English teachers would send the course materials, namely listening audio, Power Point slides, and Zoom Recording to WhatsApp Group and Google Classroom to help students who could not join the full meeting in Zoom do not miss the lesson on that day. Thus, all students were still able to learn and to review the materials by themselves.

### **b. Students' Diversity Level of English and Material Complexity**

Students came from different regions and different educational backgrounds. Therefore, when the new students were gathered in one class, their prior knowledge of English was different. Ms. B stated that, "Students come from different regions. They obviously had different English skills. There were students who have been good in English and they were paired with students who are not really good in English" (TC/ITV1/4). Added by Ms. A that stated, "Some may have higher level of English while some others have low level of English. This situation then led to an inharmonious flow of teaching & learning process" (TC/ITV2/4).

Based on the teacher' statements above, the students had different English skills that affect the learning process in which not all students could understand the explanation and material in the same time. Otherwise, some students might understand the course material faster while the rest needed more time to understand it. The challenges were added with the condition that the school's obligation that English teachers should use full English in the classroom that was challenging for both teachers and students as Ms. A mentioned, "Teaching using full English could be challenging in a heterogeneous classes where the students' English proficiency differs greatly" (TC/ITV2/6).

On the other hand, since the school used Cambridge textbook and the teacher must finish one book in every year, the teachers needed to adjust the short learning period that approximately thirty minutes until one hour per meeting and the material within the consideration of students' English proficiency. It is also one of English teacher's challenges to make sure the students can follow the teachers' pace and can comprehend the material. The teacher found that some students were hard to comprehend the material as Mrs. R stated that, "It's hard to comprehend the material itself for them. Since we need to finish the material itself, we need them to be able to understand the material quickly" (TC/ITV3/4). The teacher also added her statement, "It's difficult to make students comprehend the material as they don't understand the language" (TC/ITV3/6). Hence, since not all the students could comprehend the material quickly, the teacher needed more time to deliver material though the time for it was limited.

However, not all students were struggling with English as the language instruction, especially students in XI and XII grades, but the main problem was to comprehend the complexity of the topic as Ms. A mentioned below:

*"In my classes, the major problem the students face is that they do not understand the material. Not because they don't understand the English language as the medium of teaching but because of the complexity of the material itself. Yes, indeed, there are particular students who are*

*struggling with English as a language, but not many*” (TC/ITV2/9).

Ms. B added, “The students sometimes do not understand the materials but have no problems with the language instruction, which is English” (TC/ITV1/6). These statements showed that most of students had no problem with the language instruction but they were struggling with the complexity of the course material. Thus, from all the data above, some students especially X grades students were still struggling with English as the language instruction which was their difficulty to comprehend the course materials, while XI and XII grade students are struggling with the complexity of the course materials.

Overcoming these problems, the teachers initially needed to improve students’ English mastery. Thus the teachers gave students extra work. Ms. B stated that, “For the extra work, we do not take it from school material, yet we ask students to read Oxford novel” (TC/ITV1/4). The teacher mentioned that the students are asked to read Oxford novel. The novel itself has 6 levels that started from beginner level as Ms. A mentioned, “The novels are already designed according to the students’ English level such as starter/beginning” (TC/ITV2/7). This activity was aimed to help students improve their vocabulary mastery and students’ reading comprehension. Ms. A stated that,

*“As the solution, we provide a program that helps students acquire vocabularies according to their level of English. Students are asked to read an English novels ranging from starter level – higher level, then to make the summary of the story and list the new vocabularies they encounter” (TC/ITV2/4).*

From the teacher’s statement above, the teacher also gave students extra works which are make the summary of the story and list the new vocabularies found in the novel. However, since conducting online learning, the teacher could not give them the many additional tasks, thus the teachers only recommend them to read the novel. The teacher stated that,

*“During online learning, the students are asked to read English novel based on their English level to be get used to English vocabularies and structures. We don’t give them extra task because if we decide the things they should do with the novel, they are unwilling to read the novel, beside they will just read the novel to fulfil the task” (TS/ITV1/7)*

Besides asking students to read English novel, the teacher also shares story books complete with the audio which could be listened anytime. The teacher expected the students could have better motivation to learn English. The teacher stated that, “Boosting their motivation to learn, I give them story book and the audio to increase their spirit to learn” (TC/ITV3/11).

Meanwhile, for helping students in understanding the material complexity, the teachers would re-explain the materials

and gave extra lesson outside the class, especially for students who were struggling with the language. Ms. A stated that,

*“And the solution for these people is by giving extra lesson where they can re-learn the material in a slower pace. Meanwhile, if the whole class have difficulties understanding the material, teacher then will need to employ different teaching method or make use of different media” (TC/ITV2/4)*

From the statement above, the teacher would facilitate students by giving them extra lesson where they could learn in a slower pace. In addition, if all students including the students who have been good in English do not understand the material, the teacher would try different method or media. However, all English teachers did not recommend the students using bilingual sources or Indonesian sources as their additional material outside the class. Mrs. R mentioned that,

*“I don’t recommend the use either Indonesian textbook or another bilingual source. In offline learning, I recommend them to bring Oxford dictionary and in online learning, because it’s hard to prohibit students to not use digital vocabulary, so that I recommend the students to use Vocabulary.com” (TC/ITV3/9)*

Ms. B also stated that:

*“We do not recommend the students to use Indonesian book or bilingual book, because they will only remember word by word, not the whole things. In addition, regarding to the bilingual system in this school, we expect them to be fluent in English and familiar with the language switching” (TC/ITV1/9).*

From the teachers' statements above, it could be inferred that the teachers preferred to use other ways rather than recommending the students to use bilingual sources or Indonesian textbook. The teacher recommended the student to use digital translator, namely *Vocabulary.com* that translates English to English within complete explanation. Besides re-explaining material, giving extra lesson and recommending the students to use digital vocabulary, the teacher also shared videos to students which were not taken from the textbook. Ms. B stated that, "I will explain the material and give them simple English video to give students deeper understanding" (TC/ITV1/6).

Moreover, considering some of students in one class who had been advanced in English, the teachers then paired the students between standard and advanced students. Ms. B mentioned that, "Overcoming the problem, the students who are good in English are paired with students who are not really good in English" (TC/ITV1/4). Mrs. R added, "I will have students to do peer-tutor that the high level students are paired with the standard students" (TC/ITV3/4).

All in all, overcoming the problem, the teachers would re-explain material directly in the classroom and if the students still did not understand the material, the teachers would provide extra lesson where students could learn in slower pace than in the

classroom. Moreover, if the students still did not understand the material, the teacher preferred to send English video and recommended students using digital vocabulary in case they did not understand the language. And the last was the teacher would pair the standard and advanced students so that they would not be left by the other students. Meanwhile, the teachers also tried to boost students' English skills by asking them reading Oxford novel and giving them story book with the audio.

**c. Students' Passive Participation in the Classroom**

The majority of students during online learning were likely to be passive and tend to keep silent during the learning process, unless the teacher pointed them one by one. Mrs. R stated that, "The students become passive and their productive skill especially speaking skill is decreasing" (TC/ITV1/12). As it mentioned before, the students sometimes could not join the meeting because of unstable internet connection or their device was might be broken, so that they could not participate actively in the classroom.

Since most of students were less participated and less interaction in the classroom, the teachers found difficulties in building students' confidence during online learning. Mrs. R mentioned, "It is hard to build their confidence during online learning, especially in speaking. Added with the condition of the



students, sometimes they turn off their camera during the class and they response us slowly” (TC/ITV3/12). These statements were supported by the observation data gained from the X grades below:

*T: I want you girls to ask some questions as I said before you need to prepare 1 question related to the topic that we are discussing today, right? So I want you to have one question to ask about subject and object question. From group 2, is there any question? C'mon girls, we are not going to keep silent, but we're having discussion here, which part that you understand and which part that you don't understand?*

*S: (All students remain silent)*

(TC/OBV2/030)

*T: Exactly, so the difference between the subject and object questions is the auxiliary verb. Instead of the auxiliary verb, we have ...?*

*S: (The students remain silent)*

(TC/OBV2/057)

From the data above, the students preferred to keep silent rather than answering teacher's questions. The students did not really confidence with themselves because they were afraid if their answer was wrong. In addition, they were also not confidence with their speaking ability especially when they spoke English.

As the solutions, the teachers should improve students' self-confidence. Usually, if there was no one who answers the teachers' questions, the teachers would point and ask question directly to students one by one, so that at least there was interaction between the teacher to students and vice versa. Mrs. R stated that “Boosting their interaction, I will give them direct questions” (TC/ITV3/11). At the condition, whether the students were willing

to answer the questions, they were needed to answer it since the teacher had pointed them. Another proof from observation data also can be seen below:

*T: I guess the time is almost over, so I think we should come to the conclusion of today's lesson. So anybody wants to retell or summarize what we learn today?*

*S: (Students keep silent)*

*T: Can I ask Anjani?*

*S: Yes miss.*

(TC/OBV3/066)

From the data above, it could be inferred that before the teacher pointed out one student to answer the questions, the students remained silent. But when the teacher had pointed out one student, the student was actually able to answer the question. Thus, the students were not confident with themselves to answer the teacher's question and to participate actively in the classroom.

Beside involving students in question and answer, the teacher also did some other activities in order to boost students' participation in the classroom. The teachers involved students in some activities, namely playing games, group discussion, and group presentation. Mrs. R stated that, "However, to engage them, I'll ask them many questions and I will also involve them in playing game" (TC/ITV3/11). Otherwise, group discussion and presentation could be proven by the observation data on XII grades as below:

*T: Ok thank you Tyas. So usually I will discuss with you all the meaning of each paragraph and the function, but for today it will be a group task for you guys to do. I will divide you into four rooms. In each room and please write down or take a note of your task. So room one, the task is writing 3a, room 2 is writing 3b and 3c, room three is writing 3d, and room four is writing 3e. these are the layout of the exercise so this is room one, red circle is room one, green circle is room two, blue circle is room three, and exercise E is room four. So far, is there any question for the exercise?*

*S: Clear Miss.*

*T: Ok it's already clear. The rules are I will give you ten minutes to discuss, and then after discussing it with your group, we will back to this main room and then you should share your idea or your answer by the guided questions before.*

*S: Yes Miss*

(TC/OBV4/40)

From the data above, the teacher asked students to finish a task which were provided in the book. They were divided into some groups and they needed to discuss the answers with their group and they presented their idea to other groups. During the presentation, the students used more English than Indonesian. Engaging the audience, the teacher would ask the other groups to give additional answers or to give any different answers.

Other than that, the teachers also involved students to join a quiz in online platform, namely Quizziz and Mentimeter. The teacher stated, "For grammar, I will use an application like Quizziz" (TC/ITV3/6). Meanwhile, Mentimeter is an online platform where the students who join can participate anonymously. The activity can be seen below:

*T: Good Alhamdulillah. To start our meeting today, I'd like to ask you to visit this link that I posted on the chat box. I have a little survey using Mentimeter. So the person who has just come please click this link and participate in the polling. Ok, so there is a question asking you "What's your greatest regret?" I will give you the example, mine, I'll go first. Mine is my greatest regret is spending too much money buying things that I don't really actually need. What about you? Ok you may just need to send or post your sentences using this website and don't worry your name will be hidden.*

(TC/OBV3/003)

The datum showed that the teacher opened the class by doing mini polling using Mentimeter and the teacher mentioned that their name will be hidden when they submitted their answers which meant their answer would remain anonymous. All in all, to support students' participation in the class, the teachers would involve students in question and answer activity, discussion and presentation, and playing games.

## **B. Discussion**

In this section, the researcher presents a discussion of the findings on the previous section based on the research questions which had been formulated before. Below is the discussion of the findings.

### **1. The Bilingual Model Used by English Teachers in Online Learning**

Based on the findings, the researcher found that there was not different between the bilingual model which was implemented in offline and online learning where the English teachers used 50-100% English

when they first introduced English as language instruction in matriculation program. The teachers then started to teach English using dominant English in the beginning of X grades until in the end of the end of X grades period. The teachers started teaching English using full English since the students in XI grades. It could be indicated that the English teachers used Transitional Bilingual Education (TBE) model since the teachers still used Indonesian in the beginning of the school and taught using full English in the end of school (May, Hill, & Tiakiwai, 2004).

Otherwise, there was a slightly different between the model's theories with its implementation in this school. The teachers did transition for less than one year and the teachers had been using the target language for around 50% - 100% in the beginning of the schooling. On the other word, the teachers teach English using dominant English or implementing English dominantly in teaching process from the beginning. The reasons of using dominant English in the beginning of the schooling were because each of new students had different English skills though they were at least in A2 level, school's policy that obligated teachers to use English as language instruction, and the students might be low motivated in using English if the teacher used more Indonesian than English in the classroom.

By applying this model, the teachers could balance the standard students and advanced students. Thus, even though the teachers should

change their teaching from offline to online learning, they could maintain their teaching by implementing the same model in teaching English.

## **2. The Bilingual Strategy Used by English Teachers in Online Learning**

There were many bilingual strategies that could be implemented in grammar and main course classes, namely bilingual resources, metalinguistic strategies, nonlinguistic strategies and translanguaging (Schwartz & Asli, 2014). Based on the findings found in the field, the teachers applied some activities in the opening activity in order to recall students' memory of previous lesson and after explaining materials in order to check students' understanding. The teachers applied the activities in form paraphrasing, summarizing and comparing sentences, so that they were indicated using metalinguistic strategies (Euch & Huot, 2015). The activities were in form of pair work, gallery showroom, group work, brain storming, summarizing and paraphrasing story. Moreover, these activities were done by students individually or students' study groups. However, the teachers applied these activities regarding to the textbook materials mixed with authentic materials, students' needs, and online learning condition. Thus, applying these collaborative activities within inserting authentic material and students' interests were effective to improve students' skills especially in reading, writing, speaking, and listening.

Other than that, the teachers also seemed using translanguaging strategy since the teachers, especially who taught X grades, switched the

languages during the teaching learning process. This was used to bridge students' language on the transition phase of using Indonesian to English as the language instruction. One of the teachers had mentioned that she switched or translated the language in order to make the students understand the course material and to adjust the time with the material which were in line with the function of translanguaging that was to facilitate the interaction between the students and the teachers and to save time to explain the material to the students during teaching learning process (Rahmawansyah, 2019). Moreover, translanguaging was also used to provide the communication between students and teachers especially for giving clear explanation and to clarify whether the students had understood (Rahmawansyah, 2019). All in all, the teachers concluded that they used the same strategies like they used in the offline learning, but they only modified some activities that could not be conducted online.

### **3. The Challenges Faced by English Teachers in Applying Bilingual Models and Strategies during Online Learning**

Challenges faced by English teachers in applying certain models and strategies especially in online learning were various, depending on the condition of the teachers, students, and also the schools. There were three the problems faced by the English teachers during implementing the model and strategy during online learning in SMAN Banua Kalimantan Selatan. The first problem was technical problem. Since the

online learning was not something that had been expected before, the schools and the teachers did not prepare for conducting online learning. Fortunately, the teachers had special teachers training to prepare themselves on conducting online learning because teacher training was really needed to help teachers design effective learning atmosphere during the teaching learning process (Prameswari & Budiyanto, 2018). Thus, the teachers chose Zoom for having virtual meeting with students because it supported screen sharing and screen record so that when the students missed the class, the teachers could give them the recording (Rahman & Daulay, 2021). Commonly, the students did not understand how to utilize the media because Zoom was a new medium for them. Adding by the condition where some of them living in rural area that did not support good internet connection interfered them from joining the class and participated actively in the classroom. Their unstable internet connection hindered them to stay in Zoom room and to listen teachers' voice clearly (Arum, 2021). Other than that, the teachers' connection was also unstable, so that they could not turn on their camera and present their slides properly. As the solution, the teachers sent the materials to WhatsApp Group and Google Classroom because these online media could be accessed anytime and it supported the students for studying by themselves in their home.

The second problem was students' diversity level of English and material complexity. Since the students came from different regions and



different educational background, they had different English level. Therefore, the teachers needed to adjust the students' level with the school's obligatory that the teachers had to use English as language instruction. In addition, the Cambridge book that the school used was full English and the teachers needed to finish the book in shorter period. This was because in online learning, the class was only held for thirty minutes until one hour per meeting. However, some of the students could comprehend the material fast and did not have trouble with the language instruction, while the others needed more time to comprehend it and had to struggle with the language instruction. As the solution, the teachers tried to improve students' understanding toward the material by sending them additional educational video which was related to the material (Widahyu, 2020), giving them extra lesson, and pairing the standard students with the advanced students. The teacher also tried to improve students' mastery especially in reading and listening by giving them extra works, namely reading Oxford novels and listening to English stories (Male & Sihite, 2019). However, the teachers did not recommend the students to use any bilingual sources and the teachers preferred to recommend students English educational video and digital dictionary.

The third problem was students' passive participation in the classroom. During online learning, the majority of the students were more passive in the classroom. This was because of some factors, namely unstable internet connection, broken device, and students' anxiety in

speaking English because they do not have sufficient vocabularies to be used. Overcoming the condition, the teachers tried to improve students' self-confidence and involve students in many activities by asking direct questions to students, doing discussion and presentation, and playing games using online media, namely Mentimeter, Kahoot, Bamboozle and Quizziz. By creating interesting and supportive atmosphere in the classroom, the students would enjoy learning in the classroom and the students were possible to be confident and motivated during the learning process (Tsymbal, 2019).

All in all, the teachers could overcome the problems which were rising during online learning and they could still implement the model and strategies that were implemented during offline learning.