

CHAPTER IV

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

In this chapter, the researcher will present the outcomes of this research and the corresponding analytical discussion based on the data that was collected through observation, interviews, and documentation. This investigation was conducted to answer the research question which focused on the implications of the implementation of Project Based Learning using Instagram Carousel in terms of learning English and the Challenges faced by the teacher throughout the process. This research has enabled the researcher to gain a comprehensive insight into the effects of Project Based Learning on the students and how the teachers have managed the process. Therefore, the findings of this research will be presented and discussed in the following section.

A. Findings

The results are collected from observation, interviews with the teacher, and documentation.

1. The Implementation of Project-Based Learning to Learn English using Instagram Carousel

This research was conducted from November 1st until January 1st, 2022 at MTsN 3 Hulu Sungai Selatan, with a strong focus on the teachers as the main participants in the classroom. The researcher investigated by using observation and interviews as the main methods of data collection. The data collected was then analyzed using

descriptive qualitative techniques, namely by describing, interpreting, and making sense of all the data collected to develop a comprehensive understanding of the research topic. The researcher then combined all these data to form a general and comprehensive picture of the research outcomes.

The research was conducted by observing the predetermined observation and interview guidelines and was based on existing theories. Thus, research conducted on English teachers of class VII at MTsN 3 Hulu Sungai Selatan regarding the implementation of project-based learning yielded the following data:

a. Meeting 1

On November 2, 2022, the researcher conducted the first observation in the classroom during the learning process. After the teacher greeted the students and took attendance, the teacher began introducing the material to be studied. The teacher showed a picture of several wild animals on the projector and asked the students questions; "What do you see in the picture?" and then "What is your favorite animal?". A few of the students began to answer enthusiastically, while others seemed to be a bit more hesitant to respond. As responses started coming in, the teacher encouraged each student's answers and explained the concept further.

According to the interview, the teacher explained that the selection of topics and project themes is based on the student's level of ability, taking into account their current knowledge and understanding. He also mentioned that the language aspect to be studied is the use of present tense and the students' vocabulary about adjectives, and as a result, the topics and themes to be employed should be relevant and closely related to the student's daily life and experiences. This enables the students to gain a better understanding of the language, as they can draw on their own experiences when learning and applying the language. Moreover, the teacher also mentioned that it is important to choose topics and themes which are interesting and engaging to the students, and which provide them with opportunities to demonstrate their creativity and knowledge.

After the question was answered, the teacher then introduced the purpose of the lesson that was taking place. The teacher stated that this lesson would help the students develop their English language skills by developing a project-oriented around the theme of animals. Then the teacher introduced new questions "Do you use Instagram often?" and "What can you learn from Instagram?". The teacher also showed some examples of projects that the students could do. The teacher showed some Instagram posts that contained multiple pictures, arranged in a carousel format. This feature,

known as Instagram Carousel, enables users to swipe right or left on the images to view all the content in the post.

b. Meeting 2

The second meeting took place on Wednesday, November 3, 2022. The researcher conducted an observation of the learning activities in the classroom. The learning began with a greeting and prayer, followed by a roll call. The teacher then split the class into 4 groups consisting of 6-7 students by making each student count to 4 in sequence, and gathered with the same-number students. Student were asked to name their group with their chosen animal. Then the teacher showed a YouTube video with a projector that had been prepared. The video showed various animals in the wild, including animals in the tropical rainforest, grasslands, oceans, and others. In addition, the video also showed simple adjectives to describe the behavior or characteristics of the animals displayed.

After the video was played twice, the teacher then gave the students a task to categorize the animals in the video according to their type of food, that is to group the carnivorous, herbivorous and omnivorous animals. Based on the teacher's explanation, this activity invites students to delve deeper into their study topics. Students are allowed to find out more about the animals in the video, and to delve into information about the food they consume and how to categorize them. The teacher explained that using

various sources of information, such as textbooks, the internet, and others, students are invited to confirm their answers and increase their ability to find out about the world. The teacher added that this activity also helps students to sharpen their thinking skills, enrich their insights, and apply the knowledge they have acquired. The teacher also made sure that students know the meaning of each answer to add to their vocabulary.

c. Meeting 3

The next meeting took place on November 9, 2022. The teacher began with a warm greeting and a prayer and then proceeded to check attendance and ask about the condition of the students. Afterward, the students resumed their work in the groups that had been divided the previous week. After a brief interview, the teacher explained the importance of maintaining a balance in each group to prevent any student from dominating the group. To ensure this, the teacher separated the potentially dominant students which often time sit closely together, and distributed them fairly among the various groups. With this, the teacher hoped to create a more collaborative and constructive learning environment, where each student had the chance to contribute their unique perspectives and ideas.

The teacher reminded the students of the lesson from last week, which was the classification of animals based on their type of food. The students seemed enthusiastic and eager to show their work and make sure to the teacher that their work was on the right track. The teacher took out worksheets from the students and inquired about their progress in the given topic. He asked the students quick questions about their worksheets; "What is the meaning of Omnivore?", "What is "plant"?", "What does an elephant eat?" and so on. With this, the teacher was able to understand the student's level of knowledge and the words they knew. He believed that this kind of quick questioning activity was sufficient to give an overall picture of the student's understanding so that he could take further action if needed. Though this kind of questioning was not an effective way to assess the students' detailed progress, it was a good way to gauge their vocabulary skills in general.

The teacher showed an Instagram post in carousels about animals, and the task given to the students was to select their favorite animal that they had discussed in the group. This animal would be made into an Instagram Carousel, which is a slide image post on Instagram, and the post had to include a description of the animal's color, size, food, abilities, and habitat. After the selection was made, the students were asked to create the carousel post, ensuring that all the details about the animal were included in the

post. Before that, students were asked to fill out a worksheet about the characteristics and description of the animal in a worksheet. To help the students in their task, the teacher provided examples of other Instagram carousels about animals, so that the students could have a better understanding of what was expected of them.



Figure 4.1 Teacher Example of Instagram Carousel

According to the interview, the teacher chose Instagram because the students were already quite familiar with it. It was important for the teacher to ensure the ease and comfort of the students in using the application, and it was for this reason that the teacher also decided to use Canva for the project. The students had already been introduced to the platform in the semester and were already comfortable with it, making it the perfect choice for the learning activity. With the familiarity and simplicity of uploading posts on

Instagram and editing on Canva, the teacher was confident that the students would be able to use it and get the most out of the project.

During the discussion activity of each group, the students seemed enthusiastic about their work even though there were still some students who did not actively participate and tended to be silent. There was also one group that understood their task well so they did not open a discussion space in their group. And of course, there were many questions about difficult vocabulary that they did not know in English. Finally, the finished work was then checked by the teacher, of course paying attention to the language aspects used by the students. For those who have not had the opportunity to complete their task, it will be continued in the next meeting. For the upcoming meeting, the teacher has requested that students bring their phones, and ensure responsible use of the devices. The teacher has instructed that the phones should only be used for this subject, and not for any other purpose.

d. Meeting 4

On November 10, 2022, the next observation was carried out. The learning began with a greeting and prayer to start the class. After that, the teacher proceeded to the attendance check, and surprisingly, only two students were absent. This was understandable as it was raining heavily outside, and the two absent

people were not many compared to other classes. The teacher then gave out congratulations and appreciation to those present at that time and asked what made them enthusiastic that day. The students replied that it was due to their project, and they felt a strong sense of responsibility and enthusiasm to continue their work. The teacher then checked the students to if they bring their phones as instructed, and every group raised their team phones.

At this meeting, it was expected that all students had made the post framework according to the worksheet that was distributed at the previous meeting. The teacher mentioned that the parts that had already been completed would then begin the next activity, which is creating an Instagram post. Meanwhile, those who had not finished the framework were to finish it first before moving on to the next task. To make sure that everyone was on the same page, the teacher took the time to review the expectations and answer any questions that the students may have had. Furthermore, they emphasized the importance of paying attention to detail and ensuring that all the necessary elements were included in the framework that was presented. This was to ensure that everyone understood the expectations and had the necessary tools to complete the task.

The teacher explained that each student must complete their Instagram post using the Canva app to create a slide post. In order to make sure the post was done correctly, the teacher outlined the details that should be taken into account when creating the post, such as correct spelling and grammar, as well as the relevance of the content to the chosen theme. Once the post was finished, the post frame and Instagram post would be presented in class so the teacher and classmates could provide feedback. Furthermore, the teacher reminded the students to pay close attention to the details of their posts, as these would be the foundation for the quality of the post. By paying attention to the details, the post would be able to accurately portray the student's intentions, and provide an interesting and engaging post for the viewers.

e. Meeting 5

The next meeting took place on November 16, 2022. The teacher began the lesson with a greeting and prayer and then checked attendance. The students were given the task to present their edited Instagram posts from the previous meeting in front of the class. Before that, each group will choose a representative member to upload the Instagram carousel into his/her account.



Figure 4.2 Student Final Work Product

After the presentation, the teacher also opened a discussion room in the class to discuss their Instagram posts and asked them to pay attention to the results of other groups and make reflections on their work. The teacher delved into some aspects of their posts, such as why they chose the animal, how they divided the tasks, where they got the information from, and what they would improve if given the chance to do the same project based on the experience they gained after working and seeing the comparison from other groups, by asking them to write it on the reflection worksheet.

According to the researcher's interview with the teacher, he mentioned that the discussion was intended to see how far the students had understood the material taught and to evaluate their

learning process. Additionally, the teacher wanted to make sure that the students had fully grasped the concepts that were taught during the class. Additionally, the teacher asked the students some questions that were based on the topics that were discussed during the learning session. This was done to ensure that the students had a good understanding of the material that was presented. After the discussion was finished, the teacher ended the meeting by expressing gratitude and giving congratulations. He also encouraged the students to continue to work hard and strive for excellence in their studies.

2. The Challenges of Implementing Project-based Learning using Instagram Carousel

In this research, it is also hoped to gain the experience and personal opinion of the English teacher regarding the implementation of project-based English learning in class 7B MTsN Hulu Sungai Selatan. The researcher wants to know in more depth about the obstacles and challenges that have been and may be faced again by the English teacher in implementing the project-based learning method. Therefore, the researcher conducted an interview with the relevant English teacher to obtain more detailed information about this problem. The teacher was also asked about the advantages and disadvantages of implementing project-based learning. By delving deeper into this topic, it is hoped that the researcher can obtain accurate and comprehensive information

about the obstacles and challenges faced by the English teacher in implementing this method.

According to the interview, the teacher stated that the main obstacle in implementing project-based learning is the unevenness of students' level of ability. The teacher was aware of the imbalance among each group, so they tended to separate the potential dominant students and distribute them fairly in each group. The teacher said that "*Ketidakseragaman tingkat kemampuan siswa adalah hambatan utama dalam menerapkan pembelajaran berbasis proyek.*" He added that to address this issue, teachers should strive to create an inclusive environment where students can learn with mutual support and accountability, reduce the imbalance among students, and increase the productivity of the group.

In relation to the first challenge, the teacher also noticed that some students were not taking part in the group discussions as actively as others and that they tended to remain silent. Furthermore, the teacher was aware that there were still many questions about the more difficult English vocabulary, even though the students had been regularly learning and repeating it over the course of the same semester. This was a challenge for the teacher, who wanted to make sure that everyone was able to understand the language properly. Therefore, the teacher set out to find a way to ensure that everyone was able to understand the

vocabulary and that all students were actively participating in their group discussions.

The learning process was performed in a post-pandemic environment where traditional face-to-face learning had already resumed. Nevertheless, students still had to adjust to forming new relationships, due to having communicated mainly through the internet for a prolonged period of time. The teacher viewed this as a challenge as he encountered students whose characters had been altered. He remarked, "*Beberapa anak memang agak pendiam dan sulit untuk diajak berpartisipasi dan sebagian yang lain sangat aktif sehingga mendominasi.*" This requires teachers to strive harder to control the situation and create a comfortable atmosphere for everyone. The teacher tried to make sure everyone had a chance to speak their mind and even the more shy students got to be heard.

The teacher also mentioned that another obstacle, besides the disparity in students' abilities, was the scheduling and class hours. This was recognized as insufficient in each meeting to complete the discussions and assignments for the project. Students were forced to find and discuss information in a short amount of time, which of course made them feel pressured to finish their work well. For students who might need more time to understand the material and explore new ideas. In addition, the final exams schedule was just a few days away, since

the project was carried out at the end of the semester. This situation made students feel pressured to finish their project in a short amount of time, without having enough time to finish their work properly.

The technical challenges faced in this application were also one of the reasons that limited student creativity and exploration in the project. Teachers were aware that Canva had templates that could be accessed for free, but there were also paid templates that had more professional options and designs. For teachers, this gap could be a stimulus for students to be creative by taking advantage of the free templates available, but on the other hand it could also reduce the creativity of other students with monotonous choices.

The teachers acknowledged that they did not face any major challenges when explaining and providing guidance in this project learning. The students had gained enough experience through the previous semester project, where they used photo editing applications, particularly Canva. With practice, the students had become familiar with the Canva application and they could use it smoothly. In addition, the teachers guided them through the various stages of the learning process and provided materials including the language aspects required for this project.

B. Discussions

The collected data from observations, interviews, and documentation is presented and described in the findings in great detail. This data is then thoroughly analyzed and reported systematically following the formulation of the problem. This problem focuses on the implementation and teacher challenges of project-based learning at the 7 grades of MTSN 3 Hulu Sungai Selatan, to provide an understanding of the issues faced by teachers in the implementation of project-based learning.

To gain a better understanding, the data collected was thoroughly analyzed, and the results of this analysis are presented in the section below.

1. The Implementation of Project-based Learning to Learn English using Instagram carousel is, in the 7th grade English class of MTsN 3 Hulu Sungai Selatan.

As Poonpon (2017) noted, PjBL is an instructional approach that emphasizes student-centered learning and interdisciplinary and integrated activities in the real world, which sets it apart from traditional instruction. It is clear that in this learning implementation process, the students have many opportunities to explore and develop their creative abilities freely without being tied to a strict and rigid assessment framework. In addition, in this way, students can develop their critical and innovative skills.

Additionally, Poonpon argued that PjBL is an effective teaching method that emphasizes the importance of contextualizing learning. By

presenting learners with meaningful problems to solve, or products to develop, PjBL encourages students to think outside the box and apply their knowledge in a real-world setting. As a result, students gain the skills and knowledge necessary to become successful in the 21st century.

Despite this, the topic and theme, which is about 'Animals Description', had been predetermined earlier by the teacher. Based on the interview with the teacher, this was due to the teacher feeling that the topic was already familiar to the students and could be easily arranged according to their level of ability, especially in English. The teacher assessed that this topic could be an interesting subject for the students, as they could discuss and debate about the animals they know and like. This decision could be said to be a "highly structured" project by the teacher. Stoller (2012) noted that beginners in project-based learning and students with lower skills will benefit the most from more structured projects, where most of the project elements have been predetermined by the teacher. The teacher will provide the theme, set the roles and responsibilities to be taken by the students, explain the steps to be taken, and provide the materials to be used. Thus, students can learn the basics of project learning without facing too high a risk. With the help of the teacher, students can succeed in the project by gradually increasing their skills. This will help students build confidence in learning and enhance their learning skills. So, there was

almost no discussion about whether or not to employ “Animal” as the theme of the lesson, rather the teacher predetermined and instructed it for the student to develop.

Although they were not given the opportunity to choose the learning theme, the students were still given the freedom to choose the animal they liked and chose. This gives them a clearer picture of their project and also boosts their pride in the project they are working on. Thus, students can better direct and focus their attention and also enhance their skills in doing the project. In addition, thanks to this freedom, they will also be more enthusiastic to work on the project, because they really like the animal they choose. This is in line with Stoller's (2012), that even with teacher-structured projects, students can benefit from being given the opportunity to express their opinions and contribute to the project, thus increasing their sense of ownership. Giving students choice is a powerful tool to help maintain ownership of the project, as well as increase student ownership. One effective way to achieve this is to give students choices in terms of topics within the theme. By giving students choices in topics, they can more enjoy the project and develop their sense of ownership. Thus, students can express their opinions with more creativity and their involvement in the project will increase. This can increase the productivity and quality of the project output and help students better understand the material and build useful skills.

In the first to third meetings, the teacher chose to delve deeper into the project theme of Animals, while ensuring that the students were focused and interested in the material presented. The teacher also provided the students with the vocabulary they needed to help them with their project, while also preparing them with the knowledge and skills needed for their project to run smoothly. In this way, the teacher can ensure that the students have a better understanding of the topic and can complete their projects better. This activity can be categorized as part of the initial process of project-based learning. It is important to ensure that the students understand the topic they will be learning well so that they can easily choose and develop the topic.

At the beginning of the project, ideally, three preparation aspects must be done according to Stoller (2012). These three stages are; 1) Agreeing on the theme, which focuses on the objectives and goals of the project; 2) Establishing the final result, such as the expected product output or results; and 3) Organizing the project from start to finish, including determining the appropriate learning stages, making a project schedule, and building a chronological picture that students will go through. However, in this learning process, the last stage is not clearly shown to the students.

At the end of the third meeting, we began to see the project come to a start. The teacher initiated the student grouping state, where they were

assigned the task of researching and gathering information about the Animal of their choice. They were given the freedom to search for information from all sources, including books, articles, and the internet; with the latter being the most popular. After collecting the necessary information, the students had to compile this into an Instagram carousel. As such, they were provided with guidance on the language aspects to ensure accuracy. This was an excellent opportunity for the students to improve their digital skills.

According to the phase grouping in project-based learning according to Stoller (2012), the academic phase is to gather, analyze, and report information. However, in carrying out all these tasks, the teacher and the students must still pay attention to the language aspects required in learning. At this stage, students begin to delve into the topics they are studying, and begin to ask questions. According to Larmer & Mergendoller (2015), in the information gathering stage, students acquire the knowledge and skills needed for the project with a combination of lesson materials and resources provided by the teacher and independent investigation. Students ask deeper questions as they learn more. This stage is clearly carried out by the teacher, staying close to the student discussion and providing answers to student questions.

During this academic phase, students are given the opportunity to improve their work results through corrections and clarifications. This

is seen in meeting 4 where the teacher checks the language aspects and accuracy of the information in each group. The teacher also gives the students the opportunity to improve their work according to their needs and provides input and guidance to make quality results. Larmer & Mergendoller (2015) emphasizes the importance of equipping students with the skills to create excellent products, think creatively, solve problems, and collaborate. To achieve this, they must be given feedback and opportunities to refine their work.

The last step in project-based learning is evaluation. This activity provides an opportunity for the teacher to share their insights with the students and review the results they have achieved. The evaluation is conducted during the fifth meeting, where the teacher invites the students to reflect on the learning journey they have been through. Stoller (2012) suggests that students can think about the changes that have occurred in terms of their knowledge, skills and languages since the beginning of the project. They can also consider how the new information and skills they have acquired might be applied to other projects, whether it is in language classes, normal classes, or in the workplace.

Based on the discussion, the main difference between project-based learning (PjBL) implementation in this study and experts' theory is in the initial preparation stage. Here, students and the teacher are supposed

to discuss possible themes before choosing one. In the implementation, the student was told to explore a predetermined topic chosen by the teacher without consulting them.

2. The Challenges of Implementing Project-based Learning using Instagram Carousel

According to the observation and interview with the English teacher, in addition to the researcher witnessing the learning process, some obstacles were experienced by the teacher. These obstacles come from various aspects such as the time they have, the gap in student ability levels, and from the design tools they use. These obstacles are described and analyzed as follows:

a. The disparity in student skill

The main challenge encountered by students during the implementation of project-based learning according to Aldabbus (2018) is the imbalance of roles that occurs within the group. This imbalance has an impact on students, who are more dominant, can diminish the role of other students so that they are not brave enough to participate let alone express their ideas freely. This becomes a serious problem because it hinders the progress of the project. Therefore, the teacher tries to avoid role imbalance by random grouping. However, this strategy is still not effective overall in reducing role imbalance problems. Some of the underlying causes of this challenge are differences in students' basic abilities,

students' interest in certain topics, and the nature of the students themselves.

b. The time-consuming process

Aldabbus (2018) elaborated project-based learning has the disadvantage of activities that require a lot of time and attention. This is seen in the learning where the teacher realizes that the available time is not enough for the students to finish the discussion and explore their work. This is due to project-based learning having a tendency to become very detailed, taking a long time to complete. This can be categorized as a barrier to the curriculum and the teacher's limitations in designing the learning. This is because most projects require more time than planned, which can cause problems in meeting the learning time target.

c. The limited learning tools

The learning tool used to create Instagram carousels was Canva, a free application allowing users to design based on available templates. The free version of the application has limited options, and to access more advanced features, users must purchase the paid version. Unlike physical learning tools, software like Canva is not easily integrated into school budgets. This challenge is in line with the findings of Aldabbus (2018), which suggest that schools often lack the necessary materials and facilities to support projects. This

can be attributed to a lack of financial resources allocated to such projects. Different projects demand different materials and facilities, and if a school does not have the necessary budget, it may be difficult for teachers to effectively implement Project-Based Learning.