

CHAPTER IV
FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

A. Findings

1. The Types of English Shaming

There were several types of English shaming found and emerged from the interviews and participant observations. The types of English shaming faced by Banua Kalsel Bilingual Boarding State Senior High School students (from all 72 students that experienced English shaming) are as follows.

Table 4.1

The Types of English Shaming

No.	The Types	Including	Total of Students
1	Laughing	a. Laughing at your mistakes in using English	41 students
2	Verbal shaming	a. Saying “ <i>Sok Inggris!</i> ” (“Do not pretend to be English!”) b. Saying “ <i>Anak Jaksel!</i> ” (“Jaksel kids!”) c. Saying “ <i>Sombong!</i> ” (“Such a show-off!”)	41 students 19 students 8 students

Table 4.1
The Types of English Shaming

No.	The Types	Including	Total of Students
		d. Saying “ <i>Gak cinta Indonesia!</i> ” (“You don’t love Indonesia!”)	5 students
		e. Saying “ <i>Sok bule!</i> ” (“American/British wannabe!”)	2 students
		f. Saying “ <i>Sok Inggris nih anak!</i> ” (“Hey kid! Do not pretend to be English!”)	1 student
		g. Saying “ <i>Kamu hidup di negara Indonesia bukan di Inggris!</i> ” (“You live in Indonesia, not in England!”)	1 student
		h. Saying “ <i>Kayak kumur-kumur!</i> ” (“You are gargling!”)	1 student
		i. Saying/commenting “ <i>Jelek!</i> ” (“Bad!”)	1 student
		j. Saying “This is Indonesia no England no USA!”	1 student

Table 4.1

The Types of English Shaming

No.	The Types	Including	Total of Students
		k. Saying “ <i>Raja Inggris!</i> ” (“English King!”)	1 student
		l. Saying “ <i>Dewa Inggris!</i> ” (“English god!”)	1 student
		m. Saying “ <i>Si paling Inggris!</i> ” (“The most English person!”)	1 student
		n. Saying “RIP grammar!” (“Rest in peace grammar!”)	1 student
		o. Saying “ <i>Uma ai!</i> ” (“Really!?”)	1 student
		p. Saying “ <i>Widih udah bisa bahasa Inggris nih!</i> ” (“Wow! Now you can speak in English!”) in a mocking way	1 student
		q. Saying “SJW!” (Social Just Warrior!)	1 student
		r. Saying “ <i>Sok Inggris lo! Gak cinta Indonesia ya?</i> ” (Such a	1 student

Table 4.1

The Types of English Shaming

No.	The Types	Including	Total of Students
		pretentious English speaker, don't you love Indonesia?")	
		s. Saying " <i>Buset bahasa Inggris, maaf kami tidak paham!</i> " (“Wow English, sorry, we don't understand!”)	1 student
		t. Commenting " <i>Ngapain pakai bahasa Inggris?</i> " (“Why do you use English?”)	1 student
3	Imitating	a. Imitating your mistakes repetitively (e.g., mispronouncing “student”, “gone”, or “know”)	40 students
		b. Imitating “What's so funny?”, “super weird”, and “brutally honest” in a mocking way.	My own experience
4	Ignoring	a. Ignoring someone that speaks English	1 student

Table 4.1

The Types of English Shaming

No.	The Types	Including	Total of Students
		b. Alienating someone who speaks English well	1 student
		c. Pretending to listen	1 student

First, laughing, this kind of English shaming usually happened when they found someone who used English made mistakes in using it. Furthermore, sometimes they also told their friend who got shamed the correct way of using it after laughing. Second, verbal shaming, this type of English shaming had the most varieties of examples. These verbal shaming acts were usually targeted to the competency in using English as well as the use of English itself. Third, imitating also became one of the most apparent emerging themes of English shaming. Imitating was usually done by repeating the mistakes that someone did or imitating what someone said in a mocking way. Fourth, ignoring, this one was quite different from the rest. Ignoring in this case happened to the student who had an advanced level of English. When he tried to speak in English with their friends, they just pretended to listen to what he said but they actually did not. They also sometimes changed the topic or went to talk to other friends. These acts left

the student who tried to speak English felt isolated because he did not really have any friends to talk to. Therefore, among all these four major types of English shaming, laughing and commenting “*Sok Inggris!*” were the most frequent English shaming found.

Most of the expressions mentioned above were found from the interviews. However, I did encounter some English shaming practices throughout the years before the research and during the actual research itself. One of them was labeling me as “*Jaksel Abi*” (*Abi* means older brother) for the way I spoke since I usually mixed my Bahasa Indonesia and English. They did not say it straight in front of me, but when they talked with their peers. However, I knew it when the other students told me about it.

I also found several English shaming practices during my participant observation. To begin with, I found one of the students saying “*Sok Inggris!*” as he pointed to the game’s description written on the whiteboard on Saturday night when the students usually had a weekend activity. He was just saying “*Sok Inggris!*” as he found out that the description was written in English. In addition, I also found an English shaming act when they had a speech program. When the speaker mispronounced some words, some of the students laughed because of his unclear pronunciation. Furthermore, I also got English shaming practice when the students imitated what I had

said such as “What’s so funny?”, “super weird”, “brutally honest” in a mocking and comedic way. For this imitation, they did not imitate them right after I said these things, but they said these things at other times.

The English programs in this school unfortunately still cannot reach their full potential yet. In the Speech program, some students were still unprepared to deliver the speech. Many other students who did not deliver the speech that day also fell asleep during the activity. Furthermore, some of the students who were in charge of giving the feedback also usually gave very short feedback or merely restated what the speakers had said and did not give their point of view. In the Discussion program, some students still dominated the activity and the other students just gave a very short sentence to react to their friends. The students sometimes also failed to address the key point of the topic. The discussion of the topic “The terraforming of Mars: Is it really possible to live on it?”, for example, could be better if the students explained the definition of terraforming in the first place. However, the students just discussed the common features of Mars and the possibility to live there in general. In the English Day program, the responsible student from the student council was a bit hesitant to start the program in full force. In the end, the program only run once a week. In this program, many students were uncharacteristically quiet and showed the unwillingness to communicate. Some of them even still preferred to speak in Bahasa Indonesia even though they knew that it was English Day.

Besides those English shaming acts, I also encountered two students showing their opinion about English Day. One of them said “*Gak usah ngomong, ribet banget!*” (“You do not have to speak, it is simple!”) and the other one said “*Gak usah berkata-kata kalau kada penting*” (“Do not speak unless it is important”). These attitudes showed that they still had this kind of conception toward the use of English, especially for English Day in this case.

2. The Reasons behind English Shaming

The reasons for getting English shaming varied from merely speaking English, having “bad” English, or even having “too advanced” English. The emerging themes for getting English shaming had a lot to do with the use of English itself. In addition, the level of ability in English also had a tendency to trigger English shaming. The reasons for getting English shaming (from my 16 chosen participants) are shown in the table below.

Table 4.2

The Reasons for Getting English Shaming

No.	The Reasons	Including	Total of Students
1	Speaking English	a. Speaking or using English in general	8 students

Table 4.2

The Reasons for Getting English Shaming

No.	The Reasons	Including	Total of Students
2	Bad English	a. Grammar mistake	2 students
		b. Mispronouncing	8 students
		c. “Funny” accent	1 student
		d. Blanking out mid-sentence	1 student
3	Too advanced English	a. Speaking in English fluently	1 student
		b. Using advanced vocabulary	1 student

As seen in the table above, English shaming could happen just simply because someone was using English. In addition, two polarizing points of the reasons for getting English shaming here were bad English or too advanced English. The students who made mistakes, mispronounced, used incorrect grammar, had a funny accent, or got blanked mid-sentence were usually got English shaming practices. On the other extreme, the student who had an advanced level of English could also become a target of English shaming when he used advanced vocabulary or spoke fluently

that made the other students tend to ignore him for it. In addition, one student also stated that it was a lot easier to speak in Bahasa Indonesia or Banjarese rather than English despite the bilingual system that they had.

To add the point of bad English that became one of the reasons for getting English shaming. English shaming here, especially laughing, was infectious. Many students stated that they laughed when they found the other friends were also laughing at their classmate who had a mistake in using English. To echo that, some students also unfortunately had the idea of doing a “revenge” on the other students since they had got English shaming in the first place. In addition, many students also referred shaming someone when they use English as a joke. Therefore, the reasons for doing English shaming are mentioned in the table below.

Table 4.3

The Reasons for Doing English Shaming

No.	The Reasons	Including	Total of Students
1	Having negative language ideologies toward English	a. Having negative conceptions toward people who speak or use English (People that speak English seen as	3 students

Table 4.3

The Reasons for Doing English Shaming

No.	The Reasons	Including	Total of Students
		pretentious, arrogant, less nationalistic, or weird)	
		b. Not meeting the ideal image of what English speakers should be (mispronouncing, grammar mistakes, funny accent, blanking out mid- sentence, or even too advanced English)	5 students
2	Taking “revenge”	a. Taking revenge because they have been shamed before (They want to do the same to other people)	3 students
3	Seeing others doing	a. Getting carried away to do English shaming because they see other	6 students

Table 4.3

The Reasons for Doing English Shaming

No.	The Reasons	Including	Total of Students
	English shaming	people do it in the first place (For instance, laughing as you see the other people are laughing at someone's mistakes in English)	

3. The Places of English Shaming

The places of getting English shaming are shown in the table below.

Table 4.4

The Places for Getting English Shaming

No.	The Places	Total of Students
1	Inside of the school	13 students
2	Outside of the school	3 students
3	Online	2 students

Although this research mainly focused on English shaming at Banua Kalsel Bilingual Boarding State Senior High School, which was the school

scope, I had realized that English shaming could also happen beyond the setting. That was why I intentionally chose my research title as it was, not limiting it and putting it into a school box. I found that the students sometimes also got shamed on social media and outside of the school. To begin with, the students obviously got the shaming within the school context. English shaming could happen in different places at school such as classrooms, dormitories, mosque, and others. In the classroom, they usually got English shaming in the form of laughing or mocking when they were making mistakes in English when they presented a topic whether it was in English class or science classes. At the dormitories, they usually got English shaming when they put English in between their Bahasa Indonesia when they talk. At the mosque, they usually got English shaming related to the Speech and Discussion program that occurred there. Basically, the students could get English shaming in the school environment in general or where they had to use English or where English-related dormitory programs took place. Inside of the school context, the students usually got English shaming in the form of laughing, verbal shaming, imitating, and ignoring.

The students also sometimes got English shaming online, usually on Instagram. They usually got shamed by their friends for their posts when they used English as the caption. Furthermore, some of them also got English shaming when they commented on other people's posts using English. For example, "*Ngapain pakai bahasa Inggris?*" ("Why do you

speak in English?”). In addition, for outside of the school context, they usually got English shaming when they met their friends and families while unconsciously putting English in between their Bahasa Indonesia. For example, their friends said “*Widih udah bisa bahasa Inggris nih!*” (“Wow! Now you can speak in English!”) in a mocking way or showed discomfort when you unconsciously did code-switching or code-mixing by saying “*Uma ai*” (“Really!?”). For the outside of the school and online context, the type of English shaming found was verbal shaming.

As seen above, the students usually got English shaming in three main places including the school environment itself, outside of the school setting, and online context. In line with these places, the people who usually did English shaming were their classmates or friends of the school, the social media users, and friends and families while being outside.

4. The Effects of English Shaming

The effects of English shaming found from the research are as follows.

Table 4.5

The Effects of English Shaming

No.	The Effects	Including	Total of Students
1	Negative Effects	a. Down	3 students
		b. Self-doubting	2 students

Table 4.5

The Effects of English Shaming

No.	The Effects	Including	Total of Students
		c. Low self-esteem	2 students
		d. Unmotivated to learn	1 student
		e. Overthinking	1 student
		f. Social alienation	1 student
2	Positive Effects	a. Motivating to study English more	3 students

It was found that English shaming gave many negative effects for the people who got shamed. The negative effects as stated by the students were feeling down, self-doubting, low self-esteem, unmotivated to learn, overthinking, and social alienation. These effects triggered the students' unwillingness to use English. Surprisingly, in this research, there was one positive effect of English shaming that was motivating the students to study English more. However, the negative effects of English shaming in this research were much more apparent.

5. The importance of a Supportive English Learning Environment

To collect this data, I interviewed one of the English teachers of this school. I found out that she had a “Class Contract” when she was teaching one of the classes. The class contract actually consisted of two important points, “1. Respect Others” and “2. Speak English”. She always made a class contract before the beginning of each semester so that the teacher and the students had the same goals. She also wanted her students to study and speak because they wanted to, not because they wanted to avoid the punishments nor merely crave for rewards or compliments. When both parties invested in the class contract, it was expected that it would impact students’ interaction mode, when students realized that speaking English was necessary for their own good.

From the interview, she also mentioned that it was crucial to have a supportive or positive language learning environment. Considering that it was a bilingual school, it was highly demanded that every single student has the ability to speak for both daily basis and academic context. Therefore, it was the job of the teachers and school authorities to provide a supportive language learning for students to apply their English. In this context, an English teacher could provide an English-speaking class where every student was obligated to utter no words but English and respect others that try to speak or use the language. Furthermore, the school authority might

help by providing supportive programs which promoted the entire school citizens to converse in English. To sum up, she remarked that there were three important things to make an English-speaking culture, including student-oriented school programs, a healthy or supportive learning environment, and an adequate English acquisition.

The teacher rarely came across English shaming. However, she did encounter English shaming practices in her classes once or twice. To reflect on this, I also found the emerging theme that the students had the tendency to act a certain way to certain people. I discovered that XI A Class was more expressive considering that we were quite close so that I could experience and witness English shaming practices.

Throughout the research, I also discovered that the students started to be aware that the things they do for mocking English or the people that use English were actually the acts of English shaming. They usually pointed out when someone actually did English shaming by saying “Oh, that is English shaming!”. This showed that they started to be aware of this issue.

B. Discussion

1. The Types of English Shaming

Bilingual education system plays a major role in shaping the way students of Banua Kalsel Bilingual Boarding State Senior High School use

English. Bilingual education system indeed gives them the exposure to English so that they usually use it in a formal learning setting or casually put it in between their daily conversation. This is in line with a remark from Jayanti and Sujarwo (2019, p. 18), the use of English in this bilingual education system gives the students an exposure to the language in order to generate a bilingual mind. It is obvious that English has been a part of their life. The English-related programs also play an important role in shaping how the students use and perceive English.

The use of English at this school, however, still has some stigma upon it. Even though the bilingual system gives the students an opportunity to use it, English has not reached the point where it is perceived as a common occurrence in daily conversation. The use of English is still limited to certain extents only, the school learning activities that use English and English-related programs. Many students still find Indonesian to be the easiest language to communicate and do not bother to try to speak English besides the programs and system used at this school. This conception goes accordingly with what Lauder (2009) says about Indonesians that still prefer Bahasa Indonesia to English as well as its position as a foreign language in Indonesia.

Some of the students still find it strange when other students use or speak in English. This conception toward English and the people who use

it is still apparent. They think that the students that use English are being arrogant or funny and eventually being a subject of mockery. Therefore, these conceptions as well as an insufficient exposure to English go hand in hand in shaping the way students perceive English. Those negative notions about English or the ways of using it can eventually lead to English shaming.

As Piller (2017) remarks, English shaming can be described as an act of shaming or mocking English or ways of using it. In her study, Piller does not categorize types of English shaming specifically. Therefore, the types of English shaming in this research were put in different types based on the similarities and differences among English shaming practices. In this research, 4 emerging English shaming types that were found including laughing, mocking, imitating, and ignoring.

Although the specific classification of the types of English shaming is not explained by Piller (2017), she does give a guideline whether the act is considered as language shaming or not according to her definition about it. Furthermore, Nguyen (2019) arranges types of language shaming by the emerging themes detected in their research.

Among these types of English shaming, laughing and verbal shaming were the most frequently found types of English shaming. This is related with what Piller (2016) says, making fun of English speaker is one

of the apparent English shaming practices. As Piller (2017) also argues, language shaming can be described as an interaction both in real life or on social media that mocks or degrades certain ways of using certain language. This English shaming practices also has a lot to do with the language ideologies that the students have toward English such as believing that there is only one ideal way of using or speaking English. In addition, when someone fail to reach this standard, it definitely can trigger English shaming practices (Nguyen, 2019, p. 20; Piller, 2016, p. 203). As a result, laughing and verbal shaming are no surprise being the most common English shaming found since English shaming is pervasive.

2. The Reasons behind English Shaming

Besides the use of English itself, English shaming has a lot to do with the competencies of using English that someone has. Since the use of English at Banua Kalsel Bilingual Boarding State Senior High School is still seen as an uncommon occurrence in daily conversation, some students find it strange when someone uses English or puts it in between their conversation. This certain language ideology that they have toward English leads to English shaming practices. This is in line with what Nguyen (2019, p. 4) says, language shaming takes place because of existing ideologies

about language and they are usually negative conceptions about language that trigger language shaming to happen.

English shaming also has a lot to do with someone's level of English. Both bad English and too advanced English are targets of English shaming. Failing to meet the perceived idea of how English speakers should be is an apparent reason for English shaming. This situation fails to meet an ideal standard or a certain level normativity. On the other hand, students who have an advanced level of English also experienced English shaming. It can be seen that English shaming is not only given when someone cannot meet the ideal standard of using English but also when they "exceed" a particular standard (Nguyen, 2019, p. 20; Piller, 2016, p. 203). It can be seen that the students have their own ideal standard of how an English speaker should be.

3. The Places of English Shaming

In this research, English shaming was mostly found at the school environment where the students usually used it both in academic and daily context. The major emerging places for English shaming are in the classrooms (where learning and teaching activities take place), dorms (daily conversation), and mosque (where Speech and Discussion program take place). Not only that, English shaming also happens online when they

usually post a task on Instagram when they use English as the caption or when they comment on other people's comment section. In addition, English shaming also happens when the students go back home. Some of them usually get English shaming from friends and families for the way they put English in between their Bahasa Indonesia when they speak.

These places where English shaming happens support the remark by Piller (2017) where English shaming happens both in real life and online settings. To echo this, it also shows that the people that usually do English shaming are their classmates or friends at school and friends and families outside of the school context and social media users for online context.

4. The Effects of English Shaming

Piller (2017) states that English shaming practices can lead to some detrimental impacts on the people who get shamed such as low self-confidence, insecurity of using the language, or even social alienation. This harmful practice can lead to insecure society and language inferiority (Farhana, 2021; Piller, 2017). In this research, many negative effects are found including feeling down, self-doubting, low self-esteem, unmotivated to learn, overthinking, and social alienation. However, there is also a positive effect of English shaming practices that is motivating the students to study English more. Therefore, the negative effects of English shaming

are far more than the positive effect. These effects also impact the willingness of the students to communicate in English. It is necessary to overcome and prevent English shaming to happen in order to avoid these unwanted effects that are discouraging for the students.

5. The importance of a Supportive English Learning Environment

From the preceding parts of the findings and discussion, English shaming practices of Banua Kalsel Bilingual Boarding State Senior High School students has some key characteristics including that it is usually considered as “just” a joke, it is contagious, and it can provoke a revenge.

Those characteristics are very discouraging, especially when English shaming comes into contact with the students who genuinely want to learn English. It is obvious that English shaming causes many negative effects for the people who get shamed. Another point worth noting is that sometimes people camouflage negativity as a joke. This negativity spreads even more with its contagion and the revenge motive if we do not do anything to it. English shaming does provoke the students’ unwillingness to use English.

When it is seen as a whole, the majority of the students of Banua Kalsel Bilingual Boarding State Senior High School still have a good

attitude toward English. However, English shaming that happens to these impacted students cannot be ignored or normalized.

To overcome English shaming, the first step that can be done is to be aware that English shaming actually happens and it has many negative effects. Once we are aware of this issue, it is the time to raise awareness of others by reminding them about it.

Since this research usually points out the issue of English shaming, the students start to be aware of it. However, it does not stop there. The message should be conveyed frequently enough so that they will be fully aware of this issue. In order to bring a positive and meaningful change, it certainly does not happen overnight. The message should be repeated over and over again. The importance of raising awareness has also been addressed by Abeysena and Abeywickrama (2020) as well as Abeysena and Liyanage (2020). When the people have the awareness, then the next steps including the teaching strategies can be formulated.

In the interview with the teacher, it can be seen that she uses several ways to create or provide a supportive language learning environment for the students. One of them is by using class contracts so that the students can have a chance to make the best use of their potential. By using it, she also ensures that the students have the opportunity to speak English in her classes. The school authority can also promote the supportive language

learning environment by encouraging the students to use English and respecting others or providing supportive school programs related to it. If the students and the school authority have the awareness of the importance of addressing this issue, it is hoped that everybody, especially the students can use or speak in English without being stigmatized or shamed in the environment where English shaming cannot foster and grow.