

CHAPTER IV

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

This chapter will reveal the result of research that conducted in MAN 4 Martapura about transfer effect of Indonesian grammar's schemata into English sentence building. The researcher will show the result of the research in the form of table which can be seen in finding part, and explain the content of the table specifically in discussion part.

A. Findings

After doing the research, the researcher analyzed the data one by one and grouped them based on the students or based on the type of questions. The researcher also gave score for the students to know about how much Indonesian's grammar schemata influence students in building English sentence.

There are three statements that have to be answered in this research. The first problem is about students' ability in English sentence building. The second problem is about the type of grammar transfer that occurs in English sentence building. The last problem is about the most difficult aspect of grammar that is likely influenced by Indonesian grammar. All of those problems will be answered by analyzing the data from the test that has been given to the students.

There were two types of question that had to be answered by students. The first one was multiple choices, and the second one was

translating sentences. Each type of question consists of 25 items, where each five items represent one English grammar aspect that most likely will be influenced by Indonesian grammar's schemata that students have. In other words, the probability of the transfer effect happened to those five English grammars is rather high.

1. Students' Ability in English Sentence Building at Eleventh Grade of MAN 4 Martapura in Academic Year 2014/2015

The first problem that should be answered in this research is about students' ability in English sentence building. It should be noted that to know the answer of that question, the researcher needed to take into consideration the data about students' score in multiple choice test and translation test.

As mentioned before, there were three classes that participate in this study. The total of them were 94 students: 37 students from XI IPA, 31 students from XI IPS A and 26 students from XI IPS B. The result of the test were varied based on the class, so did their score and score average. However, the researcher would like to draw the general conclusion about students score and score average of 94 students as a whole.

The students' score were obtained using formula as follows:

$$\boxed{X = \frac{\sum X}{N}}$$

Note:

X = Students Score

N = Total number of correct answer

A list of students' score can be seen in table below.

Table 4.1 Data about Students' Score in English Sentence Building Test

No	Students	Multiple Choice	Translating Sentence	Total	Score
1.	ID-1	15	6	21	42
2.	ID-2	18	9	27	54
3.	ID-3	16	4	20	40
4.	ID-4	20	16	36	72
5.	ID-5	15	10	25	50
6.	ID-6	17	15	32	64
7.	ID-7	18	6	24	48
8.	ID-8	20	14	34	68
9.	ID-9	14	8	22	44
10.	ID-10	14	4	18	36
11.	ID-11	12	19	31	62
12.	ID-12	15	17	32	64
13.	ID-13	21	15	36	72
14.	ID-14	15	10	25	50
15.	ID-15	12	17	29	58
16.	ID-16	16	11	27	54
17.	ID-17	14	10	24	48
18.	ID-18	9	7	16	32
19.	ID-19	13	6	19	38
20.	ID-20	22	16	38	76
21.	ID-21	16	14	30	60
22.	ID-22	17	13	30	60
23.	ID-23	17	12	29	58
24.	ID-24	16	13	29	58
25.	ID-25	15	7	22	44
26.	ID-26	19	9	28	56
27.	ID-27	14	4	18	36
28.	ID-28	23	17	40	80
29.	ID-29	16	9	25	50
30.	ID-30	12	5	17	34
31.	ID-31	12	9	21	42
32.	ID-32	12	5	17	34
33.	ID-33	20	12	32	64
34.	ID-44	17	11	28	56
35.	ID-55	12	12	24	48
36.	ID-66	10	7	17	34
37.	ID-77	14	10	24	48

Table 4.1. (Continued)

38.	ID-88	9	8	17	34
39.	ID-99	18	10	28	56
40.	ID-40	18	12	30	60
41.	ID-41	19	16	35	70
42.	ID-42	17	18	35	70
43.	ID-43	13	13	26	52
44.	ID-44	19	18	37	74
45.	ID-45	19	18	37	74
46.	ID-46	19	12	31	62
47.	ID-47	13	11	24	48
48.	ID-48	9	8	17	34
49.	ID-49	7	8	15	30
50.	ID-50	5	9	14	28
51.	ID-51	11	18	29	58
52.	ID-52	13	17	30	60
53.	ID-53	13	17	30	60
54.	ID-54	16	6	22	44
55.	ID-55	17	9	26	52
56.	ID-56	16	10	26	52
57.	ID-57	16	10	26	52
58.	ID-58	15	11	26	52
59.	ID-59	13	15	28	56
60.	ID-60	16	20	36	72
61.	ID-61	15	15	30	60
62.	ID-62	15	10	25	50
63.	ID-63	16	14	30	60
64.	ID-64	16	19	35	70
65.	ID-65	15	15	30	60
66.	ID-66	11	8	19	38
67.	ID-67	11	6	17	34
68.	ID-68	15	9	24	48
69.	ID-69	19	16	35	70
70.	ID-70	9	4	13	26
71.	ID-71	13	4	17	34
72.	ID-72	17	6	23	46
73.	ID-73	16	10	26	52
74.	ID-74	14	6	20	40
75.	ID-75	17	8	25	50
76.	ID-76	13	3	16	32
77.	ID-77	16	11	27	54
78.	ID-78	6	4	10	20
79.	ID-79	11	6	17	34
80.	ID-80	12	5	17	34
81.	ID-81	11	5	16	32

Table 4.1. (Continued)

82.	ID-82	12	5	17	34
83.	ID-83	10	6	16	32
84.	ID-84	11	4	15	30
85.	ID-85	15	10	26	52
86.	ID-86	16	10	26	52
87.	ID-87	14	6	20	40
88.	ID-88	11	6	17	34
89.	ID-89	13	7	20	40
90.	ID-90	13	7	20	40
91.	ID-91	20	9	29	58
92.	ID-92	13	7	20	40
93.	ID-93	13	9	22	44
94.	ID-94	12	9	21	42
Total					4666

The average score of students can be obtained by using Mean formula as follows:

$$M = \frac{\sum X}{N}$$

$$= \frac{4666}{94}$$

$$M = 49.6$$

So, the average score of students in English sentence building is 46.6. If the score is interpreted using score grade by Arikunto as seen in chapter three, it can be interpreted that average score of students are in poor category.

It is also needed to interpret the score on the table 4.1. by categorizing the score into five level based. The categorizing of students' score can be seen in the following page.

Table 4.2. The Data about Students' Score Categorization

Score	Frequency	Percentage	Categorizing
80 – 100	1	1.07 %	Excellent
66 – 79	11	11.70 %	Good
56 – 65	22	23.40 %	Fair
40 – 55	36	38.30 %	Poor
0 – 39	24	25.53 %	Worse
Total	94	100 %	

From the table above, it can be seen that there were 24 students or 25.53 % who got score 39 points or less, which is being categorized in worse category; there were 36 students or 38.30 % who got score in poor category; there were 22 students or 23.40 % who got score in fair category; there were 11 students or 11.70 % in good category; and there was only one students or 1.07 % who got score 80 points or more that get excellent category.

Since there were 38.30 % of students who got score between 40-55, it can be concluded that students' ability in English sentence building at eleventh grade of MAN 4 Martapura in academic year 2014/2015 is in poor category.

2. Type of Transfer Occurred in English Sentence Building at Eleventh Grade of MAN 4 Martapura in Academic Year 2014/2015

There are two types of grammar transfer that is being the focus of this research: negative transfer and positive transfer. However, most of the focus of this research is about negative transfer since it is

easier to know the interference of negative transfer rather than positive transfer in sentence building. But still, it is possible that positive transfer also occurred during the process of making sentence.

As seen in the Table 4.2, there are about 38.30% of students or 36 students who got score in 40-55 point or poor category. In addition, there are 24 students who got score between 0-39 points. This result showed that students made a lot of mistakes in answering the given test. Since the test was focused on question related to negative transfer, it means that there was a lot of negative transfer that occurred during the test which is caused students making mistakes in answering the question. Thus, it can be concluded that the type of transfer that occurred in English sentence building is mostly negative transfer.

However, there are also students who got score in good and excellent categories. There are 11 students who got score in good category and there is 1 students who got score in excellent category. It means that the question related to the negative transfer did not always occur during answering the question. It is possible that the positive transfer also occurred because students could answer the question correctly. Hence, in many ways, positive transfer also occurred in the process of English sentence building.

Therefore, it can be concluded that the type of transfer that occurred in English sentence building were both negative and positive

transfer. Nevertheless, the transfer that often occurred is negative transfer.

3. The Most Difficult Aspect of English Grammar Influenced by Indonesian Grammar Schemata at Eleventh Grade of MAN 4 Martapura in Academic Year 2014/2015

There were five grammar aspects that are being tested in this research: to be, pronoun, preposition, making question and word order. Each of those grammar aspects has its own difficulties, similarities and differences compared to Indonesian grammar. Each of them was being tested to know what the most difficult aspect of English grammar influenced by Indonesian grammar schemata was. Therefore, to know the answer, it is important to analyze the data that have obtained by the researcher by giving the tests to the students.

There were two types of test which is given to the students: multiple choice tests and translating test. Each of test type is analyzed to know the answer for the problem stated above.

- a. The data about transfer of Indonesian grammar's schemata in multiple choice items.

The following table will present the data about transfer of Indonesian grammar's schemata in multiple choice items.

Table 4.3. The Data about Transfer of Indonesian Grammar's Schemata in Multiple Choice Items

Item Number	Number of students who made error			Total	Percentage
	XI IPA	XI IPS A	XI IPS B		
1.	14	16	19	49	52.12 %
2.	16	11	0	27	28.72 %
3.	4	2	2	8	8.51 %
4.	15	11	13	39	41.48%
5.	23	28	20	71	75.53%
6.	2	5	4	11	11.70 %
7.	2	4	0	6	9.57 %
8.	11	9	6	26	27.65 %
9.	1	0	0	1	1.06 %
10.	26	8	3	37	39.36 %
11.	27	26	6	59	62.76 %
12.	7	21	22	50	53.19 %
13.	9	8	7	24	25.53 %
14.	20	8	13	41	43.61 %
15.	26	23	14	63	67.02 %
16.	11	24	21	56	59.57 %
17.	24	13	16	53	56.38 %
18.	22	23	19	64	68.08 %
19.	15	26	18	59	62.76 %
20.	17	13	7	37	39.36 %
21.	8	14	13	35	37.23 %
22.	19	6	9	34	36.17 %
23.	11	9	15	36	37.23%
24.	19	15	12	46	48.93 %
25.	9	7	15	31	32.97 %

As being described in the table above, it can be seen percentage of each item where students made mistake most was item number 5, in which about 71 students failed to answer the question correctly. Meanwhile, the items that students could answer without any difficulties was item number 9, in which only 1 person made a tiny mistake.

To make it easier, the data are simplified to show only ten items that most students made mistakes in multiple choice items. Below is the table of ten items that most students made errors.

Table 4.4. The Data about Ten Items that Most Students Made Errors in Multiple Choice

No.	Item Number	Number of students	Percentage
1	5	71	75.53 %
2	18	64	68.08 %
3	15	63	67.02 %
4	19	59	62.76 %
5	11	56	59.57 %
6	24	53	56.38 %
7	12	50	53.19 %
8	1	49	52.12 %
9	16	46	48.93 %
10	14	41	43.61 %

In this multiple choice, there were 25 items which were being tested. Each five items represent one particular grammar part that most likely will be influenced by Indonesian grammar schemata that students have. Item number 1 to number 5 tested about to be, item number 6 to 10 tested about pronoun, item number 11 to 15 tested about making question, item number 16 to 20 tested about preposition, and item number 21 to number 25 tested about word order. Therefore, the researcher grouped each five question into one and counted the number of error that students have made to know what part of grammar that most likely influenced by students' schemata about Indonesian grammar. The table in the following page will show the percentage of errors that

students have made, grouped according to grammar aspects that being tested.

Table 4.5. The Number of Errors Grouped According to Grammar Aspects in Multiple Choice

No	Item Number	Aspect	Frequency	Percentage
1	1 – 5	To be	194	41.27 %
2	6 – 10	Pronoun	62	19.57 %
3	11 – 15	Making question	237	50.42 %
4	16 – 20	Preposition	278	59.14 %
5	21 – 25	Word Order	179	38.08 %

From those tables above, it can be seen that about 59.14 % of students made mistakes in question related to preposition.

b. The Data about Transfer of Indonesian Grammar's Schemata in Translating Sentences

Beside choosing the answer in multiple choice questions, students also asked to translate Indonesian sentences into English. In this translation, there were many errors that students have made due to the lack of students' knowledge in English grammar or vocabulary. However, the researcher only focused on five items of grammar that have become the object of this research. Below is the data about transfer of Indonesian grammar's schemata in translating sentences.

Table 4.6. The Data about Transfer of Indonesian Grammar's Schemata in Translating Sentences

Item Number	Number of students who made error			Total	Percentage
	XI IPA	XI IPS A	XI IPS B		
1.	29	15	26	70	74.46 %
2.	12	6	20	38	40.42 %

Table 4.7 (Continued)

3.	2	1	1	4	4.25 %
4.	32	19	25	76	80.85 %
5.	17	30	14	61	64.89 %
6.	30	14	25	69	73.40 %
7.	27	16	25	68	72.34 %
8.	22	8	11	41	43.61 %
9.	7	8	10	25	26.59 %
10.	11	7	16	34	36.17 %
11.	1	0	6	7	7.44 %
12.	32	30	26	88	93.61 %
13.	33	30	26	89	94.68 %
14.	31	23	23	77	81.91 %
15.	14	8	7	29	30.85 %
16.	31	16	26	73	77.65 %
17.	13	12	13	38	40.42 %
18.	19	27	22	68	72.34 %
19.	31	23	25	79	84.04 %
20.	31	25	25	81	86.17 %
21.	15	8	11	34	36.17 %
22.	29	7	24	60	63.82 %
23.	32	24	26	82	87.23 %
24.	21	13	13	47	50 %
25.	12	14	22	38	40.42 %

As seen in the table above, there were many students who made mistakes in translating Indonesian sentences. There were 89 students who made mistake in question number 13. The easiest question was item number 3, in which only 4 students made mistake. But still, the number of mistakes are larger than multiple choice tests.

To make it simple, the table in the following page will show the top ten of items that most students made errors.

Table 4.7. The Data about Ten Items that Most Students Made Errors in Translating Sentences

No.	Item Number	Number of students	Percentage
1	13	89	94.68 %
2	12	88	93.61 %
3	23	82	87.23 %
4	20	81	86.17 %
5	19	79	84.04 %
6	14	77	81.91 %
7	4	76	80.85 %
8	16	73	77.65 %
9	1	70	74.46 %
10	6	69	73.40 %

In the translating sentences tests, each five items also represents one grammar's aspect just like in multiple choice tests as seen in Table 4.8.

Table 4.8. The Number of Errors Grouped According to Grammar Aspects in Translating Sentences

No	Item Number	Aspect	Frequency	Percentage
1	1 – 5	To be	249	52.97 %
2	6 – 10	Pronoun	236	50.21 %
3	11 – 15	Making question	290	61.70
4	16 – 20	Preposition	341	72.55 %
5	21 – 25	Word Order	271	57.65 %

From the table above, it can be seen that about 72.55 % of students made mistake in question related to preposition.

Since each five items in two kind of test represents the same grammar's aspect, the percentage of the two test can also be added together to draw the general conclusion about what the most type of grammar aspect interfered by students Indonesian grammar schemata. The data can be seen in the table in the following page.

Table 4.9. The Number of Errors Grouped According to Grammar Aspects

No	Item Number	Grammar Aspect	Multiple Choice	Translating Sentences	Total
1	1 – 5	To be	41.27 %	52.97 %	47.12 %
2	6 – 10	Pronoun	19.57 %	50.21 %	31.70 %
3	11 – 15	Making question	50.42 %	61.70	56.06 %
4	16 – 20	Preposition	59.14 %	72.55 %	65.85 %
5	21 – 25	Word Order	38.08 %	57.65 %	47.87 %

From the table above, it can be seen that about 65.85 % students made mistakes in preposition related to question, making it the most grammar aspect that being influenced by Indonesian grammar schemata. Making question comes in the second place with percentage 56.06 %, followed by word order, to be and pronoun.

Therefore, it can be concluded that the most grammar aspect influenced by Indonesian grammar schemata is preposition.

B. Discussion

The data about students score has obtained, after all of the obtained data are shown in finding, the researcher would like to discuss all of the matter related to language transfer and answer the statement of problems that have been presented before. All of the obtained data will give some consideration on the research to ease the researcher draw some conclusion about transfer effect.

1. Students' Ability in English Sentence Building at the Eleventh Grade of MAN 4 Martapura in Academic Year 2014/2015

For this research, the researcher wanted to test students' ability in English sentence building. For this purpose, the students were asked to answer two types of questions: multiple choices and translating sentence in which each type of questions consist of 25 items. The researcher purposely just made questions using simple words that students have already knows, because the focus in this research is the students' ability in sentence building, not the ability in vocabulary mastery.

However, after the researches analyzed the data, there were a lot of students who make mistake in sentence building. As it can be seen from table 4.9, there were 24 students who got score between 0-39 points or in worse category, there were 36 students who got score between 40-55 points or in poor category, there were 22 students who got score in 56 – 65 points or fair category, there were 11 students who got score between 67 – 79 points or good category, and there was only 1 students who got score between 80 – 100 points or excellent category.

The average score that the researcher obtained also did not give satisfactory result. After counted students average score using mean formula, it can be concluded that students' average score in English sentence building is only 49.6. If the score are interpreted using score

grade by Arikunto as can be seen in chapter three, it can be interpreted that average score of students are in poor category.

However though, from the score that obtained about students' ability in English sentence building, it can not be concluded yet that the poor students' ability in English sentence is caused by transfer effect of Indonesian grammar schemata those students have had. The poor score can also be obtained because students did not understand well about English grammar itself, or students did not try their best when answer the question, or indeed because some interference of Indonesian language. Therefore, the further discussion in this chapter will discuss about some language transfer that occurred during students' English sentence building.

2. Type of Transfer that Occurs in English Sentence Building at the Eleventh Grade of MAN 4 Martapura in Academic Year 2014/2015

There are two types of transfer that being the focus of the researcher when she conducts the research: negative transfer and positive transfer. Thus, for this research, the researcher tries to analyze the data to obtain whether two types of transfer occurred or not.

a. Negative transfer

Language transfer is identical with interference or negative transfer. So, it is a given that negative transfer occurred in this

research. Table 4.4. and 4.7. have given general description about what type of question that students have made mistake because of negative transfer. The researcher will try to analyze each item to know further in what part negative transfer occurs.

1) *Ahmad tengah sakit.*

This is really a tricky question, so there were a lot of students who made mistake. For this question, students were given two alternative answers: (a) Ahmad is sick; (b) Ahmad middle sick. Unexpectedly, there were 71 students who answer incorrectly. In other word, there were 75.53 % of students who answer (b).

The main problem in this sentence is the word *tengah*. In Indonesian, indeed *tengah* means *middle*. However, *tengah* can also be used to express something that is happening. In other word, *tengah* can be used to replace the word *sedang*. For the sentence '*Ahmad tengah sakit*', the word *tengah* here means something going on in this moment, not about the position of the thing. So, the correct answer for this question is should be (a) Ahmad is sick.

In fact, though, the sentence '*Ahmad tengah sakit*' can also be written as '*Ahmad sedang sakit*'. If the question is changed into *Ahmad sedang sakit* instead of *Ahmad tengah sakit*, there is a possibility that most of students will answer the

question correctly. However, when the word *tengah* is used instead of *sedang*, students' previous knowledge about the meaning of *tengah* in English is getting in the way and making them answer the question incorrectly.

Therefore, for this question, it can be concluded that the process of negative transfer has occurred from students' Indonesian grammar schemata into English sentence building.

2) *Tulislah catatan kecil di bawah halaman buku.*

This question tried to focus to one grammar aspect: preposition. Students were given two alternative options for this question: (a) Write the note at the bottom of the page; and (b) Write the note in the bottom of the page. As expected, most of students answered (b). Only 23 students answer the question correctly by choosing (a).

Until now, the problem related to preposition is still occurred in students' writing. There are a lot of preposition in English, and the way to use them are slightly different to Indonesian preposition. Actually, the researcher only focuses on four types of preposition for this research: on, at in, and by. But still, there are a lot of students who do not understand well how to use those prepositions.

For the question '*Tulislah catatan kecil di bawah halaman buku*', the focus is in the word *di* at *di bawah halaman*

buku. It is a common knowledge for students that the word '*di*' means 'in' in English. Even in the book *Kamus Indonesia-Inggris* by Echols & Shadily (2001, p.143), the first word that is used to translate the word *di* is 'in'. So, it is not a surprised anymore that about 64 students answered the question incorrectly by choosing the option (b) as their answer.

Therefore, the negative transfer also occurred in this question where students' previous knowledge about Indonesian grammar schemata interference in English sentence building process.

3) *Berapa harga sepatu itu?*

This question focuses on making question aspect. There were two alternative answers giving to the students: (a) How much are those shoes?; and (b) How price are those shoes? There were 63 students who answered the question incorrectly by choosing (b) as their answer.

When asking about number or amount of something, there are only two alternative choices that can be used: how many and how much. How many is used to ask about countable noun while how much is used to ask about uncountable noun. Price of something is categorized as uncountable noun, so the correct answer for this question is supposed to be 'How much are those shoes?'.

However, more than half of students were focused on the word *harga*, therefore choose (b) as the answer. Indeed, the word *harga* means *price* in English, but it does not mean the sentence ‘How price are those shoes?’ is the correct translation for the sentence ‘*Berapa harga sepatu itu?*’. It can be seen clearly from this case that negative transfer has occurred, resulting students answered incorrectly for this question.

As a matter of fact, the word *price* also can be used for this sentence if the sentence is modified a little into ‘How much are the price of those shoes?’. Even for this question, the phrase *how much* is still being used instead of *how price*.

4) *Tulislah kalimat ini dengan Bahasa Inggris.*

This question also focuses on preposition aspect. There are two alternative options for this question: (a) Write this sentence in English; and (b) Write this sentence with English. There were only 35 students who answered correctly by choosing option (a). Whereas 62.72 % of students answered incorrectly by choosing option (b).

The main focus on this sentence is the word *dengan*. In Kamus Indonesia-Inggris (Echols & Shadily, 2001, p.138), the first two words that comes up for the translation of the word *dengan* are *with*, *accompanying*. Most of students also know

that the word *dengan* means *with* in English. So without hesitation, about 59 students chosen (b) for their answer.

It can be concluded from this question, the negative transfer also occurred. However though, the researcher tried to imagine another probability. If the question is changed into '*Tulislah kalimat ini dalam Bahasa Inggris*', there is a possibility that most of students will choose (a) as the correct answer in which (a) is indeed a correct answer.

5) *Apakah kau seorang murid?*

This question focuses on making question aspect. There were two alternative answers given to the students: (a) What are you a student?; and (b) Are you a student?. Unexpectedly, 56 students answered the question incorrectly by choosing (a) as their answer.

This is indeed a very tricky question. When students read the word *apakah* or *apa*, what comes first on their mind is the word *what*. Unfortunately though, the word *apakah* and *apa* do not always mean *what* in English. To ask about something, the words *to be* or *do* are also able to be used. Even modal *can* and *should* also can be used. For this question, though, the correct word that should be used is *are* because the subject is noun, a student. This question does not use *what* to express question because this question do not ask about specific answer.

Instead, the question only demands the answer in form of yes or no. That is why to be form is used instead of WH- question form.

Fuller (2004) mentions when learners do not have much idea about structure of second language that they learnt, they tend to use their first language's rule to fill the gap in the second language structure. As seen in students' answers, since they do not have much idea about the answer, they decided to use Indonesian grammar instead. Therefore, the negative transfer is occurred in this question, in which students' Indonesian grammar schemata interferences students' English sentence building.

6) *Taylor Swift adalah penyanyi paling mahal di dunia.*

The main focus on this question is about English word order. The alternative answers for this question were: (a) Taylor swift is the most expensive singer in the world; and (b) Taylor Swift is the singer most expensive in the word. 53 students or 56.38 % of students answer incorrectly by choosing (b) as their answer, indicating that negative transfer has occurred in this sentence building.

Word order is something that does not exist in Indonesian grammar. Indeed, there are some rule about word order in Indonesian, but it is not as specific as English. It does

not matter in Indonesian whether the age, the size, the color or any adjective do not place in chronological as written in English grammar. What being a matter is the noun is placed in the front of adjective, in contrast with English in which the noun is placed later after the adjective.

Word order is one of the case related to language typology. Weinreich (1953) said that if the first and target language somehow has different typology, the negative transfer will happen most likely and give some disadvantages to learners when studying target language. Since word order in English and Indonesian grammar are different, negative transfer is occurred.

Actually, if the students know the simple rule about English word order, in which the noun is placed later after the adjective, then most of students would be able to answer the question correctly. However, because most of students do not know about that, they answered the question incorrectly. In addition, in Indonesian grammar, the noun is placed at the beginning before the adjective, so it is interfered in process of answering the question.

7) *Apakah kau bicara bahasa Inggris?*

This question focuses on making question. There were two alternative answers: (a) What do you speak English?; and

(b) Do you speak English?. About 50 students answered the question incorrectly by choosing (a) as their answer.

This question is similar to question '*Apakah kau seorang murid?*' as the researcher mentioned before. The students just focused on the word *apakah* and make a conclusion that it should use word *what* at the beginning. As a result, 53.19 % of the students made mistakes on answering the question.

This question is a type a question that need yes or no as the answer, so it should not use *what* as the word to express the question. Instead, it is used *do* to express the question because there is verb *speak* that comes later. Some of students did not take it into consideration and failed to answer the question by choosing (b) as their answers. Therefore, negative transfer also occurred in this question and gave disadvantages to students in English sentence building process.

8) *Aku murid.*

This question is focused on students' ability about to be. The alternative answers were: (a) I am a student; and (b) I student. Unexpectedly, 49 students chose (b) as their answer, resulting they answered the question incorrectly.

Actually, this is a very simple question. The researcher did not expect that there were a lot of students who failed to

answer the question because the lesson about to be is the lesson that is given to the students at the beginning of English course. But still, the result did not give satisfying result in which about 52.12 % students answered the question incorrectly.

In Indonesian grammar, there are no to be or whatsoever in sentence building. Thus, the sentence '*Aku murid*' is considered as a good sentence in Indonesian. However, the sentence 'I student' is considered as a wrong or incomplete sentence in English because there is part of sentence that has left out: to be. A good sentence is consist of subject and predicate, and in English, the predicate is usually in form of verb. If there is no verb, then to be is used. The sentence 'I student' should be added to be to make it into a good sentence in grammatical aspect. So, the correct translation for '*Aku murid*' is 'I am a student'.

The process of negative transfer is occurred in this sentence because there is no to be in Indonesian grammar. However, the researcher tries to make another speculation. If the sentence '*Aku adalah murid*' is used instead of '*Aku murid*', the probability of students answered the question correctly is perhaps higher than this one.

9) *Dia tinggal di Jl. A. Yani 48.*

The question focuses on preposition. The alternative answers for this question were: (a) He lives at 48 A. Yani street; and (b) He lives in 48 A Yani street. About 46 students were failed to answer the question by choosing (b) as their answers.

Students who do not know a lot about English preposition are without a doubt will choose (b) as their answer because the word *di* means *in* in English. However though, to show a point is space like street as mentioned in the question, the word *at* is supposed to be used instead of *in*. So, the correct answer is (a) He lives at 48 A. Yani street.

Again, the negative transfer is occurred in this question because for most of the students, the word *di* means simply *in* in English.

10) *Tas siapa di atas meja itu?*

The question focuses on making question. There were two alternative options for this question: (a) Bag who is on the table?; and (b) Whose bag is on the table?. 41 students or 43.61 % students answered incorrectly by choosing (a) as their answers.

In Indonesian grammar, it is not considered wrong if making a question by mentioning the noun first instead of the question word first as can be seen in this question. In English

grammar, however, the question word is supposed to be mention first before the noun. So the correct translation for the sentence '*Tas siapa di atas meja itu?*' is 'Whose bag is on the table?'.

It can be concluded that negative transfer is occurred during translating this question into English because students do not take into consideration that in English grammar, the question word should appear first, different from Indonesian grammar that they have known before.

11) Apakah kemarin kau datang?

For this question and the next nine questions are about translating sentences, so there are no options given to the students. This is the first question in translating Indonesian sentence into English in which students make mistake a lot. Out of 94 students, there were 89 students who make mistakes in answering this question. In other words, about 94.68% of students answered the question incorrectly.

Here are some examples of the incorrect answers that the students have written on the paper test. The sign * or asterisk means that the sentences are incorrect grammatically:

- a) What you came yesterday?*
- b) What you yesterday came?*
- c) What yesterday you came?*

d) Do you came yesterday?*

e) Are you come yesterday?*

From three out of five answers above, the answer (a), (b) and (c), it can be seen that most of students are still used the word *what* to translate Indonesian word *apakah*. They are incorrect answers because the actual sentence did not use *what* as the question word. Instead, it is used to be because they request the answer in form yes or no. So, it can be concluded that negative transfer is occurred during translating this sentence

The option (d) and (e) are also considered as incorrect answer because the students do not use the proper to be form in this question form. The correct answer for this question is supposed to be ‘Did you come yesterday?’, but some students used *do* or *are* instead of *did*. It can not be said firmly they answered the question wrongly because of the interference of Indonesian grammar, since they quite understand the English grammar rule a bit. However, the fact that to be form is not found in Indonesian grammar perhaps should be taking into consideration for causing the wrong answer to the students.

12) *Apakah Taka seorang dokter?*

This question is quite similar with the question number 11. The focus is about making question in which about 88

students answered incorrectly and only 6 people who able to answered the question correctly.

Below are some answers that students written down on their paper test to answer this question:

- a) What Taka a doctor?*
- b) What do Taka a doctor?*
- c) What Taka is someone doctor?*
- d) What Taka a man doctor?*
- e) Do Taka a doctor?*

Almost all of the incorrect answer using the word *what* to translate the word *apakah*. Some students even take the word *seorang* into consideration and translated it into *someone* or *man*. It is obvious from their answer that the negative transfer is occurred in which students' Indonesian grammar schemata interfered in English sentence building.

There were also some students who do not use the word *what* at the beginning of the sentence, but they are still failed to answer the question correctly because they used different form of to be. The correct answer for this question is 'Is Taka a Doctor?', in which only 6 students can give the answer correctly.

13) *Aku tinggal di rumah kecil yang indah.*

This question tried to test students' comprehension on English word order. However, about 82 students answered the question incorrectly. Here are some answers that were given by the students on their paper test:

- a) I live in house small beautiful.*
- b) I live in small house beautiful.*
- c) I live in small beautiful house.*
- d) I live in small house which beautiful.*
- e) I live in house which small beautiful.*

It can be seen from students' answers that they have tried their best to be able to answer the question correctly. However though, because of one tiny mistake, their answer were still considered as wrong answers no matter how close their answers to the correct one are.

In the answer (a), the interference of Indonesian grammar can be seen clearly because the students just translate the word one by one without changing the structure of the sentence. For the answer (b), the students also made mistakes because they only pay closer attention to the word *rumah kecil*, put aside the word *indah*. So, they were able to translate the word *rumah kecil* into *small house*, but just left out the word *indah* or *beautiful* and put it into the last sentence as it is.

Therefore, it can be concluded that negative transfer occurs in answer (a) and (b) explicitly.

However, the answer (c) is the answers in which students have already know more about English grammar, but still failed to answer the question correctly. The correct answer is supposed to be 'I live in a beautiful small house' since the explanation about size comes after the description of the noun. But then, since the word *small* comes before the word *beautiful*, it is still considered as wrong answer in English grammar.

Some students gave unexpected answers as can be seen in answer (d) and (e). Instead of paying close attention to English word order, they just translated the word one by one, including the word *yang*. The researcher did not expect the students would give such answers, so it is very regrettable that they make tiny mistakes in answering the question.

For answer (d), the right answer is supposed to be 'I live in small house which is beautiful' and for the answer (e), the correct answer should be 'I live in a house which is small and beautiful'. But still, the researcher appreciated students' answer and did not consider them as the negative transfer in sentence building.

14) *Hana bertemu dengannya di bandara.*

The question focuses on the use of preposition. 81 out of 94 students answered the question incorrectly. Surprisingly, the cause of their mistake is almost the same, that is using the word *in* or *on* instead of *at* for translation the word *di* as can be seen in sentence below:

- a) Hana meets her in airport.*
- b) Hana meet her on airport.*

The use of *in*, *at* and *on* are really confusing almost for all students who study English in the school, so it is a given that the students answered the question incorrectly because they do not comprehend the use of them wholeheartedly.

For the answer (a), it is obvious that Indonesian grammar schemata interference in students answer, resulting negative transfer in English sentence building. Indeed, the word *di* is usually translated into *in* in English, so most of students answer the question using the word *in*. The rest of the students however, seems to know that the word *in* is not the correct answer and used the word *on* instead, in which still considered as wrong answer in English grammar.

The correct answer for this question is 'Hana meets her at the airport', and only 13 students who answered the question correctly. While 86.17 % of students answered the question

incorrectly because of the interference of Indonesian grammar or because they simply did not know the correct answer and answered the question incorrectly.

15) *Kami berangkat ke sekolah dengan bus.*

This question also focuses on the use of preposition. More than half of the students or about 79 students answered the question incorrectly, indicating that the negative transfer has occurred during answering the question.

Almost all of the students who answered the question incorrectly gave the same answer, as can be seen below:

(a) We go to the school with bus.*

The correct answer for this question is supposed to be 'We go to the school by bus'. However, instead of *by*, about 84.04% of the students used the word *with* as the translation of the word *dengan*. Indeed, the word *dengan* can be translated into *with* in English. However, for the context in the sentence '*Kami berangkat ke sekolah dengan bus*', the translation of the word *dengan* is supposed to be *by*.

It can be seen clearly in this question that students' Indonesian grammar schemata got in the way in students' English sentence building process, resulting negative transfer that made students answered the question incorrectly.

16) *Apakah kau bisa bermain catur?*

The focus of this question is about making question form. Unfortunately, about 77 students failed the answer the question correctly and gave the incorrect answer in their paper tests. Below are some examples of the answer that students have written in their paper sheets:

- a) What do you can playing the chess?*
- b) What you can playing the chess?*
- c) What do you can to play the chess?*
- d) What do you play the chess?*
- e) Are you can playing chess?*

The main problem in answering the question was almost all of the students used the word *what* at the beginning of the sentence to express the question form. However, this type of question requests an answer in form yes or no, so the word *what* is not supposed to be used here.

There were also students who answered the question as can be seen in answer (e). However, the answer is still considered as a wrong answer because in making question, the word *are* and *can* cannot be used at the same time in one sentence. The correct answer for this question is ‘Can you play the chess?’, in which only 20 students who were able to answer the question correctly.

Therefore, it can be concluded that the negative transfer are also occurred in process of answering this question because 81.91% of students unable to answer the question correctly and tended to use the word *what* to translate the word *apakah*. Anyhow, the researcher tries to make assumption related to this question. If the question '*Bisakah kau bermain catur?*' was used instead of '*Apakah kau bisa bermain catur?*', there is a possibility that most of the students can answer the question correctly. But still, this assumption also means that how students' Indonesian grammar schemata really interferences in students' English sentence building. By just changing the word order of the sentence giving a very big impact to the students answer, even though the answer is still the same.

17) *Ali ada di dalam kelas.*

This question focuses on the use of *to be* in English sentence. However, there were 76 students who unable to answered the question correctly. Below are the examples of the answers that students wrote down on their paper tests:

- a) Ali there in class.*
- b) Ali in the classroom.*

For the answer (a), it is obvious that students just translating the question word by word, without even giving any consideration about *to be*. Therefore, it can be seen from the

answer (a) that the negative transfer is occurred because students just translate the word *ada* into *there* in English.

There is only a tiny mistake is answer (b), that is the students forgot to put *to be* after the subject *Ali*. Poulisse and Bongaerts (1994) explained more that learner who has low target language proficiency, usually will be more focused on content words in process of making proper sentence, caused less focused on function words which leads to more errors on using them. For this question, students only focused on content word rather than function word. Therefore, they forgot to put *to be* after subject.

It cannot be said clearly that the mistake is caused by Indonesian interpretation in English writing. But still, the fact that there is *no to be* in Indonesian grammar indeed gives influence in the way students translating Indonesian sentence into English sentence as can be seen at the sentence in question.

18) *Sampai jumpa di hari Jumat.*

The focus in this question is about the use of preposition. 73 out of 94 students answered the students incorrectly because they do not know what preposition that should be used in this sentence. Below are the examples of the answers that students have written down on the paper sheets:

a) See you in Friday.*

- b) See you at Friday.*
- c) Good bye in Friday.*
- d) Good bye at Friday.*

In the answer (a), students simply translated the word *di* into *in* because the basic translation of *di* is *in* in English. For answer (b), students tried to speculated by choosing another preposition besides *in*. However, they still answered incorrectly because the correct translation for this sentence is ‘See you on Friday’. The preposition *on* is used on a specific day of the week, including Friday. Therefore, it can be concluded that the negative effect is occurred in answer (a) because students did not give much attention to the word *di* and simply translated it into *in*. In answer (b), students have tried their best to find the right answer but still ended up failed to answer the question correctly.

The answer (c) and (d) are rather unique than two other answers because students used the phrase ‘Good bye’ instead of ‘See you’. Indeed, ‘*Sampai jumpa*’ can be translated into ‘Good bye’ in English. However, the use of the phrase ‘Good Bye’ in this context is unsuitable. Especially if the phrase ‘*Sampai jumpa*’ is followed by the name of day or time, the expression ‘See you’ is generally used than ‘Good bye’. From this point of view, it can not be assumed explicitly that Indonesian grammar

schemata are taking part in interference students' English sentence building. But still, since the phrase 'Good Bye' is generally known as the English version of the expression '*Sampai Jumpa*', it can also be said that students' schemata about those expressions got in the way and interfered their English sentence building.

19) *Kau dan aku adalah sahabat.*

The main focus in this question is about the use of *to be*. Surprisingly though, for this simple sentence, there were 70 students who made mistakes, resulting about 74.46% of the students answered the question incorrectly.

Below are the examples of the answers that students have given for this question:

- a) You and I is friends.*
- b) You and me is friends.*

Most of the students failed to use the correct *to be* in this sentence. Instead of using *are*, they used *is* for the predicate of the subject 'You and I'. Some students even wrote 'You and me' as the subject instead of 'You and I' whereas the phrase 'You and me' is supposed to be used as the object. The correct answer for this question is 'You and I are friends', in which only 24 students were able to answer the question correctly.

The fact that most of students could not use the proper to be in this sentence did not directly mean that there is negative transfer that occurred during making this sentence. However, the fact that there is no to be in Indonesian grammar should be take into account for causing students having mistakes in making sentences that request a proper to be.

20) *Aku melakukannya sendiri.*

This question focuses to test students knowledge about English pronoun. There were 69 students who unable to answer the question correctly, resulting only 26.6% of the students who able to answer the question without fail.

Here are the example of some answers that students have written down on paper tests:

- a) I do self.*
- b) I do by self.*
- c) I carry out self.*

The correct answer for this question is supposed to be ‘I do it by myself’, but most of student made mistake in choosing the correct translation for the word *sendiri*. Some students took the stem for the word *sendiri*, that is *diri*, and translated it into English resulting the word *self*. But still, *self* is not the same with the word *myself*, so that students ended up answering the question incorrectly.

However, it cannot be said daringly that the cause of error in answering this question is because the negative transfer from Indonesian grammar into English sentence making. As a note, in Indonesian grammar, there is also topic about pronoun, but is not as specific as English grammar. Some parts are different, including what being called as reflexive pronoun in English. In Indonesia, the reflexive pronoun is simply represented by the word *sendiri* as can be seen in the sentence in question. So, implicitly, it can be said that the difference of Indonesian & English grammars also have rule in causing error in answering this question.

The phenomenon of negative transfer that occurred in this research is in accordance to Lado's statement (1960). He states that if the languages are different, then there would be negative transfer because learners would have difficulty in producing the target language for their previous knowledge about a certain language. Gas & Selinker (2001, p. 96), also say that native language without a doubt effects the target language and will become the source of error in production or reception of language. English and Indonesian grammar are quite different, so it is a given that negative transfer occurred in this case.

Almost in all of the questions, students made mistakes. However, those 20 test items above are enough to prove that

negative transfer is indeed occurred in process of English sentence building. Students' schemata about Indonesian grammar got in the way and interfered when students translating Indonesian sentence into English, resulting some errors and mistakes in making English sentences.

b. Positive Transfer

It is true that some reseachers do not pay attention too much about positive transfer because it does not give direct effect in language processing. But still, positive transfer is an interesting topic, hence the researcher will try to analyze some positive transfer that found in the process of English sentence building in the test that has given to the students.

1) Sentence pattern

Indonesian and English grammar have the same sentence pattern, in which consists of subject and predicate. When making sentence, almost all of the students do not forget to put the subject and the predicate in their sentence, indicating that the Indonesian sentence pattern gives positive transfer in English sentence building. Indeed, some students forgot to put to be in the sentences that require to be. However, for the sentence that consist of noun and direct verb as the subject and predicate, students are able to make a good sentence without a fail, as can be seen in the examples in the following page:

- a. *They need* our help.
- b. *I will finish* my work at teen.
- c. *We went* to school by bus.
- d. *Hana meet* him in airport*.
- e. *Lily faces* to important problems.

There are some students who forget to put –s or –es at the end of verb if the subject is singular form, but mostly they do not find any difficulties in making sentence related to subject and predicate. Therefore, it can be concluded that some aspect of Indonesian grammar indeed gives positive transfer in English sentence building, in this case subject and predicate pattern.

2) Translating sentences: *Aku melakukannya sendiri*

The researcher found some interesting translation for the sentence '*Aku melakukannya sendiri*' that has been written down by the students. At first, the researcher expected that the right answer should be 'I do it by myself'. However, there are some smart students who answered the question using their own logical reasoning and write their own unique answer. Instead of answering 'I do it by myself', they answered 'I do it alone.'

In English, the sentence 'I do it alone' is considered as the good sentence. It is also not incorrect translation for the sentence '*Aku melakukannya sendiri*'. Indeed, when making

this question, the grammar aspect that the researcher wanted to test is about pronoun. However, since the students do not know that matter, they simply translated the word *sendiri* into *alone*. What a splendid job they have.

It is true that *sendiri* in English means *alone*, so there is nothing wrong with the sentence that the students have made. Here the researcher concluded that there is a process of positive transfer occurred in translating this sentence. Even though the students simply translated the sentence word by word, including the word *sendiri*, it is not considered as incorrect method as long as the answer is right, as can be seen in this example.

3) Translating sentence: *Apakah kau bisa bermain catur?*

The translation for this sentence is supposed to be ‘Can you play the chess?’. However, just like the case of sentence ‘*Aku melakukannya sendiri*’, some students translated the sentence word by word, and got another correct translation: ‘Are you able to play the chess?’

The English translation for the word *bisa* is *can* or *be able to*, both of them are considered as the correct one. However, the way to use them are slightly different. When making sentence, *can* can be used directly at the beginning of the sentence. Meanwhile, the word *able* cannot be used directly

at the beginning. Instead, it is placed after the noun, and to be is placed at the beginning of the sentence in agreement with the noun.

Some straight students who translated the sentence word-by-word got the correct answer, but it does not mean that it was pure a luck. Technically, the pattern of this sentence is the same between Indonesian and English. Therefore, it can be said that in this sentence there is also positive transfer that occurred, resulting students were able to answer the question correctly without thinking too much about turn-over the sentence pattern.

Richard and Schmidt' statement (2010) about positive transfer is really occurred in this study. They said that similarities between first language and target language will make positive transfer comes into existence. Some similarities between Indonesian and English grammar come in handy when students were asked answer some questions related to transfer. Eventhough the number is small, the existence of positive transfer indeed give good results for language study.

Positive transfer appears relative little compared to positive transfer. However, it has become human instinct to more focus one something negative over something positive. What appears different or giving bad effect tend to draw more attention than

something that appears the same and does not give any effect. It is also the case in language transfer. For this research, the researcher only explain a little about positive transfer but explain quite a lot about negative transfer. However, it must be noted that actually there are a lot of positive transfer that occurred in language processing, including this research. The researcher just named a few based on the research that the researcher conducted. In another research, without a doubt, there will be many positive transfers that are occurred and give significant contribution in learning foreign language.

c. The Most Difficult Aspect of English Grammar Influenced by Indonesian Grammar Schemata at the Eleventh Grade of MAN 4 Martapura in Academic Year 2014/2015

For this research, there are five English grammar aspects that the researcher took into account as the material of the test. They are to be, pronoun, making question, preposition and word order. There were total 50 items in test, 25 multiple choice and 25 translating sentence. Each 5 items in multiple choice and translating sentence represents one grammar aspect. So in total, each one grammar aspect have 10 questions that the students had to answer correctly.

The researcher has counted the result of the test, including in what items were the students made the mistakes the most. The researcher grouped the items based on the grammar aspect that has been tested, and got a result as can be seen in table 4.5., 4.8. and 4.9.

From the table, it can be seen that the most difficult aspect of English sentence which influenced by Indonesian grammar schemata is preposition. In multiple choice items, about 59.14% of students making mistakes related to preposition. Meanwhile, in translating sentence, almost a third of the number of the students, about 72.55 % having difficulties in using the correct preposition.

The preposition in English and Indonesian are indeed quite different. Compare to Indonesian, English preposition is more complex and a lot. For the simple Indonesian preposition like *di*, it has many kinds of English preposition depend on what situation or what word that comes after it. *Di* can be translated into in, at, by, on, etc based on the context. That is why most of students found that English preposition are very tricky and they have difficulty to deal with them. If they tried to not care too much about the preposition and simply translated the word *di* into *in*, the most common preposition in English, the result will not as good as they thought. Here the negative transfer occurred between Indonesian

grammar schemata into student' English sentence building, resulting error and mistakes in making good sentences.

Respectively after preposition, the ranking of the most difficult grammar aspect in English sentence building are making question, word order, to be and pronoun. However, the most difficult aspect is still about preposition. Therefore, it can be concluded that most difficult aspect of English sentence which is influenced by Indonesian grammar schemata at eleventh grade of MAN 4 Martapura in academic year 2014/2015 is preposition.